



**RESEARCH PAPER**

**Political Economy of Tourism: A Case Study of Golden Ring Countries**

<sup>1</sup>Ehtaisham Ahmed Khan\*, <sup>2</sup>Muhammad Shahab Ud Din and <sup>3</sup> Dr. Waqar Ilahi

1. Visiting Lecturer, School of Integrated Social Sciences, University of Lahore, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan
2. Lecturer, Department of History and Politics, University of Haripur, Haripur, KPK. Pakistan
3. Visiting Lecturer, Department of Politics and IR, University of Central Punjab, Lahore Punjab, Pakistan

\*Corresponding Author: ehtaisham.850@gmail.com

**ABSTRACT**

The study evaluates political economy of tourism of Golden ring countries. It explores tourism policies of "Golden Ring Countries" and examines the influence of these policies on their economic development. Tourism policy of the following golden ring countries has been studied: China, Pakistan, Russia, Turkey and Iran. Tourism as an industry rapidly mushroomed and became a key player in economic development across the globe. Increasing tourism flows can offer favorable economic results to countries, by directly increasing Gross National Product (GDP) and employment. This implies that tourism acts as a catalyst for economic growth. The study of tourism can significantly benefit from a political economy approach. Political economy reflects the political dimension of policy-making and how political scenario influences societal choices. The study adopted a qualitative approach in which available literature have been studied to reach a conclusion. Various government documents, reports of different organizations have been studied to reach a conclusion. The findings of the study illustrate that economic growth is significantly driven by tourism. Another finding is that revenue generated from tourism leads to economic growth. This study recommends that legislators should concentrate on policies that focus on promoting tourism because of its huge potential across the region.

**KEYWORDS** Economy, Industry, Policy, Tourism

**Introduction**

Political economy reflects the political dimension of policy-making and how political scenario influences societal choices. It enables to comprehend the systems and social links that make up societies in order to initiate social change towards a more democratic and inclusive set-up (Mosedale, 2010). The study of tourism and government policies can also significantly benefit from a political economy approach (Bramwell, 2011). This approach assumes that the government plays a significant role in tourism management and promotion (Wang & Bramwell, 2012). The government is the primary player in the political system of tourism (Bramwell, 2011), and it has traditionally taken a more interventionist position in this industry as compared to others (Ruhanen, 2013). Government intervenes in tourism for political, economic, and environmental reasons (Nyaupane & Timothy, 2010) through institutional ministries, other entities, laws, and numerous funding initiatives and programs (Elliot, 1997 as cited in Nunkoo & Smith, 2013). As per Hall (2005), every State has seven major responsibilities regarding tourism, namely: planning, coordination, entrepreneurship, law and regulation, social tourism, stimulation, and public interest protection. Government intervention in tourism has traditionally been motivated by economic considerations (Bramwell, 1994). Later, states' involvement in the industry expanded beyond economic concerns to resolve the environmental and social repercussions of development owing to the negative impacts of tourism and local inhabitants' unwillingness to embrace development. In the 1980s, the concept of sustainable development gained traction,

prompting governments to take on more roles and responsibilities in tourism planning (Ruhanen, 2013). Thus nowadays, to garner political support for the tourism sector, governments are increasingly attempting to strike a balance among tourism development, economic goals, and the environment. (Bramwell, 2011). The idea of the Golden Ring countries portrays one of the best potential, trading routes of the world, which forms an amazing ring on the world map, it can prove to be the "Economic Ring of the World" if it is implemented in its true spirit. The purpose of this paper is to analyze the tourism potential among Golden Ring Economies using this route. The study adopts a qualitative secondary approach. By elaborating tourism policies of these countries and discussing the OECD trade policy; this paper attempts to highlight the need for a combined trade policy for the Golden Ring economies. The paper also throws light on the potential challenges and gives recommendations.

### **Literature Review**

A study conducted by Adnan Hye and Rana Ejaz Ali Khan analyzed relationship between income from tourism and economic growth of Pakistan in their article *Tourism-led growth hypothesis: A case study of Pakistan* (2012). They have collected data from 1971–2008. The findings of their study shows explain that revenue generated from tourism has led to economic growth in Pakistan except in the years 2006, 2007, and 2008. In an earlier study Baum & O'Gorman, (2010), explain that type of government influences tourism in Iran. Both Islamic traditionalist and Islamic liberalists have strong effects on tourism policies. The study further reveals that in Iran politics and religion are inseparable, with the priority of religion over politics. This is also shown in the UNESCO list where cultural heritage is being reshaped according to religious and political ideology. There are other number of studies available which show relationship between tourism and economic growth. For example, Samina Khalil, Mehmmod Khan Kakar and Waliullah (2007) argue that tourism serves as an impetus for economic growth. According to them, it not only creates economic opportunities but also increases foreign exchange reserves, which is essential for trade with other states. They also find that major economies are giving primary importance to tourism due to globalization which has made the entire world an integrated whole. In another study related to relationship between tourism and economic growth, Tang, Selvanathan & Selvanathan (2007) explain causal relationship between tourism and economic growth by applying Granger causality test. They also point out that foreign direct investment in tourism industry has contributed to economic growth in china. In a more recent study, N.G Raad, (2019), highlights barriers to tourism industry in in Iran. The study points out that Iran is not reaping benefits from its socio-cultural sites according to its potential. The study also gives recommendation to overcome these hindrances.

### **Material and Methods**

To fully understand tourism approach of golden ring countries in the context of political economy, qualitative research has been carried out. The case study design investigates different policies and approaches of five golden ring countries: China, Pakistan, Russia, Iran and Turkey. In addition, various government documents, reports of different organizations have also been studied to reach a conclusion.

### **Tourism Approach of Golden Ring Countries**

Following five states are included in Golden Ring Countries: China, Iran, Pakistan, Russia and Turkey. Tourism approach of these states has been described below.

## **China**

The Chinese tourism industry has set foot into a brand-new period since 2012. As an all-inclusive industry, it has introduced effective reforms in the tourism sector, improve the quality of tourism expansion, and promote coordinated social and economic development.

### **Aspect of Tourism Policy**

The "Outline for the Development of Tourism Quality (2013–2020)", propagated in 2012, was introduced with the aim to cultivate the tourism industry in line with the modern service industry. The concept of "all-for-one" was formally proposed in 2015 which changed the direction of development of the Chinese tourism industry, suggesting that the integration of tourism with other industries and their combined growth is incumbent in the present era. Following are its major aspects.

### **Industrial Change Factors**

Tourism has emerged as one of the prime drivers of the economic growth of China since the 18th National Congress of the Communist Party of China. With the rise in popularity of new tourist spots, tourists have not only registered their aspirations to visit more tourist destinations, but also putting forward a demand for better tourism services, like content richness, convenience, and innovation. With an aim to provide a better tourism experience, tourism organizers keep on introducing innovations: provision of comprehensive tourism services online by the tourism companies; health-preserving tourism; creation of convenient tour procedures; research-study tourism; building of smart attractions to improve tourism experience; launch of cultural tourism etc.

### **Pillar of Economy**

Given such integration of tourism with almost every other industry, it has been recognized as a "pillar industry" of China's economy. It is mainly because tourism not only generates enough revenues but also triggers the growth of the elements that are fused with tourism, for 10.94 trillion Yuan, 2.61 trillion PPP US dollars, to her GDP, amounting to around 11.05% of total GDP of China<sup>7</sup>. It is worth noting that the contribution rate of developed states ranges between 5–9%. Similarly, the tourism industry has also generated many jobs. In 2019, around 28.25 million and 51.62 million people were directly and indirectly employed by tourism, respectively. Both direct and indirect jobs made up about 10.31% of the overall employment rate in the country.

## **Pakistan**

Pakistan's unparalleled cuisine, exceptional beauty, hospitality, and rich culture, make it suitable for tourism development. In recent years, the Pakistani government has recognized the significance of the tourism sector and has focused on its development (Mushtaq, et. al 2017). To boost tourism in Pakistan, the "Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf" (2018-2022) government took various steps, notably, modified tourism policies, tourism portals, development and maintenance of infrastructure, and smart telecommunication. Owing to these efforts, the International organizations ranked Pakistan as the top tourist destination in the world in 2020. ("An overview of National Tourism", 2021)

### **Manifesto of PTI Government**

PTI claimed in its election manifesto that it will present Pakistan as "Asia's Best Kept Secret" in the world's tourism industry. The party promoted its agenda by emphasizing religious tourism, historic Sufi sites, and promised to establish twenty new tourist sites during its tenure. The government made tourism promotion one of its top priorities;

recognizing that it has a significant role to play in job creation and would enable them to meet their commitment of generating 10 million jobs during their 5-year term while also generating much-needed revenue for the national budget. The administration promised to support private sector investments in eco-tourism, open government guest houses and other government offices to the public, modernize tourism infrastructure, promote job creation, and improve visa issuance facilities.

### **PTDC and Tourism Policy**

The PTI government assigned the task to the "Pakistan Tourism Development Corporation" (PTDC) to maximize the tourism industry's capacity through various tactics. The PTDC developed a ten-year National Tourism Strategy (NTS) for the years 2020-2030 to pull the tourism sector out of its misery. NTS emphasizes on maximizing resource use in order to achieve long-term economic development. ("An overview of National Tourism", 2021). It also revolves around the following areas: creating employment opportunities and eradicating poverty; ensuring tourists' security and safety; healthcare facilities; hygienic environment and food; good telecommunication services; renovation of the transportation system and roads and value shopping.

### **Russia**

Owing to the fact that Russia has a rapidly growing market and is the world's largest country, encompassing two continents, it is considered a potential market for the tourism and travel sector. Unlike Brazil, Greece, South Africa, Israel, Russia does not have a specific tourism ministry. Thus, the issue of tourism could not be resolved in Russia for a long period after the dissolution of the USSR, as it was linked to sports management (Goskomsport of the Russian Federation) and then to culture (Ministry of Culture of the Russian Federation).

### **Tourism policy and the Action Plan**

The Ministry of Economic Development and the Federal Agency for Tourism in Russia are primarily responsible for the development of domestic and international tourism. Their goal is to achieve this through fostering the development and commercialization of high-quality tourist products which are viable in local as well as international markets. The following were Russia's tourism goals and priorities, as stated in the Tourism Development Strategy and Action Plan for the period up to 2020: (OECD, 2021).

- Develop tourist infrastructure,
- Create a competitive tourist product,
- Develop sustainable demand and increase the availability of tourist products,
- Plan the development of tourist areas,
- Stimulate demand for tourist products,
- Develop new digital solutions,
- Facilitate visa regimes,
- Ensure greater tourism security.

### **Tourism and Economy**

Tourism added a share of RUB 3.2 trillion to the economic growth in 2017, accounting for 3.8 percent of Russian GVA, 21.4 percent high as compared to 2016. In 2017, Russia's tourist industry hired 540500 employees. International tourist visits totaled 24.6 million in 2018, an increase of 0.7 percent over 2017.. In addition to traditional tourism, new types, such as more innovative, personalized, and experience-based offerings, started to grow in Russia (OECD, 2021). But just like the rest of the world, tourism drastically declined in Russia after the pandemic. In 2020, due to the COVID-19 epidemic, Russia closed its borders to many countries, resulting in only 6.4 million international tourists.

## **Turkey**

Turkey established "the Turkey Tourism, Promotion, and Development Agency" to enhance the capacity of its tourism industry in August 2019. The state promises to develop a sustainable, inclusive, and competitive tourism industry and hence outlines its tourism policy accordingly. The current policy aims to diversify from the mass tourism "sun and sea" product through the development of a high-quality tourism niche. Further, the government remains committed to extending the tourism season, disseminating tourism benefits regionally, and ensuring accessibility of tourism services to all tourists.

### **Policy Defining Elements**

In the 9th development plan, Turkey set the goal of development of a master plan for the tourism industry, hence, in accordance with the goal, "Turkey's Tourism Strategy 2023" plan and "Action Plan 2013" were drafted in 2007 to serve as guiding torch for the sector. The plans developed the short, medium, and long-term strategies while considering major impediments, definitions, and solutions of the problems and determined the roles of the concerned institutions.

### **Tourism as a GDP Generator**

In 2018, the industry directly employed 2.2 million people, accounting for 7.7% of overall employment. The total tourism income constituted 3.8% of GDP. Similarly, in the same year, travel exports represented 51.9% of overall service exports. The industry has generated TRY 142.4 billion by attracting around 45.8 million tourists in 2018, demonstrating a rise of 12% compared with the revenues of the previous year. Apart from International tourism, domestic tourism is also on the rise in Turkey. According to statistics, 126.4 million domestic trips were recorded in 2018, 4.6% high as compared to the data of 2017. Thus, through domestic and international trips and job creations tourism industry is contributing to the economic sustainability of Turkey (OECD, 2020).

## **Iran**

Iran is among one of the oldest civilizations in the world. Although it occupies a unique position on the world tourism map yet there are many obstacles in the way of tourism development similar to other developing states. Out of numerous hurdles and challenges for the development of tourism most effective is the political economy of the country. However, despite all these challenges Iran has given 20 year perspective for tourism, according to this plan, Iran's share of the global tourism must increase from 0.09 percent in 2004 to 1.5 percent in 2025 ( about 20 million tourists) (Heidari chianeh, Rezatab, Soltani, & Motamedimehr, 2013).

### **Policy Character**

For the growth and better future of the country's tourism industry, Iran has actively formulated policies in the arena of foreign relations and nuclear technology. As mentioned before it has also given tourism plan and the few most significant programs for tourism development include these: Modification of the present laws and regulations, provision of grants of \$ 25 billion for about 1300 programs, availability of electronic visas, extending the time period of airport visa from 15 to 30 days, training 16000 people working in the tourism industry as a part of human resource development, development of international facilities and hotels and creation of residential centers, creating tourism information service in 11 high potential states, developing domestic tourism, increasing the religious tourism, developing the transportation services ( marine, land, rail, and air) and assisting private entities who carry out tourism-related activities across the world (Raad, 2019).

## **Prospects for Economic Development**

According to the 2025 Tourism Vision Plan, it is aimed the number of tourists should increase from 4.8 million in 2014 to 20 million in 2025. The data of the Iranian year starting from March 2019 shows the arrival of 8 million tourists in the country during the first ten months. So it can be expected that the future of the tourism industry of Iran is broad. By 2025 it will be among the important tourist destination in the world. Under the vision of 2025, not only 25 million tourists but 4 million direct and indirect jobs and \$ 36 billion tourist receipts are also targeted. This is the reason why Iran is being transformed into a sustainable and competitive destination by the Regional Strategic Program for revitalizing the country's economy by 2025 (Habibi, Rahmati, & Karimi, 2018).

Since tourism impacts banking & finance, cultural and entertainment, promotion and publicity services, food & beverage, hotels and lodging, and transportation so the contribution of tourism in job creation is slightly more. This sector has increased the physical capital investment of the country (hotels, rails, airports, etc) and also brought foreign revenue for the country. However, there is still a long way to go and Iran needs to overcome its infrastructure inadequacies and environmental-based tourist limitation for overcoming the negative effects of tourism.

## **Organization of Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) Tourism Policy and Prospects of Policy Development for Golden Ring Countries**

While OECD countries are experiencing positive growth trends in their multiple coordinated sectors, the states are persistently drafting tourism policies that seek to bring maximum social, environmental, and economic benefits to the member states and can cushion the economies when this economic growth anticipate down growth. Thus, the tourism policy measures are incumbent to stay well-prepared for such concerns. For instance, efforts have been made to tackle overcrowding at most attractive and in-demand places, dissemination of economic benefits and other facilities at the destinations that welcome fewer tourists, the introduction of new products to extend the tourism season and to trigger increased productivity, efficient resource use, and a stable employment market. To gauge the impact of these policies, states are building up coordination and enforcement mechanisms, improving management practices at destinations, reinforcing digital solutions, modernizing regulations, integrating civil society for reforming the industry, and involving the private sector in policy drafting.

## **Tourism trends in OECD Countries**

After consistently growing for six decades, tourism is one of the world's highly significant economic fields. It is a vital part of evolving service economy, bringing foreign revenues and income, increasing regional development, creating jobs, and helping local communities. Tourism imports have major economic significance and have a large influence on the domestic economy as compared to other export entities. In OECD countries, for single USD spent by foreign tourists about 89 cents of domestic value-added goods is generated as compared to 81 cents of total export. Internationally, tourism consistently performed better than long term growth predictions, with the arrival of whooping 1.5 billion tourists in 2019. Since 2014, tourism increase in OECD countries has surpassed the world average followed by a period of tremendous growth in current years. OECD makes global top tourist countries and has a share of more than half of travel receipts (61.1%) and global arrivals (56.9%). In the majority of OECD countries, domestic tourism is the main part of the tourism sector in addition to international tourism. Estimated locals make up 75 percent of tourism expenditure

## **Key Policy Elements**

According to OECD, the following well framed and integrated tourism policies should be implemented:

- Developing forward-looking and rational outlook for designing tourism programs and policies, backed by flexible methods of application and long term schemes.
- These tourism businesses should be well trained for tackling future digitization. Digital transformation of tourism should be actively championed by encouraging a digital thinking process, consolidating the ability of small and medium enterprises (SMEs) to take part in digital ecosystems, and revolutionizing regulatory frameworks.
- Promoting the adoption of the latest technologies, innovative ideas, and skills and investing in them. Help present tourism SMEs in gaining the benefits of digitization and promoting the creation of smart tourist destinations.
- Create digitally advanced value chains, business models, and ecosystems by adopting data analytics and more new technologies, expanding reachable digital tools, infrastructure, and solutions, and optimizing business practices.
- Designing tourism policies based upon sustainable development and giving attention to socio-cultural and environmental aspects of sustainability. This will contribute to the achievement of SDGs, curb climate change and give benefit to local communities.
- Further efforts to promote sustainability in industry strategies and tourism policies and to support the goal of low emissions, transition to green and climate friendly tourism industry.
- Make relevant and timely data access to ensure informed policy making and better planning in accordance with scale and type of tourism growth suitable for a particular destination.

### **Current Challenges to Tourism Industries of these Countries**

Despite being rich in natural resources and recent pro-active tourism policies, the Golden ring States also face a number of challenges in the way of formulating a coordinated, and rational policy. Here we have pointed out some of the major challenges:

#### **International Sanction on Iran**

Nuclear sanctions on Iran have caused severe implications on international tourism in Iran. Morakabati (2011) argued that Iran's nuclear program and the associated sanctions have acted as deterrent to international tourists as the sanctions have significantly dropped requests for their visas. (Morakabati, 2011). Morakabati's idea is confirmed by Baum and O'Gorman (2010) who observed that uncertain nuclear arms have decreased the attractiveness of Iran as a destination and has negatively affected tourism (Baum & O'Gorman, 2010). In fact, political problems and sanctions are some of the major reasons that Iran has never been able to attract enough tourists (Farahani & Shabani, 2014). Hassan Rohani, the former president of Iran, stated that following the sanctions the number of tourists in Iran dropped as the sanctions created problems of using International Monetary Credit Cards and ATM cards for international tourists in Iran (Nome, 2013). Given these conditions, it will be difficult to implement any coordinated policy in Iran which could eventually affect the desired results.

#### **Security Implications**

Afghanistan is considered the hub of terrorism activities which have given birth to security challenges in the entire region. Richter (1980) argues that terrorists majorly attack international terrorists considering them "ambassadors" of "hostile government" (L. Richter, 1980). In this regard, tourists are perceived as a political tool for the accomplishment of strategic objectives. Additionally, by attacking the tourism industry, terrorists not only mutilate a successful economic sector but also receive high mass media coverage (L. K.

Richter & Waugh Jr, 1986). Moreover, Pakistan has remained a party to its war against terrorism; thus it has been facing serious consequences. According to a study, which analyzed the data from 1980-2010, terrorism has negatively affected Pakistan's tourism industry both in the short and long run and anticipated similar effects if security conditions continue (Raza & Jawaid, 2013). Similarly, Drakos and Kutan (2003) analyzed the data of a decade (1991-2000) of Turkey, Israel, and Greece and found that terrorism incurred negative impact on their tourism, with the loss of around 5%, 1%, and 9% for Turkey, Israel, and Greece, respectively (Drakos & Kutan, 2003).

### **Political Instability**

It's a fact that tourism and politics are not related to each other through political parties or elections (Hall, 1996) neither does politics extend any direct impact tourism policy, although it acts as an element of the politics of tourism (L. K. Richter, 1989). Literature has been found to be scarce on the relationship between tourism and political instability. However, Matthew and Richter (1991, p133) stressed the need to consider the importance of political science in the tourism sector (Poirier, 2000). The authors stated that "a tremendous need to integrate the politics of tourism and social science techniques with the skills and other training required by practitioners of tourism." (Matthews and Richter 1991, p133). This justifies the evidence of down growth in tourism trends in Asia and the Pacific following the incidences of political violence. Currently, China is not only involved in a trade war with the US but also facing internal conflicts with Hong Kong. Similarly, Pakistan and Iran are not only sharing hostile neighborhoods but also witnessing national political issues. If such an unstable political situation continues, the tourism industry can't prosper well within the regional axis.

### **Technological Backwardness**

As above explained, the digital transformation of the tourism sector is a compulsion for the success of the industry, but the high reliance of most of the members of the axis on technological innovation of the developed lands limits the effective policy implementation. Moreover, the low literacy rate and lack of technically skilled workers in Iran and Pakistan will negatively impact any coordinated action.

### **Conclusion**

Tourism is one of the fastest-growing industries, as well as a major economic driver in both developing and developed countries. It is the leading contributor in generating employment opportunities, as well as a significant wealth creator and contributor to the dynamic economy. Underdeveloped economies could readily be developed through the tourism industry. To make sense of the expanding relationship between tourism and development, the political economy of tourism must move beyond the analytically restricted and theoretically limited debates about tourism's positive impact on development. This is the only way to make a substantial and long-term impact on our understanding of the complex underlying factors that shape tourism's industrial organization and its implications for societies. Undoubtedly, an effective tourism policy can shape the global economic conditions but it is also crucial to undertake the environmental and social aspects of tourism while designing the policies. Moreover, successful collaboration among the Golden ring countries and implementation of a well-structured policy can be a game-changer for the region. All the member countries should efficiently work to achieve this goal and re-shape their existing policy frameworks in order to reach a sound policy that will equally benefit all the stakeholders. The tourism sector should explore and adopt the entire spectrum of digital innovation. Only then it will be able to overcome the current issues and constraints. Moreover, the successful implementation of an eco-friendly policy guided by the policy framework of OECD will help attain the goal of a carbon-neutral environment. In conclusion, although tourism development is not a magic wand that will bring instant changes and close



the economic gap between developed and developing worlds, it has the capacity to bring lasting change in the global economic scenario if implemented properly.

### **Recommendations**

- The bi-directional causal link between economic activity and tourism development provides decision-makers with compelling evidence that this connection can boost economic growth; as a result, it is recommended that a healthy business culture should be created to attract investments through tourism. Yet, in order for these capital investments to be long-lasting, a well-structured ecological policy should be implemented.
- The unidirectional causal relationship between energy and tourism development presents planners with guidance, indicating that as tourism grows, so does the demand for energy generation. Thus, to ensure that the benefits of tourism are long-lasting, authorities should concentrate on renewable energy generation; additionally, the states should motivate businesses to adopt clean energy to counter environmental effects. This implies that tourism can help reduce emissions of greenhouse gases (GHG) and contribute to Sustainable Developmental Goal 7 by encouraging investments in sustainable energy initiatives.
- To overcome the obstacles created by instability in the region, it is crucial for “Golden Ring Countries” to help each other in eradicating extremism from the region. The policymakers in all the countries should focus on the status of law and order and quality education. Terrorist acts undermine not only the tourism industry, but also suppress the soft picture of a nation, and education and law and order can act as an effective way to restore it. Moreover, the government should ensure that they will provide complete protection and security to the tourists. Here, another key aspect is that in the middle of this ring is Afghanistan (which shares the longest border with Pakistan i.e. 2,430 km), and appears like a gem that will increase the worth of this ring in near future (Raza & Khan, n.d.). So efforts should be made to include Afghanistan in the ring by eradicating terrorism from its soil and resolving its issues with the member states.
- As mentioned above, the lack of skilled labor force and technological innovation in Iran and Pakistan can limit the digital transformation of tourism, various training programs, and campaigns should be introduced in these countries. The developed economies in the ring can aid the developing countries in achieving digital transformation and advancement which in the long-term will benefit all five countries.
- It is important to establish a synergy between tourism and landscapes. Tourism locations across the globe are undergoing social and environmental shifts which are expected to intensify in the coming decades. Tourism has a lot of potentials to help regions become more resilient and cope with these transformations (Davidson, 2010). Focusing on synergies can aid to avoid an over-emphasis on either of the two aforementioned concerns. When the environment and tourism are in equilibrium, a region's social-ecological resilience is strengthened. The synergy between the two is helpful for making regions more adaptable. Thus, it is recommended that decision-makers should try to identify a region's historical institutional context; seek to understand an advanced policy centered on synergetic interactions; acquire an insight of all stakeholders, involve all stakeholders in decision making; create a shared narrative; co-create a definite plan for the future; while allowing flexibility in local implementation, and should not hesitate from experimenting.
- The focus of SDG 2 is on agriculture's backward integration by building ties between restaurants, hotels, and local farmers to improve tourists' food-related experiences and produce additional money for residents. As a result, it is suggested that local peasants should be trained to produce top-quality natural foods, and that appropriate market

access and connections between the business sector and communities be built by interventions. Agriculture growth not only supports tourism but also contributes to the preservation of the environment.

- It is crucial to recognize a region's historical institutional background. Understanding the local context in which policymakers and managers function is critical. Reflecting back on how policy and social discourse have evolved might help policymakers recognize the challenges and possibilities to develop good future policies. This can aid policymakers in identifying path-dependencies that may stifle other policy options. Content analysis is a user-friendly technique for methodically analyzing the way the institutional context has changed through time (Heslinga, Grootte, & Vanclay, 2018).

## References

- Adnan Hye, Q. M., & Ali Khan, R. E. (2013). Tourism-led growth hypothesis: A case study of Pakistan. *Asia Pacific Journal of Tourism Research*, 18(4), 303-313.
- Bramwell, B. (1994). Rural tourism and sustainable rural tourism. *Journal of Sustainable tourism*, 2(1-2), 1-6.
- Durbarry, R. (2004). Tourism and economic growth: the case of Mauritius. *Tourism Economics*, 10(4), 389-401.
- Farahani, B. M., & Shabani, M. (2014). The Impact of Sanctions On Iran's Tourism. *The Open Access Journal of Resistive Economics*, Volume 1(1) (OAJRE), 44-55.
- Government Tourism Policy & its Challenges. (2019, September 6). *Global Village Space*. Retrieved from <https://www.globalvillagespace.com/government-tourism-policy-its-challenges/>
- Hall, D. (1996). Tourism and politics: Policy, power and place-Hall, CM. In: *Inst British Geographers 1 Kensington Gore, London, England SW7 2AR*.
- Khalil, S., Kakar, M. K., & Malik, A. (2007). Role of tourism in economic growth: Empirical evidence from Pakistan economy [with comments]. *The Pakistan Development Review*, 46(4), 985-995.
- Morakabati, Y. (2011). Deterrents to tourism development in Iran. *International Journal of Tourism Research*, 13(2), 103-123
- Mushtaq, A. Q., Muzaffar, M., & Ali, A. (2017). Political Instability and the Budget Deficit in Economy: A Case of Pakistan, *Pakistan Social Sciences Review*, 1 (I), 01-20
- OECD. (2020). *OECD Tourism Trends and Policies 2020*. OECD iLibrary.
- Paget, E., Dimanche, F., & Mounet, J. P. (2010). A tourism innovation case: An actor-network approach. *Annals of Tourism research*, 37(3), 828-847
- Raad, N. G. (2019). A strategic approach to tourism development barriers in Iran. *Journal of Tourism & Hospitality*, 8(3), 410.
- Shukla, V. (2020, July 17). China, Russia, Iran, Pakistan and Turkey axis is becoming reality, Retrieved from <https://insiderpaper.com/china-russia-iran-pakistan-turkey-axis/>
- Statista. 2021. Travel and tourism in Russia. *Statista* [online] <<https://www.statista.com/topics/4803/travel-and-tourism-in-russia/>>
- Richter, L. K., & Waugh Jr, W. L. (1986). Terrorism and tourism as logical companions. *Tourism management*, 7(4), 230-238.
- Ruhanen, L. (2013). Local government: facilitator or inhibitor of sustainable tourism development?. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 21(1), 80-98.
- Tang, S., Selvanathan, E. A., & Selvanathan, S. (2007). The relationship between foreign direct investment and tourism: empirical evidence from China. *Tourism economics*, 13(1), 25-39.

- Wang, Y., & Bramwell, B. (2012). Heritage protection and tourism development priorities in Hangzhou, China: A political economy and governance perspective. *Tourism Management, 33*(4), 988-998.
- Zhao, W., & Ritchie, J. B. (2007). Tourism and poverty alleviation: An integrative research framework. *Current Issues in Tourism, 10*(2-3), 119-143.