CONTROUS OF IDENTITY: A COMPREHENSIVE EXPLORATION OF IDEOLOGICAL NARRATIVES IN PAKISTAN'S FORMATION

1Ghulam Shabbir*, 2 Sharaf Ali and 3 Syeda Sajida Batool

1. Assistant Professor, Department of History & Pakistan Studies University of Gujrat, Gujrat, Punjab, Pakistan
2. Associate Lecturer, Department of Political Science & IR University of Gujrat, Gujrat, Punjab, Pakistan
3. Lecturer, Department of History Art & Cultural Heritage, University of Education Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan

*Corresponding Author: ghulam.shabbir@uog.edu.pk

ABSTRACT
The genesis of Pakistan represents a multifaceted historical occurrence, shaped by intricate interplays of ideas, politics, interpersonal dynamics and religion. The primary objective of this research delves into diverse perspectives on the rationale behind Pakistan's formation, with a main emphasis on pivotal ideological constructs. The conceptual foundation of Pakistan, encapsulated in the Two-Nation Theory, is examined through the lenses of Muslim nationalism and the aspiration for an Islamic state. Paramount motivations include safeguarding Muslim rights, exerting political influence, addressing fiscal concerns and preserving cultural identity. The background of the study is linked with the notion of partition and explores it as a means to foster amicable relations among diverse religious communities, addressing conflicts within British India. The methodology of this research work is primarily based on historical and descriptive methods. Moreover, this paper is an addition to the historiography of Freedom Movement of Pakistan and a new perspective for the reader of South Asian Studies.

KEYWORDS: Idea of Pakistan, Islam, Jinnah, Pakistan Movement, Two Nation Theory

Introduction

The progression of this idea extends to an exploration of the concept of an Islamic country, wherein advocates for Pakistan sought to establish a space where Muslims could freely practice their religion without apprehension (Ahmed, 2008). The motivations extend beyond religious considerations, encompassing a commitment to safeguarding the rights of Muslims. This involves advocating for minority rights and addressing the political marginalization and economic disparities experienced by Muslims in a predominantly Hindu-majority India. There is a yearning for self-determination in politics, driven by a desire to exert control independently and make decisions autonomously, free from external influences (Gilmartin, 1998).

Leaders of the Pakistan Movement believed that the creation of Pakistan could contribute to better financial equity for the Muslims. Establishing a designated space for Muslims, known as Pakistan, is seen as a means to preserve and nurture their distinctive language and culture. This initiative is rooted in maintaining unique ways of life intertwined with Islam, preventing assimilation into a predominantly Hindu environment where the prevailing trend may encourage conformity to Hindu practices (Moore, 1983).

The study explores the concept of religious separation as a potential solution to address conflicts between different religious communities. It investigates whether partitioning British India into two entities, namely India and Pakistan, could foster unity
among people on religious issues and potentially mitigate conflicts between neighbours holding divergent beliefs. The narrative also delves into the creation of Pakistan as a response to the political dynamics of that era (Shabbir, Jawad, & Ullah, 2021). It discusses the possibility of reaching an agreement to unite India, with both Hindu and Muslim populations sharing political power equitably.

This research delves into leadership dynamics and the ability to foresee the future. It highlights the significant role played by prominent figures such as Muhammad Ali Jinnah, who led the All-India Muslim League, in shaping crucial aspects of the historical narrative (Shabbir, Alam, & Chawla, 2020). It’s crucial to note that Jinnah advocated for a distinct Muslim territory and engaged in discussions with both the British and the Indian National Congress. This dialogue provides clarity on the underlying motivations behind the formation of Pakistan.

The concept of shapes of identity serves as a valuable framework for comprehending how ideas contributed to the improvement of Pakistan. It discerns the challenges embedded in history and captures diverse perspectives on significant aspects of South Asia. This framework is particularly insightful in understanding a time when the dynamics in the region underwent notable transformations.

**Literature Review**

This literature review provides an overview of major works that help understand the historical, political, cultural and societal aspects of the idea of Pakistan. The work of Sikandar Hayat (2008-2019), rooted in Max Weber's concept of charisma and its subsequent developments by contemporary scholars, focuses on the 'personality-related' and 'situational' factors influencing the rise of Quaid-i-Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah as the charismatic leader of Muslim India. This second revised edition delves into the nuanced aspects that sustained and fortified Jinnah's charismatic leadership, ultimately contributing to the establishment of the separate state of Pakistan (Hayat, 2008, 2019).

Another work of Sikandar Hayat (2021), an idiosyncratic historiography clarifies, shedding light on the phenomenon of Muslim separatism and its profound impact on the shaping of modern South Asia. The narrative intricately traces the trajectories of six influential Muslim leaders in British India: who each contributed to its strengthening and evolution in unique ways; Allama Muhammad Iqbal, who advanced the cause by formulating the idea of a separate state; and, notably, Quaid-i-Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah, who having initiated the call for a separate state, transformed it into the nationalist Pakistan Movement, successfully leading it to the realization of an independent Pakistan. This work diverges from previous studies by presenting Muslim separatism within a comprehensive leadership framework. Adopting an 'instrumentalist' approach, the analysis unfolds through the individual contributions of a succession of Muslim leaders, each playing a pivotal role, collaborating and reinforcing one another, ultimately culminating in the historic achievement of Pakistan (Hayat, 2021).

Muhammad Iqbal Chawla’s work elaborates the political condition during Lord Wavell’s Viceroyalty in India, a critical situation that laid the foundation for subsequent events in the Mountbatten era. Lord Wavell encouraged for the enactment of the Breakdown Plan, providing the British government with a well-thought-out policy as it ready to exit India. Instantaneously, Wavell's calculation of India’s swiftly changing political dynamics brought into attention the broader global quandary faced by the British. Renouncing control over India meant navigating challenges on a global scale. This book investigates into the intricate undercurrents of Lord Wavell's Viceroyalty, offering a depth of analysis not previously explored. It encompasses the major events of the Indian political landscape during the Second World War and its aftermath when British influence over India was diminishing rapidly, and their departure was a matter of timing. The
second edition, a new chapter is included, focusing on Wavell's Breakdown Plan. This addition underscores its significant role in the partition of India, the creation of Pakistan, and the subsequent aftermath, providing a comprehensive understanding of this pivotal historical period (Chawla, 2011, 2023).

Farooq Ahmad Dar's work, regarded through the lens of a historian, researches into the role of Mohammad Ali Jinnah throughout his tenure as the first Governor General of Pakistan. In this brief yet impactful period, Jinnah vigorously advocated the cause of Pakistan's survival, instituting a concrete foundation across political, social, economic and diplomatic fronts. His unwavering determinations aimed to propel the new nation towards peace and progress, envisioning its future as a trailblazing state. Throughout this struggle, Jinnah remained the central figure, steering the country in the right direction. The book brings to light Jinnah's remarkable contributions and raises questions about whether he operated within the constitutional limits while wielding executive powers as the head of state in a parliamentary system. This research is based on the primary source materials gathered from Pakistan, the United Kingdom, the United States of America, India and Bangladesh, this work offers a wide-ranging investigation of Jinnah's leadership during a hazardous period in Pakistan's history (Dar, 2014, 2022).

Ayesha Jalal's work takes a deep investigation of the historical fundamentals of Pakistan, especially, with a specific focus on the leadership of Jinnah. Further, it elaborates on his articulating and navigating the call for a separate Muslim state. The book offers a comprehensive historical narrative, carefully examining the intricacies of the independence movement (Jalal, 1985).

In Jaswant Singh's exploration, he explains the partition of India in a deeply impactful way often referred to as vivisection, echoing Gandhi's characterization. Undoubtedly, it stands out as the most profound trauma of the twentieth century, leaving a lasting imprint on the psyche of over four generations in this subcontinent. The questions linger: Why did this partition happen at all? Can we attribute it to Jinnah, the Congress party, or the British? Jaswant Singh endeavors to unravel these queries and offer his perspective, acknowledging that a definitive answer may remain elusive. Jinnah's political journey was started as an "Ambassador of Hindu-Muslim Unity" or as a Muslim Gokhale, eventually led to his role as the "sole spokesman" of Muslims in India and the architect of Pakistan. The author delves into the intriguing aspects of this transformation, seeking to comprehend the how and why behind Jinnah's evolution (Singh, 2010).

In conclusion, these various works together provide a multifaceted insight into Pakistan's identity and role in the world, bringing out its history, political challenges, cultural shifts; societal intricacies that needed to be addressed for the concept of Pakistan to become tangible.

Material and Methods

The methodology of this paper is based on the historical, descriptive and analytical methods. Further, primary and secondary sources have been used to strengthen the arguments. The study constitutes an in-depth analysis of leadership, particularly focusing on Muhammad Ali Jinnah and his vision for a distinct Muslim state. It is imperative to underscore that the study illustrates the coexistence of these ideas. This implies that historical narratives are intricate, and individuals hold diverse perspectives on the magnitude of this event, both personally and within their respective groups. The establishment of Pakistan marked a crucial turning point in Indian history (Ahmed, 2012). It tangled with various elements such as ideological shifts, governance structures, and the religious fabric that shaped people's lives. This study endeavours to uncover numerous facets of this event by exploring diverse perspectives that played a
role in the genesis of Pakistan. The central focus of this inquiry revolves around the Two-Nation Theory, a fundamental concept positing Hindus and Muslims as distinct nations. Delving deeper, the study initiates an examination of the notion of Muslim nationalism within the Two-Nation Theory. It explores how this concept significantly contributed to the call for a distinct state for Muslims.

**Ideological Interpretations**

The creation of Pakistan in 1947 was a complex historical event shaped by various ideological, political, social, and religious factors. Different perspectives and interpretations exist regarding the reasons behind the formation of Pakistan. Here are some key ideological interpretations:

**Two Nation Theory**

The Two-Nation Theory, a significant concept that played a pivotal role in the creation of Pakistan in 1947, originated from the ideas of Muslim thinkers and found strong advocacy from Muhammad Ali Jinnah. This theory asserted that Hindus and Muslims in British India constituted distinct nations due to differences in religion, society, and culture. This notion laid the groundwork for the desire to establish a separate state exclusively for Muslims, ultimately leading to the partition of India and the realization of Pakistan (Shabbir, 2020).

The Two-Nation Theory emerged from the reflections of Muslim writers, thinkers, and leaders who posited that Muslims in India, with their unique history, customs, and way of life, constituted a separate entity. A significant milestone in the endorsement of the Two-Nation Theory occurred at the annual meeting of the All-India Muslim League in Lahore in 1940. The Lahore Resolution explicitly called for the creation of a separate Muslim state, a pivotal development that contributed to the eventual establishment of Pakistan (Shabbir, 2021b).

Central to the Two-Nation Theory was the emphasis on religion as a crucial component of national identity. This perspective left an enduring imprint on the character of the new Pakistan, where Islam was placed at the core of its national identity. Consequently, the Two-Nation Theory has had repercussions on how minorities are treated in Pakistan, sometimes raising questions about the equitable rights of non-Muslims (Aziz, 1997).

The historical significance of the Two-Nation Theory extends beyond the creation of Pakistan, influencing the relationship between India and Pakistan. Moreover, it continues to shape discussions about identity and nationhood in South Asia, prompting considerations of what defines a nation in the region.

**Muslim Nationalism**

Muslim nationalism played a crucial role in the struggle for Pakistan, shaping compelling ideas that galvanized support for the establishment of a state exclusively for Muslims. This movement was instigated by the social and political dynamics of British India, aiming to preserve the distinct identity of Muslims and safeguard their interests (Beg, 1986). The role of Muslim nationalism in the Pakistan Movement can be dissected by examining key elements.

Primarily, it focused on asserting the unique identity of Muslims in India. Advocates emphasized the disparities in religion and culture, highlighting the significant historical contributions of Muslims from ancient times to the present. This emphasis on distinctiveness was particularly critical in delineating Muslims from the Hindu majority.
Additionally, Muslim nationalism addressed the perceived under-representation of Muslims in politics. The concern was rooted in the fear that, in a democratic system, smaller groups lacking substantial support might be marginalized, prompting efforts to rectify perceived biases (Shabbir et al., 2020).

Lastly, there was a strenuous struggle to defend the rights of marginal groups, especially, in the perspective of an India predominantly Hindu in its makeup. As the idea of a unified state emerged, concerns arose about the potential mistreatment of those with differing beliefs, prompting a call for protection. The Two Nation Theory emerged as a central idea in Muslim advocacy for a separate state. It posited that Hindus and Muslims were distinct nations with unique identities, lifestyles, and histories, fuelling the necessity for a separate Muslim nation (Kailash, 1986).

**Identity Assertion**

Muslims in colonial India undertook a complex process of asserting their identity in response to the evolving socio-political environment introduced by British rule. Confronted with the uncertainties of colonial modernity, Muslims actively participated in various religious and social movements, such as Deobandi Islam and Ahl-i Hadith, to safeguard their traditions from extinction. The advent of modern education gave rise to institutions like Aligarh Muslim University, symbolizing a strategic compromise between embracing Western knowledge and preserving Islamic values (Moore, 1983).

Confronted with economic shifts from agrarian to industrial systems, Muslims had to adapt their economies, while the focus on political representation gained prominence in 1906 with the formation of the All India Muslim League. The call for an independent Muslim state in the Lahore Resolution of 1940 materialized into the formation of Pakistan. Nevertheless, the partition posed challenges as Muslims in India grappled with redefining their identity within the secular context of an independent nation. This identity assertion during the colonial era continues to shape the diverse landscape of Muslim identity in contemporary India (Ziring, 1977).

**Political Representation**

The issue of political representation for Muslims in colonial India constituted a complex and pivotal aspect of the broader struggle for self-determination during the British occupation. Muslims, constituting a substantial portion of the population, grappled with challenges related to political marginalization and inadequate representation (Roy, 1990). In 1906, the establishment of the All India Muslim League marked a significant milestone in addressing these concerns. Later, led by figures like Muhammad Ali Jinnah, the League aimed to articulate the political aspirations of Muslims and ensure their substantial participation in the emerging political landscape. Their strategic approach included a focus on the establishment of separate electorates, seeking to safeguard unique political rights and interests (Shabbir, Jawad, & Hanif, 2022).

The 1909 Morley-Minto reforms introduced a system of separate electorates, allowing Muslims to vote for their own representatives within designated constituencies. While this measure intended to protect minority interests, it inadvertently contributed to the communalization of Indian politics by fostering separate political identities along religious lines. Another crucial step in the political journey of Muslims in colonial India was the Lahore Resolution, asserting the necessity for political independence and the establishment of a separate nation as a homeland (Datta, 2002).

These concerted efforts culminated in the creation of Pakistan, addressing concerns of political representation in a distinctive manner. However, the partition of India brought forth numerous challenges, including mass migrations, communal violence
and the displacement of millions. The issue of political representation, which had fuelled the demand for a separate state, persisted in the post-independence era as both India and Pakistan grappled with defining their political identities and structures (Talbot, 1948). In hindsight, the question of political representation for Muslims in colonial India not only shaped the trajectory of developments during the independence struggle but also laid the foundation for intricate socio-political interactions in the region after gaining freedom from colonization (Shabbir, 2021a). This historical legacy continues to impact contemporary discussions on representation, identity, and communal politics in South Asia.

Cultural and Societal Dimensions

The Pakistan Movement of 1947 was significantly shaped by intricate cultural and societal elements, playing pivotal roles in determining the trajectory of this historical phenomenon. The essence of the movement primarily revolved around the idea of establishing a distinct nation for Muslims rooted in their autonomous cultural heritage. The cultural aspect was delineated by the aspiration for a state wherein Muslims could freely practice their religion and uphold their linguistic and cultural legacy (Shabbir & Ali, 2020). Societally, the movement embodied a shared consciousness among Muslims in British India, transcending regional, linguistic, and ethnic distinctions. The vision of creating a separate nation was intimately linked with the societal aspirations of Muslims, encompassing religious autonomy, social well-being, and the preservation of their unique way of life (Engineer, 1996).

Literary works, poetry and cultural symbols emerged as potent tools for mobilization, with poets like Allama Iqbal grounding their verses in cultural pride and identity. Societal dimensions encompassed the widespread support garnered by the movement, reflecting a collective yearning for a homeland where Muslims could live in harmony with their cultural ethos. The cultural and societal elements of the Pakistan Movement constitute an integral component of the nation's collective memory, shaping its identity as a country where diverse cultural expressions and societal norms have significantly influenced contemporary Pakistan (Datta, 2003).

Cultural and Linguistic Identity

The Cultural and linguistic identity of Muslims in colonial India was a product of an intricate interplay of influences from different sources shaped by historical interactions and by broader socio-cultural context. Muslims in this period had a rich cultural heritage seen in the fusion of Persian, Central Asian and indigenous Indian aspects. This was a fusion that was present in every area of life from art to music, architecture to literature. Festivals like Eid-ul-Fitr and Eid-ul-Adha highlighted distinctive customs, leading to a rich cultural environment (Gaborieau, 1985).

Linguistically, Urdu emerged as a major unifying tool for Muslims in the region although regional languages like Bengali, Punjabi and Sindhi are also spoken. Urdu literature and poetry developed as a tool of voicing cultural and linguistic identity. The heart of the Muslim personality was the act of Islam, penetrating everyday life, social traditions and family relations. Sufism that focused on spiritual experiences and tolerance brought a unique taste to religious identity (Kazimi, 2005). Despite this diversity, the climate was also ripe for the emergence of a unique political identity, which eventually culminated in the demand for a separate Muslim state and the eventual formation of Pakistan in 1947. This multi-dimensional flow of cultural, linguistic and religious identities never ceases to form the considerate reality of the contemporary Muslim identity in modern South Asia (Chakrabarty, 2020).
Religious Identity and Islamization

The significance of religious identity and Islamization in delineating the parameters of the Pakistan Movement underscores the complex relationship between politics and religion during a crucial juncture in South Asian history. Led by prominent figures like Muhammad Ali Jinnah, the movement aimed to carve out a distinct nation for Muslims based on their unique religious attributes. Jinnah's impetus stemmed from the imperative to provide a sanctuary for Muslims, free from the spectre of marginalization or discrimination (Hayat, 2021).

The call for Pakistan extended beyond mere political demands; it was intricately linked to the preservation and promotion of Islamic principles and traditions. The Lahore Resolution marked a watershed moment in the Pakistan Movement, advocating for separate statehood through the prism of Islam and laying the groundwork for subsequent processes of Islamization in Pakistan (Kailash, 1986).

The Islamization initiatives gained momentum in the post-independence era, encompassing endeavours to integrate Islamic tenets into the legal, political, and social frameworks of the nascent nation. This trajectory included the formulation of the Objectives Resolution in 1949 and subsequent constitutional amendments designating Islam as the state religion. The role of religious identity and Islamization in the Pakistan Movement not only influenced the establishment of the state but also left enduring imprints on the country's political and social evolution (Noorani, 1990). The intricate interplay between religious identity and state-building continues to be a crucial facet of Pakistan's contemporary socio-political landscape.

Economic Considerations

In colonial India, the Muslims had a range of considerations that were influenced by various factors. The overall economic landscape was shaped by the policies implemented by the colonial administration, which had both negative effects on communities. Muslims, who constituted a portion of the population were involved in economic activities including agriculture, trade and craftsmanship. As the economy underwent transformations from agrarian to systems there were challenges and opportunities for the Muslim community to adapt and restructure their economies (Zaidi, 2001).

The establishment of institutions like Aligarh Muslim University reflected a compromise between embracing Western knowledge and preserving Islamic values. This decision was driven by the understanding that education played a role in empowering individuals and enabling social mobility. However, Muslims also faced challenges such as disparities in accessing resources and opportunities (Shabbir et al., 2021).

The economic considerations of Muslims during colonial India were closely tied to their representation. The formation of the All India Muslim League was a response to perceived marginalization of Muslims both economically and politically. The subsequent demand, for separate electorates aimed at safeguarding the political interests of the Muslim community within the changing colonial framework (Puckle, 1945). Further, the political rift between the League and Congress widen the gap of Hindu-Muslim mistrust.

Leadership and Vision

The Pakistan Movement, resulted in the creation of Pakistan, was manifest by charismatic leadership and visionary associates who played influential roles in circumnavigating the multifaceted political background of colonial India. Leading among them was Jinnah, frequently denoted to as the "Quaid-e-Azam", who appeared as the chief
architect and leader of the movement. Jinnah's vision was deep-rooted in the awareness of forming a separate nation for Muslims, safeguarding their political and cultural constitutional rights within an assorted and pluralistic society (Zaidi, 1993-2005). His firm obligation to the cause, judicious political acumen, and legal competence made him the kingpin of the movement. Jinnah's leadership was categorized by his capability to articulate the determinations of Muslims and negotiate with British institutions for the establishment of Pakistan (Hayat, 2000).

In addition to Jinnah, other figures such as Allama Iqbal, often regarded as the spiritual father of Pakistan, played an essential role in determining the ideological facets of this movement. Iqbal's poetic vision centred on the necessity of a sovereign Muslim state, laying the foundation for the Lahore Resolution (Datta, 2002). Despite variations in region, language and ethnicity among Muslims, the Pakistan Movement was characterized by a shared vision. Ultimately, Jinnah guided the All India Muslim League to provide a unified platform for Muslims to collaborate toward a common goal. The leaders of the movement demonstrated remarkable foresight, recognizing the challenges Muslims faced in terms of religious and political representation while living within colonies (Dhulipala, 2010).

In summary, the success of the Pakistan Movement can be attributed to visionary leadership, exemplified by individuals like Jinnah and Iqbal. Their unwavering commitment to ideals such as self-determination and religious liberty facilitated the transformation of Pakistan into an independent and sovereign state.

Conclusion

This extensive study delves deeply into the Pakistan Movement, centring on the leadership of Jinnah and the intricate facets that shaped the birth of the nation. The interaction of numerous ideas and perspectives accentuates the complex nature of historical narratives contiguous this pivotal event. The creation of Pakistan acknowledged as a crucial event in Indian history, intricately tied to shifts in ideologies, structures of governance, and religious considerations that left an indelible mark on the lives of its people.

At its core, the study revolves around the Two-Nation Theory, exploring the concept of Muslim nationalism and the subsequent call for a separate state. This ideology transcended mere religious considerations, addressing the rights and representation of Muslims while expressing a desire for self-determination in the political arena. The study probes into the motivations behind the creation of Pakistan, unravelling economic considerations and cultural and societal dimensions that played pivotal roles.

Examining ideological interpretations, the study scrutinizes the historical significance and lasting impact of the Two-Nation Theory and Muslim nationalism on identity and nationhood in South Asia. It delves into the intricate dynamics of identity assertion by Muslims in colonial India, navigating the challenges posed by socio-political changes and economic shifts. The study emphasizes the intricate connection between religious identity and Islamization during the Pakistan Movement, illustrating how these dynamics not only influenced the formation of the nation but continue to form its contemporary socio-political landscape. Moreover, it sheds light on the cultural and linguistic distinctiveness of Muslims in colonial India, accentuating the rich heritage that has contributed to the diverse tapestry of modern Muslim individuality in South Asia.

Economic considerations of Muslims during colonial India are explored, highlighting the hurdles and opportunities faced by the community in the evolving economic landscape. The study then delves into the leadership and vision that propelled the Pakistan Movement, focusing on Muhammad Ali Jinnah and other influential figures.
Their collective dream, exceeding regional, linguistic and ethnic differences, played a pivotal part in directing the movement towards the creation of Pakistan. This study elaborates the complexities of the Pakistan Movement, providing a comprehensive perspective of its historical, political, cultural and societal dimensions. The diverse viewpoints presented in the literature review contribute to a comprehensive exploration of Pakistan’s identity and its importance in the global context.
References


