



RESEARCH PAPER

Fall of Kabul: A Critical Analysis of The Failure of the American's Liberal Norms

¹Fazal Elahi Bilal* ²Muhammad Akif Rashid ³Rashida Abbas

1. Ph. D. Scholar (International Relations), School of Integrated Social Sciences the University of Lahore, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan
2. Ph. D. Scholar (International Relations), School of Integrated Social Sciences the University of Lahore, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan
3. Ph. D. Scholar (International Relations), School of Integrated Social Sciences the University of Lahore, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan

PAPER INFO	ABSTRACT
Received: March 19, 2022 Accepted: June 25, 2022 Online: June 27, 2022	The objective of the study is to examine the degree of failure factors of the phenomena of American Liberal norms in Afghanistan. Under the backdrop of the Doha agreement on 15 August 2021, the fall of Kabul accrued, Taliban entered Kabul without confrontation from the Afghan military forces. A qualitative method for in-depth analysis was employed, using questionnaire technique. America spending almost a trillion dollars, two decades presence with more than seven lac allied military forces, failed to cultivate liberal values in afghan society. This study concludes that neither liberal norms/ values nor did the democratic process take roots because, values were superficial, creating synthetic, and engineered civil society. Hence, the Free Market economy neither has benefits for the grass root level nor provides sustainable development. This study recommends that Liberal norms should always be introduced in its true sense, keeping in view of the native culture, traditions as well as its compatibility.
Keywords: Culture Ideology, Peace, Tribal Society, Values	
*Corresponding Author: bilalkemu3@gmail.com	

Introduction

Doha agreement famous as “an agreement bringing peace in Afghanistan” was signed on 29th Feb 2020 between the Taliban and the USA for the end of the war. Initially, the American Intelligence agency reported that Kabul might fall at least within 90 days but later on, keeping in view of the advancement of the Taliban's forces, reported that it might take one week and eventually Taliban entered Kabul without any resistance from the Afghan 'national Army as Ashraf Ghani ' Government surrendered it peacefully. Before deconstructing the failure of American's liberal norms, as normally associated with freedom of expression, press, speech, religion, individualism, democratic values, human rights, free-market economy, foreign direct investment, etc. However, in the context of Afghanistan, such norms /values were not applied in their true sense. (Muzaffar, et. al 2020) & (Muzaffar. et. al, 2019)

First of all, there is the debate that is America introduced the true norms or otherwise? The majority of the respondents mentioned, that America had introduced a sub-standard archetypal of liberalism, which America applies in its own Country, which is the core and essential component of American society. It is a delusion form of liberalism. Before examining the Afghanistan issue, this study also provides a historical background with critical analysis that how and why Liberal peace / Democratic peace didn't work in Iraq and Libya as in both counties, The US and NATO-led alliances declared an alleged controversy of mass destruction weapons & Civil war phenomena. However, in both cases, despite the

introduction of Democracy and liberal norms, the situation gets worse and today it's considered that Iraq and Libya both are more vulnerable, de-stable, and unsafe (Muzaffar. et. al, 2021).

Democracy is an important feature of liberalism, but in the case of Afghanistan, there is an illusion of Western democracy or so-called democracy. First with President Hamid Karzai and then with Ashraf Ghani, both are pro-American. Afghanistan faced a continuous war and defeated three superpowers invaded first in 1919 Britain second in 1991 the Soviet Union and now America in 2021 along with intra- afghan war from time to time between afghan war loads. After 9/11 under the American attack, militancy, extremism & violence increased and this phenomenon acted destabilization and intolerance in the society. Under such kinds of circumstances concept of peace and corporation looks irrelevant.

Another Liberal value is the free market economy neither it's beneficial for the grass root level nor provides sustainable development. The world witnessed financial benefits only in Kabul and a few cities where American forces were based (main provinces & Cities e.g. Kabul, Kandahar, Herat, Maze e Sharif, etc.) rests of the Provinces and area were highly neglected and it's too behind in the race of free trade and a free-market economy. They didn't avail the benefits of this liberal norms/ values in their true sense. As far as financial matters, Americans mostly operate and exercise through NGOs and MNCs and these organizations were accountable only to the donors and American's treasury it's neither answerable & accountable to Afghanistan's Government/ Political setup nor the people of Afghanistan.

There were no individual rights and liberty to the opposition, Taliban and other fighter group, etc. Hence America didn't apply and given rights in its true sense. Afghanistan is a tribal and ethnic society consisting of Pashtun, Tajik, Uzbek, Hazara, etc. with a 99.7% Muslim population. Being a conservative as well as a religious society their culture, traditions, norms, and customs based on Islam and America's liberal norms/ values didn't compatible with the existing society. Worse conditions of human rights were witnessed in Afghanistan during the American occupation, particularly in the case of Guantanamo person camp and Bigram airbase prison. As far as Freedom of Speech, press, and expression were limited. Religious and spiritual beliefs were also controlled. American and allied forces crushed the opponent's voice and stance. American and Western Media didn't highlight the restriction on speech, press ad expression. It portrays and reflects the one-way story and is not given another side of the picture. There is a clear mistruth and reservations about the American liberal norms in Afghanistan.

Literature Review

Fall of Kabul: A critical analysis of the failure of the American's liberal norms is a new marvel which currently occurred on 15th August 2021, however, since its occurrence, the event getting acknowledgment all over the world. Substantive academic & research work on America's failure in Afghanistan has been produced nationally & internationally through research articles, book chapters, investigative reports, etc. at the individual and institutional levels, owing to the significance & gravity of the phenomenon. Said academic work highlighting the several characteristics of the American's failure in the context of military, strategic and foreign policy domain. But yet to be, on Liberals norms/ values failure domain/spectrum.

It has been observed that nobody could have foreseen the profoundly illiberal strategies that would be embraced by the USA to deal with the menace of al-Qaeda and its associated allies. Such practices were observed in the Abu Ghraib and Guantanamo Bay scandals. (Singh, 2015). That America allegedly established a controlled

Government, in Afghanistan and engineered civil society, and gave funds to NGOs to hold workshops, and seminars on liberal values and to create an artificial civil society. Omer Sadar, Prof. of political science at American University pointed out that America through funding created an engineered, synthetic and artificial civil society as the new civil society was not organic. They were accountable only to the donors rather than Afghanistan. (Mehrdad, 2021). The last 50 years of western economies have roots in imperial exploitation but if the US military can be beaten then it can't be ruled the global market. He said that at present there is a debate that whether neoliberalism is dying or changing. In G7 countries also agreed on a global minimum corporation tax, which encouraged the economic experts to say that the elite consensus that neoliberalism is gone. (Rasmsay, 2021).

While the US might have been able to better manage its withdrawal from Afghanistan, the catastrophe which occurred this month goes back 20 years. From the beginning, America and its allies have adopted and never reconsidered a top-down strategy to strengthen the state that has always been doomed to failure. (Ecemoglu, Aug 20, 2021). The U.S.-Taliban agreement does not guarantee a sense of lasting peace in Afghanistan, but it is an important step in facilitating the United States' exit from the country. However, there are still a lot of questions about what the U.S. Government has committed to do and how it will monitor whether the Taliban is abiding by the end of the agreement. The Trump administration has agreed to withdraw American troops from Afghanistan and to cancel the sanctions imposed on the Taliban leaders by the end of August. Whether the negotiations in Afghanistan are going ahead, in exchange for a number of commitments from the Taliban. (Thrid, 2020)

Of course, there have been bound assumptions underpinning this stance, together with the notion that liberalism and democracy square measure universal values still because of the belief that us was the world's sole world power, best placed to defend these values. This successively was predicated upon the deeply control political belief that in securing its national interests we would, as before, even be enhancing international security. There's little question that inexplicit democracy promotion was a strategic (some would argue even imperialistic) imperative, but there was additionally a traditionally frozen, normative sense of rightness and superiority evident within the discourse. (Singh R., Mar. 2015). In the context of America's withdrawal from Asian nations and the failure of the govt. to handle the socio-economic challenges the individuals face within the society. Once the state fails as a constitutional and institutional device to satisfy these challenges, falling into the hands of the Taliban that provides higher economic prospects will become an accomplishment. Then the devil is well known within sociology. The stranglehold of America on the Taliban appears to be waning with its call to withdraw and involvement of the Taliban. (Gaan, 2015).

What is true in associate degree extreme kind for RAND is additionally true for Liberal Peace building additional usually. A universal guide for proper and property state-society relations is applied to the targets of intervention, no matter the historical, political, and economic specificities of every individual case. The units of associate degree lies of study of research that offer each liberalism as associate degree ideology and Liberal Peace building as an ideological follow their coherence area unit themselves believed to be universal in their pertinence. For liberalism, individual rationality is universal, pre-existing in the state and any society a person might realize themselves at intervals. The market, therefore, becomes a present mechanism through that people move to maximize their utility. (Dodge, 2013). Operating at intervals this abstract framework, 2 presidential administrations have tried unable to alter the realities of governance in Asian countries resolutely within the United States' favor. Blemished assumptions regarding "ungoverned" areas have vied a vital role in the American's failure to conclude the war with success. (Roberts, Winter-Spring 2006). Since the Taliban began its rule, humanitarian

nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) and therefore the United Nations have had to grapple with the gender policies of the new regime and judge whether or not to still operate in Asian countries, and if thus on what terms. At present, the United Nations is maintaining a large-scale operation in an Asian country, having allotted some \$100 million of humanitarian help in 1998 or regarding 1/2 of the whole humanitarian aid to an Asian country, the remainder being provided by NGOs. (Verdirame, 2001)

As we've seen, America's postwar grand strategy has systematically targeted supporting and promoting the liberal order when the precise nature and degree of that support have evolved over time. This approach of modification, debate, and adaptation at intervals of continuity has been a good framework for selection in U.S. grand strategy thus far; it represents a helpful framework for selection moving forward furthermore. (American Grand Strategy and therefore the Liberal Order: Continuity, Change, and choices for the longer term, 2016). It is an additional pragmatic approach that seeks to figure with realities on the bottom instead of around or on top of them and engages a large spectrum of actors outside of the liberal- or Western-oriented category. This new model, remarked here because the post-liberal model has nevertheless to be totally elaborate, however it's conceptualized with the imperative in mind that state-building policies should be infinitely versatile and pliable looking on social circumstances and conditions. (Sedra, Finding Innovation in State-building: Moving on the far side the Orthodox Liberal Model, 06/2012))

Political parties in Afghanistan have their origins within the mobilization of the constitutionalist movement of the first although development into the organizations of these days was neither easy nor linear.¹ tea of discontent youth surfaced con to the reign of Amanullah Khan (1919–29) and to serial constitutional governments. These teams enclosed the Afghans & Indian, or Young Afghans, United Nations agency pushed for constitutional reform on the Young Turks movement in up-to-date Turkey. Much later, within the Forties, the Wesh Dzalmian movement headed an additional general opposition to the ruling elite. Underneath the post of Daoud Khan within the Fifties, opposition teams were forced underground however continued to fulfill to debate and publish different views on the Afghan form of government (Larson, 2015) & (Muzaffar. et. al, 2021)

To make an analysis of America's liberal norms in Afghanistan caused of fall of Kabul? : In the progression, evolution & conduction of the aforementioned existing literature review, its recognition & strengthen my stance that there is a gap that needs to be addressed/ filled through "Has America introduced liberal norms in Afghanistan" Although, on Military, strategic, and foreign policy failures in Afghanistan subject has been the focus of attention and plenty of work is available in the form of articles, books, reports, etc. by the scholars, policymakers, policymakers, and political & strategic analysts. However, no major academic work on Fall of Kabul: A critical analysis of the failure of the American's liberal norms, there is a gap in the mainstream of intellectual work in Military, Financial as well as Strategic failure, there is a to work in Liberal norms/ values domain/ prospects which will address

Material and Methods

Being a strong believer in the traditional approach of the qualitative research method, which will be utilized for the study to provide in-depth & explanatory information through the questionnaire technique. Qualitative research is applied to probe Fall of Kabul: A critical analysis of the failure of the American's liberal norms, to conduct this study Academia, Administration/ Management, Afghan students, Masses, etc. were selected for questionnaire. Choosing the adequate information collection technique and methodology could be a key to assembling desired data and consequently building effective analysis. Both Primary and Secondary sources are also utilized. Questionnaires' technique was employed for information collection, and seven themes emerged throughout the thematic analysis of

the information collected during this study. MS Word has been used to manage and organize the abovementioned themes.

The targeted group for the questionnaire.

Participant's code	Organization	Professional Experience
P 1	Academia	5-20
P 3	Administration/ Management	10-18
P5	Afghan Students	Under & post graduate
P6	Masses	-----

Results and Discussion

After careful understanding and analysis of answers reference to make an analysis of American's liberal norms in Afghanistan caused of fall of Kabul; seven themes emerged: 1) America introduced a sub-standard model of liberal norms, 2) Afghan tribal culture is a hurdle, Ethnic divide, Afghanistan not a nation-state, Conservative society, 3) So-called democracy, Weak political parties, Lack of mass participation, Weak reconciliation, Weak Writ of the afghan's Government, 4) Accountable only to the donors rather than Afghans people, The new civil society was not organic, 5) Fundamental rights (Freedom of speech, expression, etc.), Mass displacement, Target killing of political leaders, journalists, etc., 6) Taliban constant threat to Afghanistan & US forces, 7) Mistrust. The participants shared a variety of responses.

Questionnaire

Fall of Kabul: A critical analysis of the failure of the American's liberal norms	Has America brought true Liberal norms to Afghanistan	America introduced a sub-standard model of liberal norms
	Do you think that Afghan tribal, ethnic & Conservative societies fail to adjust to liberal norms?	Afghan tribal culture is a hurdle, Ethnic divide, Afghanistan is not a nation-state, Conservative society,
	Norms didn't get roots because of weak political culture, deteriorating the liberal scenario in Afghanistan	The illusion of American/ Western democracy, So-called democracy, Weak political parties, Lack of mass participation, Weak reconciliation, Weak Writ of the Afghan Government
	Liberal values being a business in Afghanistan	Accountable only to the donors rather than the Aghan people, The new civil society was not organic
	Do American human rights violations trigger the non-acceptance of such norms?	Fundamental rights (Freedom of speech, expression, etc.), Mass displacement, extrajudicial killing of political leaders, etc.
	How does weaker Afghan Government writ affect the liberal scenario	Writ of Afghan Government only to the main Cities caused the failure of liberal culture, Taliban constant threat to Afghanistan & US forces, Mistrust

Before opening the debate on the Afghanistan scenario, this study will provide a historical perspective of the Iraq and Libya cases wherein America and its allies after a military intervention, introduced democracy and political culture, under the Liberal peace theory (Immanuel Kant) which emphasized that liberal democratic governments are less willing to launch a war against each other. However, in both cases, it has been witnessed that in Iraq and Libya, this approach didn't fully succeed.

Iraq Case

In 2003, USA and United Kingdom declared war against Iraq without the consent and the approval of the Security Council, coalition forces claimed that Saddam Hussain's Government in Iraq hardly mass destruction weapons which is a threat to the US and world peace and within a short period of three weeks, coalition forces capture the control of Iraq. Coalition forces were belief believed that it was necessary for world peace to dislodge Saddam Hussain from Iraq as these mass destruction weapons can be helpful to Islamic extremists, terrorists, and jihadist groups. Although later on it was revealed, that the Coalitions claim was self-constructive and had no reality and evidence of mass destruction weapons. However, the US adopted a liberal stance and established a Political structure introducing Democracy and elections in 2005, 2009, 2010, 2013, 2018, and 2021. The US provides a democratic system to the people of Iraq and also several other liberal norms & values.

However, In the Iraq case, it has been observed that neither the democratic system nor core liberal norms & values paid off and since 1st May 2003, significant deterioration has been witnessed in law & order, security, and political & economic fronts. Several intellectuals, thinkers, security & strategic experts were of the opinion that the Iraq of Saddam Hussain was much more peaceful and safe rather than today. So we can understand that the liberal peace theory didn't work because of several factors.

Libya Case

In March 2011, coalition forces led by NATO, intervene Libya under the 1973 resolution of the UN Security Council as the civil war on its peak in Libya in continuation of the Arab Spring after [Tunisia](#) and [Egypt](#). As a result of NATO, Muammar Gaddafi's authoritarian regime in Libya came to an end. Subsequently, America and its allies launched a military operation with airstrikes from 2015 to 2019 to protect and safeguard Libya from ISIS control. , Later on under interim Government facilitated an election scheduled in 2022. Unfortunately, again in Libya it, has been observed like in Iraq that peace and security landscape has further deteriorated. In contemporary Libya, Human life, peace and stability are more vulnerable than Col. Muammar Gaddafi's regime. So it's evident that both Iraq and Libya cases despite of US Liberal peace initiatives, peace and security worse rather than improved.

In the light of depicted above participants shard's responses, we will study how and why America's liberal norms/ values failed in Afghanistan despite of 20 years presence.

Sub-Standard archetypal of Liberal Norms/ values

Respondents were of the opinion that America really brings an original & true liberal model to Afghanistan? Which is the core and essential component of American and western's society. They were considered that Americans introduced/ given sub-standard archetypal liberal norms/ values.

Accountable only to the donors rather than the Afghan people, the new civil society was not organic

One of the Liberal norm/ value of the free trade market economy didn't take roots in Afghan society because America's free trade market economy factors in Afghanistan was highly superficial. Moreover, Afghan society is a religious society with 99.7% Muslim dominion, Reba is prohibited/ banned in Islam. However, entire American banking, financial set-up & policies are based on Interest System. The market economy in Afghanistan neither it's beneficial for the grass root level nor provides sustainable development. Omer Sadar, Prof. of political science at American University pointed out that

America through NGOs/ MNC, funding created an engineered, synthetic and artificial civil society, accountable to donors instead of the Afghan government or people. The world witnessed financial benefits only in Kabul and a few cities where American and allied forces were based, the rest of the Provinces and areas were highly neglected and it's too backward in the race of development, progress, prosperity, and benefits.

Political Governance/ illusion, So-called Democracy

Democracy is an important / core feature of liberalism, but in the case of Afghanistan there is an illusion of American/ Western democracy or so-called democracy, first with President Hamid Karzai and then with Ashraf Ghani, both are pro-American. Such democracy never serves people's interests and inflicts it's sever to their maters. Neither democracy fulfill the aspirations of the common people nor create a political culture which normally associated with American democracy. Allegedly America established an engineering civil society and gave funds to NGOs to hold workshops, and seminars and to create an artificial civil society. The term Democracy is normally associated with Democratic Peace theory which is a European concept that's why the Afghan people didn't recognize this approach/ form of governance. Moreover, freedom and individualism under the democratic system didn't match with afghan culture and tribal values.

Afghan tribal, multi-ethnic, multi-linguistic, and conservative society

Afghanistan is a tribal and ethnic society consisting of Pashtun, Tajik, Uzbek, hazara etc. Being a conservative religious society their cultures, traditions, norms, and customs are based on Islam. There is no space for secularism, co-education, and female representation in various fields of life. The US failed to establish the liberal norms in Afghanistan generally due to a multiethnic, mostly tribal as well as conservative society and particularly a rigid religious society. Afghanistan could be a massive, inland country in South Asia and is home to a variety of various ethnic teams, languages, religions, and cultures. The population of the state consists of different ethno linguistic groups. There are three largest ethnic groups are the Pashtuns, the Tajiks, and therefore the Hazaras. The Pashtuns are the most important grouping and are thought-about politically powerful. American liberal's norms/values are never compatible with their existing system notably within the presence of an orthodox "Pashtunwali" tradition, a conventional life vogue, and a code of honor. Liberal norms should always be introduced & implemented in its true sense, keeping in view of the native culture, traditions as well as its compatibility.

Never Nation State

Historically Afghanistan hardly remained a nation-state, except during Ahmad Shah Durrani in 1747, and after that, Afghans never claimed a nation-state because of fragmentation, disintegration, and ethnic, and tribal structure. The tribal Heads, warlords, and common Afghans believed that America came to Afghanistan to weaken the Afghan Culture, its traditions, customs and Islamic Values which is one of the hurdles to build a nation-state

Human Right Violations

Most of the respondents were of the opinion that worse conditions of human rights were witnessed /observed in Afghanistan during America's presence, particularly in the cases of Guantanamo person camp & Batgram air-base prison, etc. Afghan security forces are defendants committing grave human rights violations like implemented disappearances, illegal killings, and torture of suspected terrorists. This was accomplished through a mix of extremist readings of shariah law and Pashtun social group customs, the severe repression of individual freedom, and human rights violations on a vast scale. The

deteriorating security scenario and regular terror incidents provoke civilians in numerous areas to panic the Afghan people, whose recollections of systematic and generalized human rights violations, atrocities, and oppression.

Freedom of Expression, speech, press, etc.

As so much as Freedom of Speech, press, faith, and expression was controlled. America and allied for the crushed opponent's voice and stance. America and Western Media didn't highlight the restriction on speech, press ad expression.

Weak political culture

Afghanistan's form of government ought to be established as its own, involving associate actual and perceived decrease within the extent of foreign influence this can be extremely problematic for a variety of reasons, together with Afghanistan's aid dependency twentieth-century century history of reliance on deals with neighboring and alternative countries to get financial gain. As per a recent study, the issue of "ownership" rising issue of the declared dislike among respondents for "American culture" and also the potential threat it poses to "Afghan culture," ancient norms, or values associated with a Moslem identity. The associate urban-rural divide is emphasized here, therein Kabul town has historically been seen by non-Kabul residents as a middle for immorality and alter. However, "American values" area units are typically mixed or used synonymously with the concept of modernization; it's so troublesome to see that area unit rejected completely as un-Islamic, and that might be accepted given time and given the departure of foreign "imperialist" forces.

Lack of mass participation

Poor security conditions, constant attack of Taliban, weak political writ, and insecurity factors caused less participation in the electoral system of Afghanistan. One of the major reasons was the weak Election Commission, poor registration process, mismanagement, and bad governance, inadequate training of election staff particularly the female staff deployed on election stations. Another reason was scattered and long-distance election stations. The tribal system was another reason as in most Provinces Jirga or tribal heads didn't allow females to cast the vote.

Weak Writ of the Afghan Government

It was evident that Afghanistan's Government political and judicial writ solely to the extent of capital and few provinces wherever the America and allied forces were deployed, rest of Provinces and area were extremely unsafe, ungoverned and neglected and there's no Government political and judicial writ what therefore ever, significantly that areas/regions where Taliban and insurgents remained active and effective. The weakness of Afghanistan's political Government, democratic establishments, and therefore the absence of rule of law within the country, change the Taliban to gift themselves as another political/military force. Supported the rule of law, and protected the human rights of all Afghan people. One more reason why the Afghan Government did not establish its political and judicial writ was a semi-war continued by varied Taliban leaders from time to time resisted the Political Government also as America & alliance forces.

Conclusion

This study highlighted the American Liberal norms/ values, didn't get roots because of several reasons, particularly in the historical perspective of Iraq and Libya wherein the democratic process and liberal norms phenomena didn't pay off as both counties are more vulnerable than saddam Hussain & Muammar Gaddafi's regime. First, America didn't

employ the original Liberal archetypal, which was considered a core and essential component of American society, and acutely it was a delusion form of liberalism. Secondly, democracy in Afghanistan is an illusion of American democracy. America established a Pro-Government and engineering civil society, through NGOs and MNCs funding, created a synthetic and artificial civil society that was not organic, accountable to the donors rather instead to the Afghan people, neither beneficial for the welfare of gross root nor sustainable development. Third, being a multi-ethnic, multi-linguistic, tribal, conservative, and rigid religious society, as well as cultures, traditions, (Pashtunwali) norms, and customs, America's liberal norms/ values, were not compatible with the existing society. No space for secularism, interest-based economy, co-education, and female representation in various segments of life. Human rights violations were also witnessed/ observed in Afghanistan, particularly in the cases of Guantanamo person camp, batgram air-based prison, forced disappearances, extrajudicial killings, and torture of suspected terrorists. Fourth, As far as Freedom of Speech, press, religion, and expression were controlled. Fifth, afghan supposed that America's liberal norms/ values/ culture potential threat it poses to "Afghan culture," (Pashtunwali) traditional norms or values, and Islamic identity, there is a clear mistruth and reservations on the American liberal norms and values in Afghanistan. Sixth, Poor security conditions, in most Afghan parts, Taliban's attacks and its associated allies rebellious militants, led to non-participation in the political process particularly, female participation in elections /voting, suspension of civic education programs, and voter registration efforts. As a whole, America's liberal norms/ values didn't get root in Afghan society on the aforementioned dynamics. This study further recommends that Liberal norms should always be introduced & implemented in its true sense, keeping in view of the native culture, traditions as well as its compatibility otherwise its consequences will not be appropriate.

References

- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3(2), 77–101.
- Creswell, J. W. (2013). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches* (4th ed.). Sage publications
- Dodge, T. (December 2013). Intervention and dreams of exogenous statebuilding: the application of Liberal Peacebuilding in Afghanistan. *Review of International Studies*, 39(5)
- Ecemoglu, D. (2021). *A top down state- buliding strategy*. USA: MIT publisher
- Gaan, N. (2015,). Youth Bulge: Constraining and Reshaping Transition to Liberal Democracy in. *India Quarterly*, 71(1) 16-36.
- Larson, A. (2015). *Political Parties in Afghanistan*. USA: US Institute of Peace.
- Mehrdad, E. (2021, April 6). How liberal values become a busniess in Afhanistan. *Foreign policy*
- Muzaffar, M., Khan, I. & Yaseen, Z. (2019). End Game or a New Great Game? Indo-Pakistan Rivalry and Post Withdrawal Afghanistan, *Asian Journal of International Peace & Security (AJIPS)*, 3, 1-11
- Muzaffar, M., Nawab, W., & Yaseen, Z. (2021). The US Exit from Afghanistan: A Way Forward, *Journal of Development and Social Sciences*, 2(2), 30-41
- Muzaffar, M., Shah, S.T.A., & Yaseen, Z. (2020). US Taliban Dhoha Accord: A Compromise, *Journal of Development and Social Sciences*, 1 (2), 32-42
- Muzaffar, M., Yaseen, Z., & Afzal, N. (2021). US Exit from Afghanistan: Impacts on Pakistan and India, *Journal of Political Studies*, 28, (2), 55–68
- Rasmsay, A. (2021, August, 17). US Defeat in Afghanistan marks the end of neoliberalism, *Open Democracy*
- Roberts, G. (2006). Here be Dragons: Ungoverned Spaces on land and Sea. *The SAIS Review International Affairs*, 71 (2)
- Sedra, M. (2012). Finding Innovation in State-building: Moving Beyond the Orthodox Liberal Model. *PRISM* 3(3) 47-62.
- Singh, R. (2015). 'Defensive Liberal Wars': The Global war on terror and return of illiberalism in American Liberal foreign Policy. *Rev. Sociol. Polit.*, 23(53), 99-120
- Thrid, W. (2020, August 21). Country Brief: Afghanistan. *Review Politics and analysis*
- Verdirame, G. (Aug 2001,). Testing the Effectiveness of International Norms: UN Humanitarian Assistance and Sexual Apartheid in Afghanistan. *Human Rights Quarterly* 23(3), 773-768.
- Yin, R. K. (2014). *Case study research: Design and methods (applied social research methods)*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage publications.