



RESEARCH PAPER

State and Politics in Pakistan: An Analysis of Economic and Political Policies from 1971 To 1977

¹Qu Qiumei* ²Li Gang

1. PhD Scholar, Department of History & Pakistan Studies, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan; Northeastern University at Qinhuangdao, Hebei, China
2. PhD Scholar, School of Distance Education & Malaysia Studies, Universiti Sains Malaysia, State of Penang, Malaysia

*Corresponding Author qqm13099841256@163.com

ABSTRACT

Economic system and policies are the backbone for the development of a country. This paper is an effort to understand the main trends and policies of economy in Pakistan, especially during Bhutto era. The most important is the nationalization of the private property to bring equality in the society with the banner and ideology of socialism. The main cause for the failure of the Islamic socialism was that it could not get enough time. Pakistan is an agricultural country the main focus of the reforms and policies during Bhutto era were related to the land and Agri-products. Nationalization of the land make good sign because with this the people who were farmers and not having any land could get their own land which could increase the production. Another reason was to end the elite culture from Pakistan. This system was abolished with the end of Bhutto's era. Qualitative interpretative method is applied for accomplishing this research study.

KEYWORDS Bhutto, Capitalism, Economy, Nationalization, Politics, Socialism

Introduction

The theme of economic development has been the talk of the town for previous five decade in the low-income countries. Economic development has been reciprocal to the other sectors like technology, construction managerial skills and administrative abilities. Pakistan people's party came into power within a short period of its establishment, which was followed by several events which have evoked the scholars and historian's attention. The political and economic situation of the country from the beginning of the remained in a pathetic condition which was partly due to maladministration and the civil and the military governments (Wolpert, 1993).

From 1947 to 1969 there was no clear way forward and a policy for the economic future of Pakistan. The economic growth per capita shows negative trend. Along with the political problems and difficulties, economy was the key issue for the new party and the government. For better governance and economic boost up, it was necessary to devise a new policy for overcoming the economic problems. Omar Noman, a leading social scientist and an economist is of opinion that Pakistan's economic evolution had committed themselves to greater state intervention even prior to Pakistan People's Party economic policies. The main project was to nationalize the public private sector enterprises, all the big companies were brought into the ownership of the public and the government of Pakistan. In 1971, with the debacle of East Pakistan the economic crisis deepened because it was almost half of Pakistan and was contributing in the economy of the country. As a preeminent economist and historian is of opinion "East Pakistan was sharing the taxes and duties to the central government which were from Rs. 15.08 crore in 1958-59 which increased till 1970 to Rs 80.42 crore (Raza, 2002).

Similarly, at the same time the West Pakistan was contributing less to the national wealth of Pakistan." Not only was this but East Pakistan growing rapidly in public and

private expenditure. The fourth five-year plan was introduced from 1970 to 1975, which was drawn against the background of this deepening crisis. The main objectives of the new plan were to increase the growth rate to 6.5 GNP and to increase per capita income and to reduce the disparity in all the regions of the country, to provide job opportunities to 75 lac people, to increase the exports to 8.5 percent, the assets and the income distribution will be on equal bases, to increase the education standard and outlay, to ensure the health facilities of the citizens and to protect them from deathly viruses like malaria and small pox, to provide homes to the poor people on low rates and approximately half a million housing units for low income groups were planned to be constructed, urbanization and environmental betterment were also part of the five-year plan. This plan was much bigger than the previous, as its size was fixed at 7500 crores. Most of the sectors of the five-year plans were left because of the separation of the East Pakistan (Gazdar, 2009).

Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto give his own new plans for the economic development and to bring stability in the economic and politics. The new government made a new perception which was created by the Bhutto and his friend Mehbub-ul-Haq. At the same time the foreign aids were reduced due to new foreign policies of new civilian government. In this paper a detailed inquiry is undertaken to understand the basic economic polies during Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto era, because there are several ambiguities in this, some of the scholars believe in this period the economic condition of Pakistan was satisfactory and was leading towards prosperity. Pakistan has a mixed economy in which there are three major contributing sector- agriculture, industry and services- the first one is the key contributor in the economy of Pakistan which is contributing 21% of GDP. The discussion above shows that the economy of Pakistan has been and is in a pathetic condition which needs a new system to revive the economy and boost up economic system. The ups and downs of the economic system and the changing policies of the governments in Pakistan, especially during the rule of Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto from 1971 to 1977 are considered to be the unique in all perspectives (Burki, 1988).

Literature Review

Qadri, and Khan, (2017) has mentioned that economy was in a particularly precarious spot when Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto came to power. The truth is that he was bombarded from every angle with complex problems. The intense cross-border tensions with India at the time caused a widespread sense of pessimism and futility in the country. Disgusting geographical inequalities and class disparity has prevailed in the economy since Field Marshal Ayub Khan's martial law regime. In order to swiftly win attention and favor from masses, Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto came up with the idea of equality and social justice by implementing policies that benefited the ordinary masses. First, he instituted a number of broad economic reforms predicated solely on the idea of nationalization (Qadri & Khan, 2017).

Burki, (1988) examined the profound and long-lasting effects of the political and economic decisions made during partition and the Bhutto era. The author has detailed the ways in which a select group of institutions helped steer the country in the correct direction and the ways in which a later clash amongst institutions led to the country's current state of paralysis. Conflict between the traditional mindset Pakistan inherited and the contemporary institutions some groups attempted to establish is a central theme of the book's analysis of Pakistan's history. Though Bhutto was an adept student of history, he failed to cater to and exploit its basic necessities when it was expected of him, as the book fairly concludes after a lengthy historical and psychological evaluation of his personality and cult. Perhaps most crucially, he could look back at the history of failed regimes that had also relied on rhetorical blunders to gain support. He lost his footing and fell from power amid fanfare, but to his dismay, his base of support did not rally to his aid. The middle-class urban elite of Pakistan, who had plotted and enabled his rise to power, ultimately brought him down (Burki,1988).

Kiran, (2015) has pointed out that Pakistan had to reinterpret some ideas and discover new approaches to cope with the difficulties during the time of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto, making that time period crucial to the country's economic and foreign policy development process. As a result of the loss of East Pakistan in 1971, Pakistan was shrunken and in need of improved policies. This paper makes an effort to investigate the function of the Cabinet Institution in formulating domestic and international policies in light of recent developments. Also analyzed is the relationship between the Prime Minister and his Cabinet in terms of economic and diplomatic policy making for Pakistan. It also investigates why Bhutto's economics-savvy cabinet was denied similar authority over the country's international relations. There was a communist monopoly on economic ministries such Finance, Economic Affairs, Industries, Commerce, and Trade until 1974, when the monopoly was broken by the right. At the same time, the Prime Minister made decisions on important foreign policy problems, particularly those involving India, without always consulting the Cabinet beforehand. This study is broken into two sections: the first discusses the Cabinet's involvement in formulating economic policy, while the second examines the Cabinet's role in formulating foreign policy. (Kiran, 2015).

Adams & Iqbal, (2019) has presented that there are numerous social, political, and economic factors that affect policymaking in developing countries. Traditionally, economists have viewed policy as an independent variable that can be modified in accordance with the results of economic study. After 1970, Pakistan underwent two major political shifts. Both resulted in substantial shifts in economic policy as a result of shifts in power. In each instance, changes in economic structure happened because of the impact of these new policies on economic activities. Different coalitions of Pakistani interests have crafted divergent policies, with varying impacts on the country's growth and exports. In the 1960s, Pakistan's government prioritized rapid industrialization by reducing its reliance on foreign imports and encouraging the country's citizens to buy and sell more finished goods abroad. Policies evolved under the leadership of a ruling elite consisting of the army officers' corps and the civil bureaucracy, supported by landlords and manufacturers (Adams & Iqbal, 2019).

Economic Models and Policies

Economic models and the policies determine the growth and development of a country. In the modern world, two main economic systems-capitalist and socialist- have been working from a long time. Capitalist economic system was generated with the establishment of the modern democratic and parliamentary form of government. With which a modern market economic system was devised according to this market economy the resources are allocated with the outcome of individual decisions utilized by producers and consumers. This system became a part of the colonial and post-colonial newly independent countries in the world. The second main economic system which came forward against capitalism was socialism and socialist economic system. The socialist system of economy production in which the goods and services are produced was the main concern. Pakistan with its establishment adopted the capitalist economic system, which was inherited from British India. From 1947 to 1970 no big changes were brought in the economic system. Zulfikar Ali Bhutto was the sole leader who believes in second type of economic system and it was one of the essential parts of the manifesto of Pakistan people's Party "socialism is our economy" (Burki, 1974).

This was very daunting task in a religious country, the rightist groups and parties reject this system as they considered it against the norms and values of Islam which was later changed to Islamic socialism. With Islamic socialism the local word was used to convince the religious groups Masawat e Muhammadi (equality). These reforms were not

only brought in the economic field, but efforts were made to bring change in society as well. All the economic and the societal changes were politically rejected and were revived during Zia ul Haq period and Islamic provisions were added in economic and other societal norms. During the Bhutto era with the theme of socialism several companies and industries were nationalized which affect the state and politics of the country, many political opponents rejects this plan. The economic policies were attached with the political system because economic policies are not simple but have complex structure of interdependence procedures and consumers which plays vital role for each other. It is seen from the history that the weak economic systems have resulted into the subjugation of the individuals and the freedom of the nation. Economically, Pakistan is still facing several problems which needs a new system to eradicate poverty, unemployment and political instability. (Chengappa, 2002).

Economic Policies and Its Politics in Pakistan from 1971 to 1977

The economic policies are the backbone of a country for the development in all sectors. Decision making and the theory are determinant which are than affected by the societal trends. According to the Shahid Javed Burki “the economic policies are related to the elite political power and all the policies revolves around it, the political elite work to maintain their power. For this purpose, both active and the passive approaches were utilized. During Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto’s era the both the approaches were utilized and the basic economic policy during this period was based on socialist theory with alteration of name, claiming it Islamic socialism. Pakistan People’s Party from the beginning has followed the directly on the policy of neglect and growth which was going on from the General Ayub Khan’s period (Sanghro & Chandio, 2019).

Economic and social outcomes in Pakistan over the last sixty years are a mixture of paradoxes. The economic growth rate has averaged 5 percent annually since 1947—a feat achieved by very few countries. Politically, however, the interplay of religious fundamentalism, sectarianism, ethnic cleavages and regional economic disparities has made the country volatile and unstable. Various East Asian countries that were behind Pakistan in the 1960s have surged far ahead in most economic and social indicators. Pakistan has thus been unable to realize its potential. Along with the economic policies the political changes were also seen due to the ideological change, Bhutto never wanted to make Pakistan government nondemocratic by introducing the presential from of government, just implemented adopted some of the patterns from the socialist ideology- economy and the society. During the Ayub era, economy was not stable which was a plus point for the new government to reject the economic policies of the time, with which Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto promised to give a new economic plan to restore the principles of distributive justice and equality for the development and prosperity of Pakistan with the banner of Islamic socialism. Bhutto’s economic policies were clear that it is due to the capitalist system in Pakistan the poor is getting poorer and the wealthy is getting wealthier. The main focus was to modernize the economic system with nationalizing the industries, insurance companies, educational institution, banks and other organizations to ensure the success and development of Pakistan in all the fields (Shafqat,1988).

From 1947 to 1970 there was lack of clear economic policies. On the political front only from 1947 to 1956 seven prime ministers were changed, then the military take over the government for almost 11 years. Due to which Pakistan remained behind form India and other regional powers. In 1970s all the products oil and the utility price shock with the droughts, floods, and withdrawal of extern. The socialist and the new economic policies were taken as new hope for the development of the country. On which the economist and social scientists are divided. Some believe that the program was good enough, but the opposition reject the economic plan and policies given by Bhutto. As an eminent Pakistani economist Ishrat Hussain mentioned that Bhutto era was the worst era for the economy, “*large-scale manufacturing sector performed very sluggishly, netting a growth rate of only 3*

percent, primarily sparked by vast public sector investment. The idea that government control of the commanding heights of the economy can best spearhead industrial growth, allocate resources and invest in the activities that it considers a priority not only failed to materialize but antagonized the private sector. The lesson learned from this experience was that good populist politics are bad for the economy." (Husain, 2009). This notion is presented by other economist as the revolutionary period in the economy of Pakistan. Still today, some of the like-minded want to apply those policies for the betterment of the economy. Pakistan has good relationship with the China presently; it is possible that it gets influence from china a make similar economic reform. (Hasan, 1998).

Nationalization and Reforms

The Pakistan people's party came to government after a short period of its establishment in 1967, within the period of four year it established its stand on the socio-economic policies. In which they reject the existing notions and economic policies as they were based on capitalist patterns and methods. Pakistan People's party was firm on the theory and on the promulgation of the socialist system in Pakistan. A new program was started to nationalize the land and the industries throughout the country in which the Punjab and Sindh were the major concerns. Within six months of coming to power through the labor reforms and land reforms of 1972 showed a different pattern for the people of Pakistan. These reforms increased the procurement prices of agricultural goods which alter the pro-industry anti-agriculture bias of the previous growth strategy (Zaidi, 2005). Before coming to power the new party made its agenda with the manifesto as they presented in public gatherings, "Islam is our Faith" "Democracy is our polity" "socialism is our economy" and "all the power belongs to people". This became the main idea to change the economic system of the country. From the beginning Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto was in dissatisfaction with the economic policies of the previous leaders and the government especially with the policies of Ayub Khan, according to several historians this was also reason that Bhutto win the elections of 1970 in West Pakistan (Zahoor, 2011).

In the beginning, the future of the economy was uncertain, it was vital for the new government to devise method for a stable economy and economic system. In this perspective, in January 1972, Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto give a framework to nationalize the ten categories of heavy industries like iron, steel, metal, and other electrical motor vehicles, tractors, basic chemicals, petrochemicals and public utilities. A new economic order of reform was given for the nationalization of the heavy industries. There were three main objectives of the reform order, firstly, decentralization of national wealth, reorganization of industrial units with the management process of the reforms, to consolidate and expand the public sector. The reforms during the Bhutto era came forward in two phases; the first wave was of the nationalization in 1972. The program was to nationalize the industries which are approximating 20% large scale manufacturing industries and similar reforms were introduced on lands, in which a small amount of land was taken from approximately 2231 big landlords of from all parts of Pakistan. The land was later distributed to the farmers according to their needs. This was a policy to bring equality in the society on the ideology of socialism, but equal society was impossible to be shaped in a western capitalist and modern democratic system. (Gustafson, 1976).

Industrial Policies and Reforms

The industrial development and growth are closely determined by the external and the internal policies. Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto wanted to eliminate the privileges enjoyed by the industrialists in Pakistan for more than 20 years. It was part of the manifesto of Pakistan people's party to bring economic equality in society. A complete plan was given for the industrial reforms and their nationalization for the self-sufficiency in capital goods. This was the continuation of the strategies to make import substitution and capital investment. (Herring, 1979).

Frist initiative was to nationalize the industries and bring them into the domain of the public sector through which the economy and the economic system could be controlled. Secondly, the industrial structure was reshaped. Before this there were more than 30 main groups in Pakistan which were running the industries of Pakistan. In 1972, 31 factors and industries were brought into the banner of the nationalization and taken over by the government. The old system of the British time was abolished (the managing agency system), with which the life insurance was nationalized. Similarly, in 1973, in the second phase the vegetable oil industries and export of cotton raw were also nationalized in which government become the owner of the industries and responsible for the export and trade. The main industries like banks, petroleum and shipping companies were nationalized in 1974. In the last phase of nationalizing the industries flour mills, rice mills and cotton gins were nationalized which were in a large quantity. This process of nationalization affects the main groups and the firms which were working also the ruling elite of Pakistan. To maintain the nationalization, scheme several changes were introduced in the economic system. The bonus voucher was abolished, due to which money was devalued from 4.76 to Rs. 11. These policies were later changed during Zia ul Haq (Badejo, 1988).

Trade system from 1971- 1977

Year	Exports	Imports	Balance
1971-1972	3,370	3495	-124
1972-1973	8561	8398	153
1973-1974	10160	13479	-3318
1974-1975	10286	20952	-10666
1975-1976	11253	20465	-9212
1976-1977	11294	23013	-11718

(Zaidi, 2005)

This table shows very different scenario, from the following records which are parts of the official papers. According to the reforms the economic would boost up but the real situation is different in the arena of trade and export the balance is seen in minus and in loss.

Agricultural and Land Reforms

Like other reforms Bhutto's agricultural and land reforms also become popular. The agrarian polices and reforms were implemented in three different phases. In the first phase of the reforms a person can hold 300 acres and no irrigated land. The second phase of reforms was started in 1975, a land tenure was set for the first time in the history of Pakistan (Esposito, 1974).

These measures were taken for the small peasants and the middle class were exempted from several taxes and land revenue. Forced labor was considered illegal. The people who were having only 12 to 25 acres of land were exempted from all the agricultural taxes. With these reforms the 7.27 million peasants were benefited. In this way the rules were more lenient for the peasants and the former classes, as for the farmers having 25 acres of irrigated and non-irrigated land and similarly irrigated or 100 acres of non-irrigated land, the add to in revenue was 50% and 100%. In the third phase in 1977, all the agricultural taxes were abolished, and the agricultural taxes were accountable to the income tax. The land from 25 to 50 was not accountable to tax and all types of investments were allowed (Herring & Chaudhry, 1974). The total land resumed and allocated along with beneficiaries are as follow from four provinces with Bhutto's reforms.

Province	Persons benefited	Area resumed	Area allocated	Balance
Punjab	3312678	242840	88428	36948
Sindh	317896	238637	79259	16497
KPk	141877	132860	9017	12639

Balochistan	515105	198295	316810	9129
Total	4287556	812632	493514	75213

(Hussain, 1989).

Ideological Transformation and Economic Development

The ideological transformation was the major cause for the reforms during Bhutto era. The economic system was reformed according to the ideology of socialism. This transformation was new for the Pakistan which was hard for Bhutto to make other members to accept. The cabinet and assembly accept the Islamic socialism. With which the economic growth rate was increased. Due to pressure group and with the end of the Bhutto era this system was mentioned as not a good omen for the economy of Pakistan. This was a shift in the foreign policy of Pakistan to make good relationship with the eastern countries (Ali, 2001).

The ideological transformation in society was hard because Pakistani society was traditional and conservative in nature. Similar approach was of the economic and political system. Bhutto wanted to eradicate feudalism from Pakistan that's why this ideological transformation was necessary to develop a new system and bring equality in society, which was one of the basic teaching of the Marxist ideology.

The growth rate from 1971 to 1977

Year	Agriculture	Large scale manufacturing	Small scale manufacturing	Wholesale and retail trade	Banking and insurance	Public administration and defense	Services	GDP
1971-2	3.5	-6.8	7.2	-0.5	0.8	6.8	5.1	1.2
1972-3	1.7	11.9	7.3	6.7	29.1	14.1	5.2	7.2
1973-4	4.2	7.5	7.3	14.9	6.4	14.8	5.4	7.7
1974-5	-2.1	-1.7	7.3	3.2	14.4	33.2	5.7	3.9
1975-6	4.5	-0.5	7.3	1.8	3.3	-3.0	5.7	3.3
1976-7	2.5	-0.2	7.3	-0.3	8.2	7.3	3.2	2.9
1971-77	2.1	1.7	7.3	4.3	10.4	12.2	5.1	4.4

(Zaidi, 2005)

The following table shows that the growth was seen in all the sectors both in the small and the big industries of Pakistan during 1971 to 1977. From 1.2 total GDP it reached at the end of the government to 4.4 which was a good omen for the economy of Pakistan but unfortunately this system could not go for long period of time as Zia ul Haq introduced his own economic system according to Islam and west (Syed, 1978)

Inflation rate in Pakistan from 1971 to 1977

With the reforms of Bhutto, the economic system did not only go up but due to new system the inflation was on its height. When Bhutto took the rein of the government in his hands the inflation was 4.69 and at the end the inflation rate was 9.24, which was not good for the economic growth.

Year	Annual rates of change in the general price level
1971-1972	4.69
1972-1973	9.7
1973-1974	29.98
1974-1975	26.73
1975-1976	11.66
1976-1977	9.24

(Raza, 2002).

Economic Policies and Performance

The economic policies which were adopted by Bhutto were just seen as an experiment like other reforms because all the policies were short lived due to which the Pakistan could not get the fruits of new system. The major polices are as follow in nutshell. The most vital and adequate in the five-year period of Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto were his economic policies (Hasan, 1998). The performance was good during that period because Pakistan People's Party was the first elected government which is can be analyzed through following table.

Year and time	Policies
20 December 1971	Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto takes over president of Pakistan.
January 1972	Public takeover of 31 large firms in 10 basic industries: iron and steel, basic metals, heavy engineering, motor-vehicle assembly and manufacture, heavy and chemicals, petrochemicals, cement and public utilities.
March 1972	Land reforms
March 1972	Management and control of 32 life insurance companies
May 1972	Banking reforms, state bank of Pakistan extends controls over schedule banks, reorienting credit policy towards small industrial entrepreneurs.
June 1972	Comprehensive labor reforms.
August 1972	Comprehensive public health program.
September 1972-september 1974	Nationalization of educational institution
January 1974	Nationalization of all private and domestically, owned banks.
August 1976	Cotton ginning, rice husking and flour milling nationalization.

(Zaidi, 2005)

Conclusion

A nation can only progress so far without sound economic policy. Pakistan has served as a testing ground for many new ideas and practices. The economy of Pakistan remains unstable. From 1947 to 1970, British India's economic policies mostly followed their pre-independence tendencies. The policies and fashions of Bhutto's era were groundbreaking. In economic terms, it was a transition from capitalism to socialism. While both the political and economic systems in South Asia go against Islamic teachings, the capitalist system is widely used and well accepted throughout all sectors of Pakistan. This congregation is opposed to Bhutto's new socialist agenda. It was then renamed "Islamic socialism" by Bhutto. Many previously privately owned assets were taken over by the government. All of these changes were made to ensure that members of the working class and the lower classes were afforded the same rights as everyone else in society. Due to the immaturity of the institution, the elite culture of Pakistan could not be eradicated by these changes. Following the death of Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto, Zai ul Haq dismantled the new Islamic socialist system he had established, claiming that it was incompatible with Islamic principles. Until a new economic policy is implemented, the fate of Pakistan and its people will not be altered. Bhutto's government and system might have produced

desirable outcomes if given more time to do so. Pakistan's economy is still in a sorry state, and the government should take notice in order to implement effective strategies for its improvement. Chinese economic growth is currently the worlds fastest. Pakistan can improve its economy by adopting new policies, which is crucial in today's chaotic world. The political unpredictability of Pakistan ultimately doomed Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto's efforts. An expanding and secure economy requires both domestic and international political stability.

References

- Badejo, B. A. (1988). Bhutto and the PPP's Socialism? *India Quarterly*, 44(3-4), 240-252.
- Burki, S. J. (1974). Politics of Economic Decision-making during the Bhutto Period. *Asian Survey*, 14(12), 1126-1140.
- Burki, S. J. (1988). *Pakistan under Bhutto, 1971-1977*. London, Springer.
- Chengappa, B. M. (2002). Pakistan: impact of Islamic socialism. *Strategic Analysis*, 26(1), 27-47.
- Esposito, B. J. (1974). The politics of agrarian reform in Pakistan. *Asian Survey*, 14(5), 429-438.
- Gazdar, H. (2009). The fourth round, and why they fight on: An essay on the history of land and reform in Pakistan. *PANOS South Asia, Collective for Social Science Research, Karachi*.
- Gustafson, W. E. (1976). Economic problems of Pakistan under Bhutto. *Asian Survey*, 16(4), 364-380.
- Hasan, P. (1998). *Pakistan's economy at the crossroads: Past policies and present imperatives*. Oxford University Press, USA.
- Herring, R. J. (1979). Zulfikar Ali Bhutto and the "eradication of feudalism" in Pakistan. *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 21(4), 519-557.
- Herring, R., & Chaudhry, M. G. (1974). The 1972 land reforms in Pakistan and their economic implications: A preliminary analysis. *The Pakistan Development Review*, 13(3), 245-279.
- Husain, I. (2009). The role of politics in Pakistan's Economy. *Journal of International Affairs*, 63(1), 1-18
- Hussain, A. (1989). Pakistan: Land Reforms Reconsidered. *South Asia*, eds. H. Alavi and J. Harriss. London: Macmillan, 59-69.
- Kiran, N. (2015). ZA Bhutto's Cabinet: A Study of Its Role in Formulation of Economic and Foreign Policy, 1971-1977. *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan*, 52(2), 133-152.
- Adams, J., & Iqbal, S. (2019). *Exports, Politics, and Economic Development: Pakistan 1970-1982*. Routledge.
- Qadri, S., & Khan, S. S. (2017). A Critical Assessment of ZA Bhutto's Policies (1973-1977). *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 7(10), 1-8.
- Raza, R. (2002). *Pakistan in Perspective: 1947-1997*. Oxford University Press.
- Sanghro, R. R., & Chandio, J. A. (2019). Emerging the concept of Islamic Socialism in Pakistan: Historical analysis on political debates of 1970-1971 election campaign. *Journal of History Culture and Art Research*, 8(2), 51-61.
- Shafqat, S. (1988). Public Policy and Reform in Pakistan 1971-77: An Analysis of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto's Socio-Economic Policies. *Journal of South Asian and Middle Eastern Studies*, 11(3), 37.

- Syed, A. H. (1978). ZA Bhutto's self-characterizations and Pakistani political culture. *Asian Survey*, 18(12), 1250-1266.
- Wolpert, S. A. (1993). *Zulfi Bhutto of Pakistan: His life and times*. Oxford University Press, USA.
- Zahoor, M. A. (2011). A Critical Appraisal of the Economic Reforms under Zulfikar Ali Bhutto: An Assessment. *Pakistan Journal of History and Culture*, 32(1), 144-45.
- Zaidi, S. A. (2005). Issues in Pakistan's economy. *OUP Catalogue*, pp 105-106