

**RESEARCH PAPER****A Study to Explore Perception of Elementary Schools' Teachers Regarding Effective Teaching****¹Muhammad Waseem, ²Dr. Rahmat Ullah Bhatti* and ³Muhammad Ramzan**

1. Elementary Teacher, Punjab School Education Department Sahiwal, Pakistan
2. Assistant Professor, Department of Early Childhood Education & Elementary Teacher Education, Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad, Pakistan
3. M. Phil Scholar, Department of Early Childhood Education & Elementary Teacher Education, Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad, Pakistan

***Corresponding Author:** rehmat.ullah@aiou.edu.pk**ABSTRACT**

Twentieth century has witnessed the unprecedented changes in family structures and The study aims to explore the perception of elementary schools' teachers regarding effective teaching. A teacher is a true guide who makes every effort to help students reach their maximum learning potential. Objectives of the study were to examine the perspective of elementary school teacher on effective teaching, analyse their teaching methodologies and identify the barriers to effective teaching. The study was descriptive in nature. Researchers have conducted a survey from teachers of Rural and Urban areas of Rawalpindi, Punjab, Pakistan at both Government and Private sector for elementary level. The population of the study comprised of 200 working male and female teachers from rural and urban areas of both Government and Private sectors. The random sampling method was used and 40 teachers were selected. The tool of the study includes a questionnaire which was based on 5-point Likert scale. Researcher personally visited all the schools and got permission from the authorities to collect the data from the teachers of elementary level. Data analysis was done by using frequency and percentages. Findings of the study showed that most of the teachers were well aware of the term effective teaching. However; this study illustrated some issues while analyzing the other characteristics like punctuality and behavior of teachers in some aspects. It is recommended that all teachers should be trained on set standards to avoid cognitive dissonance of teachers.

KEYWORDS: Educators, Effective Teaching, Elementary Level, Students Learning**Introduction**

A teacher is a true guider who makes every effort to help students to reach their maximum learning potential. Teaching is a profession with its own body of knowledge, models, and techniques. Not only do teachers need enthusiasm, personality and passion, they also require particular knowledge, skills and beliefs. Teaching is cognitively and emotionally demanding (Lazarides & Warners, 2020). The difference between a good teacher and a great one isn't expertise. It comes down to passion for material and teaching. When it comes to learning, experts are always looking for the best tools and tactics for educating children. It often drives schools to look at ways to reform, sometimes too rapidly. Teachers can be faced with mandated changes in tools, curriculum, and best practices as administrators race to adopt the latest and greatest trends (Demirdag, 2015). There is a need to adapt a change which will assist teachers to improve and polish their teaching skills. Some outdated methodologies need to be stopped or improved in order to achieve better results (Halder & Roy, 2018). The ability to connect with students greatly contributes to effective teaching. The power to engage students comes in many forms. Some students are already excited about the subject and

are eager to learn more. More often the teacher must actively engage or motivate the students by promoting a sense of the importance and relevance of the topic and the related learning process (Munna & Kalam, 2021). The quality of education largely depends on the quality of instruction that the teacher provides in the classroom. For this reason, teachers should pay attention to the planning, organizing, controlling of instruction and efforts should be made to introduce new methods.

Effective teachers have high expectations of students in terms of both their standard of learning and their behaviour. They help their students meet those expectations (Bardch et al., 2022). They also have high expectations of themselves and their own learning. Expectations of teachers reflect their culture – the extent of their knowledge and skills, their status in the community, and their moral dispositions. Effective teachers personalise the learning for their students (Simonson et al., 2022). They understand that students develop at different rates and that in every classroom there will be a range of student abilities and aptitudes. Effective teachers use techniques that best serve the learning needs of their students. Effective teachers use techniques that have each student working on tasks that engage and challenge them to achieve their personal best. Effective teachers provide a safe and orderly environment, both physically and emotionally, so students can achieve their potential (Sánchez-Cabrero et al., 2021).

Perceptions of teachers definitely affect their teachings and their teaching approaches. Few studies indicated the interest of teachers in teaching was highly dependent on their perception of the way they tend to teach. The study was conducted to explore the elementary schools' teacher's perception from rural and urban areas of Pakistan towards effective teaching. The study was focused on finding what teachers perceive about effective teaching and how they apply it to their daily teaching routine.

Literature Review

The life of a teacher is neither confined in the four corners of the classroom nor limited inside the school campus. A teacher is an active leader in the community. Teachers always take leadership in their communities especially in activities and projects related to the education and welfare of young children (Silva, 2021). They also provide leadership roles in various cultural development programs in their communities. Teachers provide technical and professional assistance in the local communities where they belong. An effective teacher needs to apply theoretical concepts to the classroom in order to engage the student in the learning process. Effective teachers strive to grow professionally and use their knowledge to positively affect classroom practice (Bakx et al., 2015; Hatch & Clark, 2021).

The theories about effective teaching have been linked closely to prevailing understandings of how people learn. One can explore how ideas about effective teaching have evolved during the years by analysing major reviews such as those in Reinke (2011), Lee and Tsai (2010), Stronge (2018), Klassen and Tze (2014). These reviews contain various suggestions about how teachers and help students develop knowledge or skills along with this they also conclude that there is no single strategy effective all the time for all learners. Teaching and learning both are really complex processes which are influenced by many different factors among which only a few are under the teacher's control (Sadeghi et al., 2021). Nevertheless, the research cited here concludes the perception of teachers at elementary level about effective teaching.

Effective Teaching – An art

Effective teaching is both an art and a science (Chang, 2012). Like an artist, a good teacher makes decisions from both a technical and a creative perspective. Great

artists display a mastery of technical skills—painting, glass blowing, sculpting—that includes a grasp of the science behind how these techniques work. They also know when and in what way to apply their technical skills (Bardach & Klassen, 2020; Chou, 2022). They make decisions. That part is the art. Similarly, teachers develop their science by using carefully planned, fine-tuned lessons that reflect an understanding of many different teaching techniques (Steed et al., 2022). They apply each technique skilfully to gain the desired intellectual, social, affective, or kinaesthetic result. They develop artistry by being aware of what they are doing and how their actions affect their learners. They are constantly aware that the choices they make affect the intellectual, attitudinal, and psychomotor skills of their students. Above all, they make decisions. For a series of studies on invitational learning (Donnelly, 2022).

Effective teaching is best estimated in relation to goals. There are some features of teaching on which there is both a consensus among lecturers and evidence from studies of student learning. Generally speaking, effective teaching is systematic, stimulating, and caring (Kini & Podolsky, 2016; Mcleskey, 2014; Donaldson, 2013). Obviously, the emphasis on these factors varies between lecturers and subjects and each of these factors is complex and, in practice, challenging. There is surprisingly equivocal evidence supporting the claim that field-based experiences produce reflective practitioners. Research suggests that, as a result of student teaching, student teachers generally become more controlling and more conservative, rather than innovative and reflective (Samsons & Collins, 2012). One substantive study found that student teachers in general are not necessarily more efficacious as a result of completing their training. They tend to be less autonomous, though not necessarily more controlling in their orientation towards children (Darling-Hammond, 2013). Such findings give rise to some interesting and pertinent questions about student teaching, and challenges teacher educators to reconsider how student teaching might best contribute to student teachers' professional development (Kraft & Gilmour, 2017; Ahmad & Hamid, 2020; Riastini et al., 2021).

Material and Methods

The study was descriptive in nature and researcher used survey design to investigate the research problem. Questionnaire was used as tool to collect information. Researchers conducted a survey from teachers of Rural and Urban areas of Rawalpindi, Punjab, Pakistan at both Government and Private sector for elementary level with a questionnaire in order to analyse their perception regarding effective teaching.

A sample of 200 teachers was selected using simple random sampling technique from urban and rural areas of Rawalpindi with equal number of male and female teachers. The study used a questionnaire for this research. This questionnaire included clear instructions to complete and the language used is simple and comprehensible. To get the opinion from male and female teachers about their perception regarding effective teaching, 5-point Likert scale was developed. The respondents were requested to choose one option from the five options as desired. The instruments validated through expert opinion. Instrument (Observation Sheet) distributed to experts of Faculty of Education, Allama Iqbal Open University Islamabad. Instrument improved in light of opinions of experts. The value of Cronbach alpha for the questionnaire was 0.84. Hence, the tool was found valid and reliable. Researcher personally visited all the schools and got permission from the authorities to conduct the surveys from the teachers of elementary level. All the teachers were briefed about the questionnaire and motives behind it. Proper time was allocated to everyone to fill out the questionnaire and then their response was collected personally. Data collected through questionnaire was organized systematically. All the responses were analysed accumulatively on the basis of the response frequency and percentages.

Results and Discussion

Table 1
Teaching Qualities

| Statements | Strongly Disagree | | Disagree | | Undecided | | Agree | | Strongly Agree | |
|--|-------------------|-----|----------|-----|-----------|-----|-------|------|----------------|------|
| | F | % | F | % | F | % | F | % | F | % |
| Teacher has clear pronunciation | 3 | 1.5 | 3 | 1.5 | 7 | 3.5 | 92 | 46 | 95 | 47.5 |
| Teacher is enthusiastic about teaching | 2 | 1 | 1 | 0.5 | 6 | 3 | 101 | 50.5 | 90 | 45 |
| Teacher has a proper pace of teaching? | 1 | 0.5 | 1 | 0.5 | 5 | 2.5 | 91 | 45.5 | 102 | 51 |
| Teacher acts as a model teacher. | 2 | 1 | 1 | 0.5 | 1 | 0.5 | 64 | 32 | 132 | 66 |

Table 1 indicates that 93.5% of the teachers have clear pronunciation. 95.5% of the teachers are always enthusiastic about their teaching and 96.5% of the teachers have a proper pace of teaching. 98% of the teachers' act as a model teacher to their students.

Table 2
Time Management

| Statements | Strongly Disagree | | Disagree | | Undecided | | Agree | | Strongly Agree | |
|-------------------------------------|-------------------|-----|----------|-----|-----------|-----|-------|------|----------------|------|
| | F | % | F | % | F | % | F | % | F | % |
| Teacher finishes class on time | 2 | 1 | 3 | 1.5 | 7 | 3.5 | 92 | 46 | 96 | 48 |
| Teacher starts class on time | 3 | 1.5 | 3 | 1.5 | 3 | 1.5 | 89 | 44.5 | 101 | 50.5 |
| Teacher uses class time efficiently | 2 | 1 | 3 | 1.5 | 11 | 5.5 | 93 | 46.5 | 91 | 45.5 |

Table 2 indicates that 94% of the teachers always try to finish their class on time.95% of the teachers start class on time which means that they are punctual and responsible and 92% of the teachers use class time efficiently.

Table 3
Encouragement

| Statements | Strongly Disagree | | Disagree | | Undecided | | Agree | | Strongly Agree | |
|--|-------------------|-----|----------|-----|-----------|-----|-------|------|----------------|------|
| | F | % | F | % | F | % | F | % | F | % |
| Teacher encourages student's opinions | 2 | 1 | 7 | 3.5 | 4 | 2 | 86 | 43 | 101 | 50.5 |
| Teacher encourages student's participation | 5 | 2.5 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 1.5 | 70 | 35 | 122 | 61 |
| Teacher encourages critical thinking | 6 | 3 | 9 | 4.5 | 14 | 7 | 86 | 43 | 85 | 42.5 |
| Teacher encourages additional learning | 3 | 1.5 | 2 | 1 | 7 | 3.5 | 100 | 50 | 88 | 44 |
| Teacher encourages students to ask question | 2 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 3 | 1.5 | 75 | 37.5 | 118 | 59 |
| Teacher encourages students to come prepared | 2 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 1.5 | 95 | 47.5 | 100 | 50 |

Table 3 indicates that 93.5% of the teachers encourages their student's opinions. 96% of the teachers appreciate and encourages their student's participation in the class. 85.5% of the teachers encourage their students for a critical thinking. 94% of the teachers encourage their students for additional learning. 96.5% of the teachers motivate their students to ask questions in their class. 97.5% of the teachers encourage their student to come prepared in advance for the next lecture.

Table 4
Provide Guidance

| Statements | Strongly Disagree | | Disagree | | Undecided | | Agree | | Strongly Agree | |
|--|-------------------|-----|----------|-----|-----------|-----|-------|------|----------------|------|
| | F | % | F | % | F | % | F | % | F | % |
| Teacher is available during consultation hours | 11 | 5.5 | 11 | 5.5 | 10 | 5 | 119 | 59.5 | 49 | 24.5 |
| Teacher links theory and applications | 4 | 2 | 3 | 1.5 | 8 | 4 | 101 | 50.5 | 84 | 42 |
| Teacher provide attention to the weak | 1 | 0.5 | 1 | 0.5 | 3 | 1.5 | 83 | 41.5 | 112 | 56 |
| Teacher keep the students attentive | 1 | 0.5 | 1 | 0.5 | 6 | 3 | 82 | 41 | 110 | 55 |

Table 4 indicates that 84% of the teachers agree to the fact that they are available during the consultation hours. 92.5% of the teachers link their theoretical teachings with the daily world live applications. 97.5% of the teachers tend to provide more attentions to the weak students. 96% of the teachers focus on keeping their students attentive in class.

Table 5
Feedback

| Statements | Strongly Disagree | | Disagree | | Undecided | | Agree | | Strongly Agree | |
|---|-------------------|-----|----------|-----|-----------|------|-------|------|----------------|------|
| | F | % | F | % | F | % | F | % | F | % |
| Teacher shows interest in feedback | 4 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 0.5 | 111 | 55.5 | 82 | 41 |
| Teachers prompt in giving feedback on exams | 3 | 1.5 | 5 | 2.5 | 27 | 13.5 | 111 | 55.5 | 54 | 27 |
| Teacher is fair and just in grading | 2 | 1 | 5 | 2.5 | 8 | 4 | 80 | 40 | 105 | 52.5 |
| Teacher returns assignments with comments | 2 | 1 | 3 | 1.5 | 12 | 6 | 102 | 51 | 81 | 40.5 |
| Teacher discusses test results in the class | 2 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 9 | 4.5 | 93 | 46.5 | 94 | 47 |

Table 5 indicates that 96.5% of the teachers show interest in the feedback provided by their students. 5% of the teachers waste no time in providing feedback on exams. 92.5% of the teachers are fair in grading. 91.5% of the teachers always return their assignment on time along with their comments. 93.5% of the teachers discuss test results in the class.

Table 6
Lecture Preparation and Organization

| Statements | Strongly Disagree | | Disagree | | Undecided | | Agree | | Strongly Agree | |
|---------------------------------------|-------------------|-----|----------|-----|-----------|-----|-------|------|----------------|------|
| | F | % | F | % | F | % | F | % | F | % |
| Teacher has a good Subject Knowledge | 3 | 1.5 | 4 | 2 | 1 | 0.5 | 75 | 37.5 | 117 | 58.5 |
| Teacher is systematic in presentation | 1 | 0.5 | 4 | 2 | 7 | 3.5 | 109 | 54.5 | 79 | 39.5 |
| Teacher has mastery over the subject | 3 | 1.5 | 5 | 2.5 | 6 | 3 | 98 | 49 | 88 | 44 |
| Teacher is clear in presentation | 1 | 0.5 | 1 | 0.5 | 5 | 2.5 | 96 | 48 | 97 | 48.5 |
| Teacher follows the course outline | 2 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 14 | 7 | 97 | 48.5 | 85 | 42.5 |
| Teacher lectures are well organized | 3 | 1.5 | 1 | 0.5 | 3 | 1.5 | 100 | 50 | 93 | 46.5 |
| Teacher comes prepared to the class | 2 | 1 | 3 | 1.5 | 5 | 2.5 | 83 | 41.5 | 107 | 53.5 |

Table 6 indicates that 96% of the teachers have a strong grip on their subject of teaching. 94% of the teachers are systematic in their presentations. 93% of the teachers have mastery over their subject of teaching. 96.5% of the teachers are always clear in presentation. 91% of the teachers always prefer to follow the course outline as set in the beginning of each session. 96.5% of the teachers have always planned their lectures

which are well organized and as per the standards. 95% of the teachers are well prepared when they enter the class.

Table 7
Appreciate and Praise Students

| Statements | Strongly Disagree | | Disagree | | Undecided | | Agree | | Strongly Agree | |
|--|-------------------|-----|----------|---|-----------|-----|-------|------|----------------|------|
| | F | % | F | % | F | % | F | % | F | % |
| Teacher praises the students for performance | 1 | 0.5 | 4 | 2 | 1 | 0.5 | 79 | 39.5 | 115 | 57.5 |
| Teacher generates a sense of enthusiasm | 2 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 5 | 2.5 | 113 | 56.5 | 80 | 40 |

Table 7 indicates that 97% of the teachers appreciate their student’s hard work.96.5% of the teachers generate a sense of enthusiasm within their students.

Table 8
Facilitate Students

| Statements | Strongly Disagree | | Disagree | | Undecided | | Agree | | Strongly Agree | |
|---|-------------------|-----|----------|-----|-----------|------|-------|------|----------------|------|
| | F | % | F | % | F | % | F | % | F | % |
| Teacher welcomes students’ comments | 4 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 116 | 58 | 78 | 39 |
| Teacher uses a variety of teaching methods | 4 | 2 | 3 | 1.5 | 3 | 1.5 | 93 | 46.5 | 97 | 48.5 |
| Teaches has a good sense of humour | 3 | 1.5 | 3 | 1.5 | 6 | 3 | 109 | 54.5 | 79 | 39.5 |
| Teacher uses non-verbal communication | 5 | 2.5 | 19 | 9.5 | 21 | 10.5 | 104 | 52 | 51 | 25.5 |
| Teacher explain objectives at the beginning | 2 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 10 | 5 | 96 | 48 | 92 | 46 |
| Teacher uses clear, understandable language | 2 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 1.5 | 77 | 38.5 | 118 | 59 |

Table 8 indicates that 97% of the teachers always welcome their student comments. 95% of the teachers use variety teaching methods in their teaching which helps students to grasp more easily.94% of the teachers teach with a good sense of humour. 77.5% of the teachers use non-verbal communication in class. 94% of the teachers always explain their objective the beginning of each. 97.5% of the teachers’ user the language which is easy to understand by the student of secondary level.

Table 9
Mismanagement

| Statements | Strongly Disagree | | Disagree | | Undecided | | Agree | | Strongly Agree | |
|--|-------------------|-----|----------|------|-----------|------|-------|------|----------------|------|
| | F | % | F | % | F | % | F | % | F | % |
| Teacher makes the students work hard | 4 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 7 | 3.5 | 82 | 41 | 105 | 52.5 |
| Teacher misses classes without make-up | 17 | 8.5 | 43 | 21.5 | 29 | 14.5 | 68 | 34 | 43 | 21.5 |
| Teacher misses classes without informing | 40 | 20 | 57 | 28.5 | 13 | 6.5 | 41 | 20.5 | 49 | 24.5 |

Table 9 indicates that 93.5% of the teachers make their students work hard.55.5% of the teachers miss their classes without any make-up class. 45% of the teachers’ miss class without providing a prior notice or informing their students.

Discussions

Effective teaching demands from the teacher to know the subject being taught in a deep sense in the class. Effective teachers have high expectations of students in terms of both their standard of learning and their behaviour. Teachers also help their students to meet those expectations (Bardch et al., 2022). The study was descriptive in nature. Researchers have conducted a survey from teachers of Rural and Urban areas of Pakistan at both Government and Private sector for elementary level with a

questionnaire. Researcher personally visited all the schools and got permission from the authorities to collect the data from the teachers of elementary level. Data analysis was done by using frequency and percentages. Findings of the study showed that most of the teachers were well aware of the term effective teaching. Findings of the study are also similar with the study conducted by Bakz et al., (2015). They conducted the study on pupils' perceptions on teacher quality in primary education. Pupils' perceptions of desired characteristics of good teachers in primary education were compared to results of research into teacher quality from different perspectives. The results showed that the perceptions of pupils about teacher quality were extensive. Moreover, a study conducted by Meng and Muñoz (2016) investigated Chinese and American elementary school teachers' perceptions of effective teaching. The Effective Teaching Quality Survey (ETQS) was adopted for this comparative education research, statistically significant results were found when comparing nationality, teaching experience, school location, and effective/ineffective teaching. The results of the study are somehow similar with the studies conducted by Minor et al., (2002). The purpose of this study was to examine pre-service teachers' perceptions of characteristics of effective teachers, as well as to investigate whether these perceptions are related to educational beliefs (i.e., progressive vs. trans-missive). A phenomenological analysis of responses revealed several characteristics that many of the pre-service teachers considered to reflect effective teaching. In addition, another study conducted by Cakmak and Bulut(2005) aimed at investigating the perceptions of pre-service teachers regarding effective teaching and effective teachers. Findings revealed that pedagogical skills of professional teachers should take precedence over the improvement of their theoretical knowledge of their subject matter.

Conclusions

Majority of the teachers were aware of the fact that they are available during the consultation hours. They are interested in their student's questions or remarks and are willing to explain and resolve their queries. Majority of the teachers links their theoretical teachings with the daily world live applications which in-turn develops interest in their students about the topic and assist them in understanding it easily. Teachers encourage their student's opinions. Teachers have a strong grip on their subject of teaching. They have a good knowledge along with the concepts. Teachers teach with a good sense of humor which helps the students to stay active and interested.

Majority of the teachers have clear pronunciation. Teachers always try to finish their class on time which means they plan their teaching material effectively and according to the class time. Teachers use non-verbal communication in class which includes eye contact, gestures, facial expressions etc. Teachers motivate their students to ask questions in their class. Majority of the teachers always prefer to follow the course outline as set in the beginning of each session. Teachers have always planned their lectures which are well organized and as per the standards. We found out the teachers are pretty much collaborative as over 80% of them are always available during consultation hours and over 85% of the students encourage their student for a critical thinking.

Teachers have strong grasp and knowledge of their subject are enthusiastic about their teaching and tend to generate a sense of enthusiasm within their students. They praised their student's performance, provided attention to the weak students. They kept their students attentive and always encouraged their student's questions, participations, comments and feedbacks. They tended to start and finish class on time and used variety of teaching methods. They act as a role model; their lectures were well prepared and they were very clear in their presentations as they used a clear and understandable language. But teachers missed their class without even informing their

students and without arranging any make-up session for the class which they were failed to take-in for any reason.

Teachers were well aware of effective teaching strategies and try to implement it in their daily routine. However, this study illustrated some issues while analyzing the other characteristics like punctuality and behavior of teachers in some aspects which definitely need urgent improvement for the betterment of elementary level teaching standards.

Recommendations

- It was found in the study that majority of the teachers miss their classes without conducting any make-up session which definitely hurts the student achievements, leading them to an incomplete course and a gap in their learning. Therefore, it is recommended that school head may follow the activities of the teachers so that they may not miss their classes.
- Majority of the teachers' miss class without providing a prior notice or informing their students which lead to various problems. It is hereby recommended that teachers should try not to be absent from class and in case if it's not feasible for a teacher to attend on any given day, it should be their prime responsibility that they should inform the class of their absence and more likely the reason associated with it.
- Different teachers from different background may have different perceptions towards effective teaching. It is recommended that all teachers may be trained on standards to avoid cognitive dissonance of teachers.
- Government may implement policies for teachers to be punctual and take classes on time. In this way, teachers will attend classes on time and in turn it will bring quality in teaching learning.

References

- Ahmad, N., & Hamid, M. T. S. (2020). Teachers' perceptions regarding the effect of instructional leadership practices of primary school head-teachers on teacher effectiveness. *Journal of Research*, 14(2), 231-248.
- Bakx, A., Koopman, M., de Kruijf, J., & den Brok, P. (2015). Primary school pupils' views of characteristics of good primary school teachers: An exploratory, open approach for investigating pupils' perceptions. *Teachers and teaching*, 21(5), 543-564.
- Bardach, L., & Klassen, R. M. (2020). Smart teachers, successful students? A systematic review of the literature on teachers' cognitive abilities and teacher effectiveness. *Educational Research Review*, 30, 100312.
- Bardach, L., Klassen, R. M., & Perry, N. E. (2022). Teachers' psychological characteristics: Do they matter for teacher effectiveness, teachers' well-being, retention, and interpersonal relations? An integrative review. *Educational Psychology Review*, 34(1), 259-300.
- Cakmak, M., & Bulut, M. (2005). The perceptions of pre-service teachers about effective teaching and effective teachers, *Mediterranean Journal of Educational Studies*, 10(1), 73-89
- Chang, I. H. (2012). The effect of principals' technological leadership on teachers' technological literacy and teaching effectiveness in Taiwanese elementary schools. *Journal of Educational Technology & Society*, 15(2), 328-340.
- Chou, C. I. (2022). A Study on the Relationship Between the Principals' Positive Leadership and Teachers' Teaching Effectiveness in Elementary Schools of New Taipei City. *School Administrators*, (137), 92-114.
- Darling-Hammond, L., Newton, S. P., & Wei, R. C. (2013). Developing and assessing beginning teacher effectiveness: The potential of performance assessments. *Educational Assessment, Evaluation and Accountability*, 25, 179-204.
- Demirdag, S. (2015). Assessing teacher self-efficacy and job satisfaction: Middle school teachers. *Journal of Educational and Instructional Studies in the World*, 5(3), 35-43.
- Donaldson, M. L. (2013). Principals' approaches to cultivating teacher effectiveness: Constraints and opportunities in hiring, assigning, evaluating, and developing teachers. *Educational Administration Quarterly*, 49(5), 838-882.
- Donnelly, D. (2022). *An Exploration of the Relationship between School Culture and Teacher Efficacy in an Elementary School Setting* (Doctoral dissertation, Southern New Hampshire University).
- Halder, U. K., & Roy, R. R. (2018). Job satisfaction and teacher effectiveness of secondary school Teachers. *International journal of innovative research explorer*, 5(4), 47-61.
- Hamre, B. K., Pianta, R. C., Burchinal, M., Field, S., LoCasale-Crouch, J., Downer, J. T., ... & Scott-Little, C. (2012). A course on effective teacher-child interactions: Effects on teacher beliefs, knowledge, and observed practice. *American Educational Research Journal*, 49(1), 88-123.
- Kini, T., & Podolsky, A. (2016). *Does Teaching Experience Increase Teacher Effectiveness? A Review of the Research*. Learning Policy Institute.

- Klassen, R. M., & Tze, V. M. (2014). Teachers' self-efficacy, personality, and teaching effectiveness: A meta-analysis. *Educational research review*, 12, 59-76.
- Kraft, M. A., & Gilmour, A. F. (2017). Revisiting the widget effect: Teacher evaluation reforms and the distribution of teacher effectiveness. *Educational researcher*, 46(5), 234-249.
- Lazarides, R., & Warner, L. M. (2020). Teacher self-efficacy. In *Oxford research encyclopedia of education*.
- Lee, M. H., & Tsai, C. C. (2010). Exploring teachers' perceived self efficacy and technological pedagogical content knowledge with respect to educational use of the World Wide Web. *Instructional Science*, 38, 1-21.
- McLeskey, J., Waldron, N. L., & Redd, L. (2014). A case study of a highly effective, inclusive elementary school. *The Journal of Special Education*, 48(1), 59-70.
- Minor, L. C., Onwuegbuzie, A. J., Witcher, A. E., & James, T. L. (2002). Preservice teachers' educational beliefs and their perceptions of characteristics of effective teachers. *The Journal of Educational Research*, 96(2), 116-127.
- Munna, A. S., & Kalam, M. A. (2021). Teaching and learning process to enhance teaching effectiveness: a literature review. *International Journal of Humanities and Innovation (IJHI)*, 4(1), 1-4.
- Orlich, D. C., Harder, R. J., Callahan, R. C., Trevisan, M. S., & Brown, A. H. (2012). *Teaching strategies: A guide to effective instruction*. Cengage Learning.
- Reinke, W. M., Stormont, M., Herman, K. C., Puri, R., & Goel, N. (2011). Supporting children's mental health in schools: Teacher perceptions of needs, roles, and barriers. *School psychology quarterly*, 26(1), 1.
- Riastini, P. N., Surya Mahayanti, N. W., Suryadarma, I. G. P., & Wangid, M. N. (2021). Barriers to Elementary School Teachers' Professional Practice: Teachers' Voice. *Ilkogretim Online*, 20(1), 1086-1097
- Sadeghi, K., Ghaderi, F., & Abdollahpour, Z. (2021). Self-reported teaching effectiveness and job satisfaction among teachers: the role of subject matter and other demographic variables. *Heliyon*, 7(6), e07193.
- Samson, J. F., & Collins, B. A. (2012). *Preparing all teachers to meet the needs of English language learners: Applying research to policy and practice for teacher effectiveness*. Center for American Progress.
- Sánchez-Cabrero, R., Estrada-Chichón, J. L., Abad-Mancheño, A., & Mañoso-Pacheco, L. (2021). Models on Teaching Effectiveness in Current Scientific Literature. *Education Sciences*, 11(8), 409.
- Silva, M. H. (2021). The relationship between managerial skills and teaching effectiveness of elementary school teachers. *International Journal of Educational Management and Development Studies*, 2(2), 1-19.
- Simonson, S. R., Earl, B., & Frary, M. (2022). Establishing a framework for assessing teaching effectiveness. *College Teaching*, 70(2), 164-180.

Steed, E. A., Shapland, D., & Leech, N. (2022). Early childhood teachers' perceptions of the effectiveness of their elementary school's approach to social emotional learning: A mixed methods study. *Early Childhood Education Journal*, 50(7), 1121-1132.