



RESEARCH PAPER

A Comparative Analysis of Public Service Recruitment Criteria: Early Islamic Public Administration VS Pakistan's Public Administration

¹Syeda Lalarukh and ² Dr. Ghalib Ata

1. PhD Scholar, Institute of Administrative Sciences, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan
2. Assistant Professor, Institute of Administrative Sciences, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan

***Corresponding Author:** chiquititaslr@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

This study reveals an in-depth comparative analysis of public service recruitment criteria between early Islamic Public administration Pakistan's and current public administration. With rise in colonialism in 18th century, Islamic empire began to shrink. In reaction, the interest in Islamic principles of governance within modern frameworks took a revival with various political and economic challenges. A critical review of the two foundational texts outlines core Islamic recruitment system of public servants (civil service not named then) extracted from narrations is found in the text. For Pakistan, government manuals and articles have been researched. The comparison identifies Islamic system being established on Amanah, ethics and accountability through active public involvement. Western practices prioritize merit-based system and competence towards their systemic objectives. Pakistan appears as a hybrid system of both Islamic and Western, inclining for the deep-rooted colonial practices of bureaucracy. Muslim countries can use these ideological, systemic and individual factors to revitalize moral components for recruitment in governance.

KEYWORDS

Islamic Public Administration, Recruitment, Merit-Based System, Ethics, Religion, Philosophy, Orientation, Colonialism

Introduction

Researchers are exploring alternate systems of public administration to better serve the public interests. The source of Non-Western Public Administration (NWPA) is usually associated to indigenous solutions offered by various civilizations in the past. In such cases it is vital to have a look at the overall ideology towards life for a particular civilization as it emanates from their basic decisions regarding public administration. Recruitment criterion of public servants, in every civilization is bound to reflect the aspirations and higher ideals that the people sought through their governance structure.

Derived from the Western democracies, the recruitment process focuses on a highly rule bound, technical capability criteria, adding predictability to individual action that remain otherwise adaptable towards any possible complexities (Raadschelders & Sanders, 2024). A huge assumption behind the selection of the most qualified individuals is that they can excel in every sphere of life with as much perfection and efficiency as they have done during their educational carriers. These factors such as, the educational background, certifications, years of experience, technical and vocational skills, and a balanced mindset that raises fewer conflicts. Personal biasness in recruitment process is controlled through standardization and built-in features of fairness in the process of public service recruitment in the US and UK (Raadschelders & Sanders, 2024). But these indicators do not ensure presence of morality, justice and honesty, in recent years, these moral attributes have gained more significance in WPA. Unfair appointments in developing countries in recruitment and placement of public servants ignore the role of ethics as it is difficult to measure the practical implications of using such a screening criteria (Drishti Publications, 2024).

Islamic system of public administration offers a much contrasting perspective to the variety of modern-day recruitment criteria. Governance is a duty in Islam not confined to the state, rather it is a “religious responsibility” based on psychological values of morals and ethical integrity to provide for the public and uphold justice when dealing with the public affairs. Islamic principles view public servants accountable not only to the community, but also to Allah in the life hereafter. This scope challenges the traditional approach and requires character as prerequisite for efficient governance.

Literature Review

In the administrative mechanism of a state, the term “Civil Service” refers to non-judicial and non-military personnel that execute laws, implement policies, and deliver public services. The earliest origin of administrative structures for public service delivery such as, water distribution, land registration, and collection of taxes is attributed to the ancient Egyptian and Chinese civilizations which were later adopted by the rest of the world, starting from Europe. Emergence of modern civil service carries a thick taint of reforms carried out in Britain, Prussia, and France, concentrating on limiting personal biases in recruitment process. This includes the “Northcote Trevelyan Report” of 1854 in UK separating administrative roles from political patronage and “Pendleton Act of 1883,” for US federal civil service, abolishing “spoils system” in recruitment (Galnoor & Oser, 2015). Contrarily, in non-democratic nations political and administrative functions operate under ruler's power. Standardized selection of individuals irrespective of changes in the government is more of a democratic norm (Madsen, 2024). Managing political neutrality in public servants is still a contested area (Cooper 2020; Sweeting & Haupt 2024). Similarly, selfishness and greed in human nature is managed through accountability and impartiality at systemic level (Imtiaz, 2013). Further passing of ‘Civil Service Act’ has upgraded civil service from an employment contract to a “public law,” restricting frequent changes in qualifications and capabilities of civil servants (Cardona, 2024).

Rising cost of governance in the twentieth century paved the way for New Public Management framework, emphasizing efficiency in public service delivery, decentralization, and privatization (Lapiente & Van De Walle, 2020). In developing countries are counterproductive due to political appointments creating inefficiencies, consequently, integration of political, cultural, and historical contexts are strongly advocated (Shepherd, 2003). System's rules, training, and even organizational culture are the determinants of morality and ethics in the recruitment process (Äijälä, 2000). Ignoring ethics is attributed to economic and political pressures for recruiting candidates who can execute decisions without argument (Syadiyah et al., 2024).

For maintaining motivated and skilled personnel, the World Bank, suggests “Career-based systems” and “Position-based systems” (Veit, 2020). The later approach is widely used in India and Pakistan where the applicants undergo a variety of rigorous examinations to enter the civil services through centralized or decentralized recruitment (Wouter, 2019). In the former, a national agency oversees recruitment ensuring standardization and uniformity, causing a lack of responsiveness to the local needs. SAARC Human Resource Development Centre found that public service commissions in major South Asian countries are constitutional bodies promoting fairness, professionalism, and meritocracy (SAARC, 2017).

Western public administration professes governance factors of transparency, inclusiveness, accountability, and citizen engagement (Johnston, 2024). The UN proposed nine characteristics of good governance, including rule of law, responsiveness, inclusiveness, consensus oriented, effectiveness and efficiency, equity gives a foundation for the western countries to prioritize meritocracy and impartiality in their recruitment system (Srivastava, 2009). Public interest is based in liberal democracy with capitalistic values at its center. In contrast the Islamic system has a divine source of values (Al-Buraey, 1985).

Chandio (2021) asserts that Islamic public administration is one of the most ethically grounded and comprehensive governance systems, which prioritizes welfare of the masses alongside accountability of the public officials. Every official is answerable to Allah Almighty, then to the society, and the head of the state. Public officials equipped with Islamic knowledge for solutions, and ethical values with transparent decision making in a regulated framework of hierarchical administration ensures effective service delivery.

Muslims gained a foothold in the subcontinent a thousand years before British colonization and directly ruled over the subcontinent for 500 years. British introduced "Indian Civil Services" in the 19th century, to collect taxes, and maintain control over the masses to suppress the voices raised against the colonizers. This elite service focused educational, and technical qualifications through rigorous testing, but loyalty to the British was the foremost trait (Mohyuddin & Ali, 2021). By early 19th century, the administrative units were divided into provincial, divisional, and district levels. By 1855, ICS worked with clear duties, emphasizing transparency, neutrality in recruitment, with formalized competitive examinations. British Crown later got administrative hold after the revolt of 1857, making ICS the backbone of British governance. The same system was inherited by Pakistan (Tanwir & Fennell, 2022).

Islamic Public Administration articulates, "The changing traditions of Islamic public administration, observing processes of collision, absorption and adaptation" as a highly distinct and evolving system of governance (Adrian 2024). The historical trajectory of IPA shows continuous evolution starting from the time of Prophet (S.A.W.W) and moving through various revival movements in modern times making it adaptive and flexible towards the geopolitical and social shifts in governance demands. Interest in Islamic principles of governance within modern frameworks took a revival, and is met continuously with various social, political, and economic challenges (Al-Buraey, 1985).

Methodology:

This study employs the qualitative research design based on the narrative and content analysis to explore the recruitment criteria of early Islamic Public Administration (IPA) and compare it with WPA, and with that of Pakistan to observe the enrichment of Islamic system and the factors that played a major role in making public service a just and fair deal, with the help of two books, i.e. "The Book of Government or Rules for Kings", *Siyasat-Nama* by Nizam-ul-Mulk (1092 A.D.), and "Administrative Development, an Islamic Perspective" by Muhammad A. AL-Buraey (1982). These books offer the richness of Islamic public administration and its keen attention towards character, ethics and morality of a public official. Characteristics of honesty and moral integrity do not emerge suddenly through a six month or a year's training program, nor it is ensured through psychological conditioning.

Siyasat-Nama (The Book of Government) by Nizam-ul -Mulk (1092 A.D.): To provide guidance on the state and the government, Nizamul Mulk wrote this book whilst serving as a Chief Minister (vizier) under two Seljuk Sultans. The book was composed to build an ethical and highly competent administration, later used by Ottoman Turks. It ensures maintaining law and order, following principles of ethical conduct and justice for building a prosperous state. The text stresses the importance of the appointment of loyal, ethical, and competent officials.

Administrative Development: An Islamic Perspective by Muhammad Al-Buraey (1985): This book gives a thorough insight into the administration under Islamic system and discusses the underlying factors in detail. Islamic *Shariah* (pathway) is based on the basic rights of the humankind. The very first point of Islamic administration is the acceptance that "Sovereignty" belong to Allah Almighty and one can only exercise the power that Quran and Sunnah (the practice of the Messenger SAW) have permitted to exercise. *Shariah*, offers a

“yardstick” for the public administrators for making their decisions (Al-Buraey, 1985, pp. 235–234). Islamic administration is characterized by “public or people’s spirit” (Al-Buraey, 1985), i.e. it is purely people centric under the prescribed laws of Allah Almighty.

Comparison of Civil Servants’ Recruitment Criteria in Islamic Public Administration and Pakistan’s Public Administration

Factors involved in recruitment differ in public administrations around the world, as they reflect the type of leaders and government servants that are to take responsibility of serving the citizens. Meritocracy, being upheld is determined by the difference in recruitment criteria across a variety of governance structures. The following comparison includes Western system under comparison, to get a broader reference point of globally accepted norms, since it is mostly adopted around the world. For academic completion, this gives a well-rounded comparison to the reader.

Ideological Level

Philosophical Foundation: It is the divine legitimacy in Islamic public administration, with all governance and service mechanisms derive authority from the will of the Allah Almighty. Adaptation allowed within boundaries described by Shariah (Al-Buraey, 1985). Western philosophy is a reaction against church’s authoritarianism that later evolved into liberalism and democratic rationality with human intellect as the core foundation (Raico, 2020). However, in Pakistan, philosophy is rooted in colonial structures and bureaucratic traditions. Flexible philosophical approach exists with priority given to the donor driven interests and conditionalities over indigenous socioeconomic welfare (Mansoor et al., 2023).

Sovereignty in Practice: Sovereignty in Islamic PA belongs to Allah Almighty as the lawgiver and provides limits to the administrators that are meant to act as His trustees. In western system, sovereignty has been relocated into corporate powers under neoliberalism, from the sovereignty of people. Pakistan has fragmented sovereignty, residing within military/political elites and donor states, often dictating law and economic policies, creating a sovereign dilemma.

Orientation: Islamic public administration has a rooted orientation in divine guidance and the administrative development is drawn from the principles guided by Quran and interpreted by the Shariah and Sunnah of Prophet (PBUH) (Al-Buraey, 1985, p. 309). It prioritizes moral and ethical principles more than the institutional arrangements, with public welfare provided within the prescribed conditions by Allah Almighty. Public servants are compulsorily trained to uphold commands of Allah as the point of reference, without any compromise of ethical boundaries. In contrast, western public administration is service oriented even if it is outside of welfare boundaries, emphasized on mechanistic models if performance measures and efficiency at managerial level.

Table 1
Ideological Level

Factors involved	Islamic Public Administration	Western Public Administration	Pakistan’s Public Administration
Philosophical foundation	Public welfare, justice and fairness under “Divine legitimacy”	Democracy, Rationality, Liberal approach.	Colonial traditions, Feudalism, Elitism, constitutionally a dichotomous principle of sovereignty directed towards the Creator and the parliament, capitalistic policy due to IMF conditions of restructuring, such as removal or reduction in subsidies and public / social sector spending
Sovereignty in practice	Belongs to Allah Almighty	Belongs to people, individual and	Belongs to the politicians and higher-grade public officials. The real sovereign are the

		laws dispatched by authorities	super powers, foreign influences under international law and lending agencies.
Orientation	People welfare oriented. Benefit people under the confined limits of Islamic shariah and orders of Allah Almighty. Open system flexible towards administrative changes without compromising moral and ethical integrity.	Product / service- oriented approach. Promotes corporatism, focusing on efficiency in the system.	Adopts, people-centered as and when necessary, usually works on production orientation, if approved by the foreign influence or international organizations.

Profitability is the core indicator under corporate style governance (Christensen, 1993). Pakistan, with its hybrid administration chooses situation-based selective orientation, guided by national interests, and mostly by conditionalities of donor agencies (Rashid, 2023).

Systemic / Organizational Level

Systemic Rationale: Systemic rationale for Islamic public administration prioritizes justice, public welfare and swift execution of judgement (Al-Buraey, 1985). Western public administration is heavily inclined towards liberalism and market driven revenue as a core rationale. In Pakistan, public administrations rationale is oscillating between capitalism and neocolonialism (IMF conditionalities), resulting in unstable polity relying on foreign structures for policy formulation (Mansoor et al., 2023).

Principle of Recruitment: In IPA, merit is determined on competency, reasoning and *Shariah* knowledge as priority, followed by referrals and loyalty, only for competent people (Nizam Al-Mulk, 2006). Western system has regional merit criteria, relying on subject specific tests, written tests, with open merit in general. Pakistan's recruitment criteria are rooted in colonial systems, focusing English language and other measurable merits. While their actions are based on colonial administrative laws. Some degree of nepotism and *sifarish* culture prevail, recruiting irrespective of incompetencies, thereby undermining fair competition (Wynne, 2024).

Structure of Bureaucracy: Islamic public administration had *Diwans* as ministries, over sighted by *Hisbah* (ombudsman) and ultimate decision makers were the offices of Caliphate and *Wizarah*, using discussions and deliberations without posing administrative restrictions (Al-Buraey, 1985). In contrast, Western Bureaucracy is hierarchical, based on Weberian model prioritizing rules, impersonality and efficiency leading to good governance (Butt, 2023). Pakistan has an inherited structure that is hierarchical and rooted in Indian Civil Services, marked with paternalistic rigidity and traditional public administration originating from colonial rule (Dwivedi, 2024).

Institutions responsible to hold accountability and scrutiny: Accountability institutions in IPA include self-check, the Caliphate, *Hisbah* and *Wizarah*, with intelligencers (spies) overseeing public servants, acting as a "rule of statecraft" (Nizam Al-Mulk, 2006, p. 71). Western system employs committees, hierarchy and audits for oversight, with types of accountabilities varying as per situation and regional styles of statecraft (Schillemans et al., 2024). Pakistan has institutions such as FIA, NAB and ombudsman (federal and provincial) with overridden powers by political and bureaucratic hierarchy with Ineffective parliamentary committees (Imran, 2023).

Table 2:
Organizational /Systemic Level

Factors involved	Islamic Public Administration	Western Public Administration	Pakistan's Public Administration
---------------------	----------------------------------	----------------------------------	-------------------------------------

Systemic rationale	Welfare, as defined in Quran and Sunnah, oriented framework with justice and fairness to citizens in all areas of life. Prompt execution of executive orders, in letter and spirit	Capitalism, Neoliberalism, Market driven approach promoting materialism everywhere.	Mixed, including capitalistic policies such as IMF restructuring conditions, socialism and welfare-orientation as per the directions given by unstable polity.
Principle of recruitment	Meritocracy based on competitiveness, personality and knowledge as per the time and space. Fear of Allah is necessary, Recruitment also done on the basis of loyalty and referrals (not an incompetent person)	Meritocracy adopted, written examinations, training sessions, subject specific allocations in some nations while other have open merit systems.	Merit drawn from colonial legacy. For example, English as a compulsory subject, the legacy of administrative law, the protocols, and the dress code etc. However, nepotism is majorly persistent, even without being competent for the post.
Structure of bureaucracy	System of Diwans with individual responsibilities, role of Hisbah to keep oversight. institution of caliphate and <i>Wizarah</i> present for ultimate oversight and high-end discussions and deliberations.	Hierarchical in nature. Stringent rules and impersonal dispensation of administrative powers	Hierarchical structure, top-down, divided into Basic pay scale. Traditional bureaucratic structure which is rigid in nature. Bureaucracy only working to "rule" the masses.
Institutions responsible to hold accountability and scrutiny	Institution of Caliphate, <i>Wizarah</i> , <i>Hisbah</i> , self-check, and then the relevant <i>diwans</i> (administrative offices) + Islamic eschatology. intelligence networks with "intelligencers", served as informers.	Effective Congressional Standing Committees, Audits, Hierarchical oversight generally adopted, accountability agencies, Inspector generals, administrative and legal oversight and hearings	Institutions like NAB, FIA, Anti-corruption Agencies, Federal Ombudsman are there, but their power can be overridden by higher bureaucratic and political authorities. Ineffective Parliamentary Standing Committees
Probationary period	Temporary appointments, officials get permanent after <i>shura</i> , constant reporting by officials appointed for this purpose, and feedback from general public.	Probationary periods vary according to the states. (can be 6 to 12 months).	Written tests, interviews. References and ACRs for officials above BPS-17 can be used for permanent appointments or promotions.

Probationary Period: The probationary period is a temporary phase of employment varying across public administrations. In the Islamic system, permanent positions are preceded by temporary appointments with rigorous oversight till satisfactory feedback (Al-Buraey, 1985). Western public administration has varying probationary periods depending on the position. In Pakistan, there are written tests for beginners, while officials above BS 17 undergo ACR evaluation or use references for promotions (PPARC, 2013).

Individual/Professional Level Recruitment Factors

Educational criteria for recruitment: Islamic system emphasizes on religious knowledge, moral ethics, and seeking individuals well versed in Islamic laws, with a wise and strategic mindset (Al-Buraey, 1985, pp. 263–268). In western system education required is based on relevant degrees and psychological testing (Oglesby, 2024). Pakistan also requires a generalized criteria of 16 years of education in whichever subject, and passing through competitive examinations (PPARC, 2013).

Language Proficiency: Language criteria in Islamic public administration requires proficiency in Arabic, the language of the Quran, and in native languages to foster wisdom (Nizam Al-Mulk, 2006, p. 61). Western systems are based on spoken and written proficiency in native languages (Burkhardt, 2021). While both systems prioritize native languages, Pakistani public administration requires proficiency in spoken and written skills in English, overlooking native languages. This colonial legacy is only useful to create barriers in participatory and inclusive governance (Haider & Khan, 2024)

Public Service Motivation: PSM differs for public servants in different systems. In Islamic public administration, it is about serving humanity as an act of worship to drive public welfare (Kalantari, 1998). Western system is about results, career development and financial benefits with an altruistic thought process (O’Riordan, 2013). Motivation in Pakistan’s system comes from job security and upper-class privileges leading to an increased social status. Priority lies in individual gains and obeying the seniors to keep those gains (Soomro & Khoso, 2014)

Table 3
Individual/Professional Level

Factors involved	Islamic Public Administration	Western Public Administration	Pakistan’s Public Administration
Educational criteria for recruitment	Preference for scholarly background with sound religious knowledge, wisdom and intelligence with strong character and well versed with the Islamic knowledge.	University educational degree with training in public administration, policy making, plus other relevant psychological, medical tests	16 years education, Competitive exams, psychological tests, medical and Interviews
Language proficiency	Should be well versed with the language of Quran (Arabic) and with the native languages	Written and spoken skills necessary in native language.	English language with legalistic tint, written compulsorily and spoken optionally must be known to all candidates.
Public Service Motivation	For welfare (<i>falah</i>) of the society, as a duty prescribed by Allah. For reward at the day of judgement.	Result driven with career development, financial prospects along with altruistic approach towards public service.	A prestigious and secure job, with upward class mobility, in a high-power distance society. Legacy of colonial era rules and traditions.
Salary and other Benefits	Officers, bureaucrats, government officials and judges must be paid higher salaries according to their positions and experience, in misuse of power.	Higher remuneration and job security with other allowances to increase motivation and efficiency.	Public servants are paid higher in salaries along with other benefits such as hiring, transport, etc. to reduce unethical practices.
Accountability is towards	Allah Almighty, the creator of the universe on the day of judgement from whom nothing is hidden. To the ruler as per Islamic rules and laws and scrutiny done by the citizens. Indictment is fast.	The relevant authorities, such as accountability bureaus or investigation agencies, indictment takes almost a year.	Law but indictment is low due to political interference and weak internal accountability. Accountability acts as a tool settling scores with the political opponents and their followers in public service.
Recruitment Timeline	To avoid possible establishment of networks of personal contacts from being used for personal benefits resulting in corruption, selfishness or laziness, public servants must be rotated every two to three years	Transfers vary with the state and needs. Results based monitoring of public servants. Transfer suitability determined through frequently held exams and tests	Public service exams held every year. Civil servants usually not transferred unless they complete their tenures that could last till retirement age.
Exercise of free will (individual)	Official rules are broad guidelines; public service delivery is supreme. Rules can be by-passed within the prescribed limits as bestowed by Allah, to ensure service delivery.	In an organization individual can act in good-faith to secure material benefits.	Freedom exercised if endorsed, otherwise superiors are to be obeyed.

Salary and other Benefits

Higher salaries are meant to be provided to public servants across all three public administrations. In Islamic system, it is for recognition of individuals worth and paying them to avoid dishonesty (Nizam Al-Mulk, 2006, p. 42). In western system, it is to keep them

motivated and secured financially (Mikkelsen et al., 2016). In Pakistan, allowances and higher salaries are for attraction of talent and curbing corruption, yet it still leads to complacency and corruption (Idris, 2024).

Accountability is towards

In Islamic system, officials are primarily scrutinized via rulers and citizens, but ultimately are accountable to Allah as nothing is hidden from him (Chandio, 2021). Western public administration has availability bureaus and agencies, still they are subjective and might overlook certain issues as per their knowledge (Schillemans et al., 2024). Pakistan also has relevant accountability institutions, but to our dismay they are used as a political tool to target opponents instead of genuine transparency for efficient public service delivery (Shafqat, 1999).

Recruitment timeline:

Rotation in Islamic public administration is done every 2 to 3 years to prevent organized corruption (Nizam Al-Mulk, 2006, p. 41). Western system uses tests and examinations, and the Pakistan system is usually allowing officials to remain in a single place till retirement (Bucharest, 2020). This increases vulnerability towards corruption. But Pakistan has the rotation policy and reforms (Idris, 2024).

Exercise of free will:

Free will in Islamic public Administration is bound by *Shariah* and teachings of Quran and Sunnah when exercised (Chandio & Chandio, 2021). Whereas in the West, it is justified under the guise of individualism, even if it is materialism in practice, or for corporate profiteering (Christensen, 1993). In Pakistan, free will can be exercised, if approved by the senior bureaucracy and political elites (Armytage, 2015).

Societal Level Factors/ Social Influences

Administrative flexibility: Administrative flexibility is about encouraging analytical thinking, adaptability and wisdom to achieve results that are context specific in the Islamic system of administration, as it welcomes people with wisdom and foresightedness. Islam encourages organic thinking and mechanisms in administration (Al-Buraey, 1985). Western system also prioritizes innovation and research driven development (Stroińska, 2020). System in Pakistan is rigid, follows traditional public administration, henceforth flexibility and innovation is not in the interests of political and military elites (Taj, 2017).

Table 4
External Factors

Factors involved	Islamic Public Administration	Western Public Administration	Pakistan's Public Administration
Administrative flexibility	Administrative flexibility is tremendously available for the bureaucracy in order to achieve the execution of the orders. The wisdom, and intelligence are greatly cherished as traits of the officers. Organic Structure	Policies change as per change and innovations in research and analysis	Rigid traditional laws and regulations, highly influenced politically and militarily (cases of military personal serving in civil)
Influence of religious factors in recruitment process	Basic Islamic theological beliefs along with strong ethics and moral integrity highly important. Awareness with relevant Islamic teachings	Secular recruitment approach. Religion confined to individual (personal level)	Not necessary in hiring process, though involved in several steps, such as Islamiyah as compulsory subject in competitive examination

Citizen feedback in recruitment process	Important and necessary to check on work of public officials. Their feedback matters the most to penalize corrupt public officials.	Citizen feedback taken through various portals, such as digital, town hall meetings, etc.	Citizen feedback not required for public officials and their promotions. Political influence and nepotism used to cover up malpractices
---	---	---	---

Influence of religious factors in recruitment process:

Religion in Islamic public administration with Quranic principles, Sunnah and Shariah principles all aspects of life along with the political structures. The West has a secular system with religion separate from politics. Pakistan includes knowledge of religion under subject compulsion in competitive exams, for Muslim candidates (Lamudi, 2023). However, it is not the official criteria.

Citizen feedback in recruitment process

Feedback from citizens is the most important source to keep oversight over the actions of public officials in Islamic public administration (Nizam Al-Mulk, 2006) Western system have all the sources, such as town hall meeting, digital portals (Chandrakar & Sahu, 2021) and complaint cells to hear public complaints and feedback, and so does Pakistan. However, it is highly ineffective and citizen feedback is avoided completely. Corruption get hid by political influences (Mehmood, 2022)

Results and Analysis

The **philosophy** behind every little idea is the basis of how that very idea is going to be executed and transformed into further work. West after their horrific era of dark ages where church did considerable exploitation in connivance with the king, in the name of divinity, has moved towards rationalism, liberalism and democracy as their core philosophies to derive legitimacy from (Raico, 2020). Contrary to this, the early Islamic public administration can be seen deriving its legitimacy from the philosophical foundations of divinity in its true sense. Public servants are performing their duty as *Amanah* from Allah as His *vicegerent* on Earth. Public administration in Pakistan has its philosophical foundations enrooted in British colonial bureaucratic era, whilst trying to incorporate new public management as well as welcoming any new idea as suited to the government of time. The elitist approach for civil bureaucracy is the same. (Soomro & Khoso, 2014)

"And the Lord said unto the angels: Lo! I am about to place a viceroy in the earth" The Quran, 2:30 (Kalantari, 1998, p. 1828)

The above-mentioned comparison of the key factors affecting the recruitment criteria of public administration has given a revelation of priorities and approaches towards a bureaucratic structure. The two systems have a distinct history, different conditions and environments. Islamic system can be seen inclined towards psychological values to select a person that can become a reflection of the Islamic system of integrity, piety and justice. Pakistan's system has been soured with additional Western and international methods. This has made it a hybrid system that is more like a "collage" bureaucracy made of a variety of methods in the form of patch work.

In general, the concept of civil service being a divine responsibility, is not a concept carried by the "Islamic" republic of Pakistan, though Allah Almighty is the sovereign as declared in the constitution (National Assembly of Pakistan, 2012). With an extensive Islamic history starting from Prophethood till the Ottomans, Pakistan, since its inception, opted for the ideals based on the international models. At the times of establishment of Pakistan, the best practices were those as had been left by the British bureaucrats (Soomro & Khoso, 2014).

“Following the modern theories and models of administration, the maximization of values other than spiritual and psychological is the main characteristic of existing administrative systems in the Muslim countries. Preoccupation with rationality, efficiency, economy, and effectiveness (no matter how defined) reflects the pure materialistic concern of these models to the exclusion of ethical and moral values such as the dignity of the individual, social equity, personal growth, and so forth” (Al-Buraey, 1985, p. 301).

The concept of Ombudsman came from Islam. The West borrowed it from Islam, and then Pakistan borrowed from the West (Özbek & Keser, 2024). Though the Website showcases the breadth and the mandate of the *Wafaqi Mohtasib* (federal ombudsman), it is evident from the limitations mentioned that the jurisdiction is almost none over the critical areas. The matters such as judiciary on sub-judicial cases, foreign affairs, defense, and civil service-related issues and complaints are totally out of the mandate of the Ombudsman (Wafaqi Mohtasib (Ombudsman)’s Secretariat, 2024).

Conclusion

The extractions from the two great books one by Nizam-ul-Mulk and one by Muhammad Al-Buraey, through its case studies, narrations, anecdotes, reference to manuscripts and historical writings of Muslim Scholars and political thinkers, provided a golden chance to use abstract level thinking and get in depth of those writings. While a lot can be produced through these narrations, the study extracts the basic factors that can be considered important part of the recruitment criteria of public servants. The word “Civil service” is avoided as this or the bureaucracy was something not known at that time. The important part was to establish the system, process, and every step within the bounds of “Islam”, to fulfill responsibilities towards the people as prescribed by Allah Almighty.

Made in the name of Islam, civil services in Pakistan have more solid grounding in the continuation of colonial practices rather than a distinct origin in Islamic practices.

“Man’s pettiness, shortsightedness, and selfish narrowness are at the very root of the human predicament, and, in fact, all human troubles, including social inequity, are reducible to them. Islamic administrative models, as well as the overall Islamic system, are a practical remedy for this ailment and a recipe for how man can transcend his banalities and create a positive human brotherhood. This can be done by disseminating such values as social equity, justice, freedom, human dignity, and personal, material and spiritual growth” (Al-Buraey, 1985, p. 342).

Recommendations:

Muslim countries can integrate these factors in their policy making, so even if the world is devoid of establishing moral criterion due to its unmeasurable foundations, can use these individual factors to revitalize moral components for recruitment in governance. This is a healthy answer to the debate of how political thought needs to be redefined in order to change the administrative structure, since each influencing factor presented in this study can easily be molded into the existing structures. It would not change the whole system at once, but can provide a stepping stone to step out of the colonial and neocolonial mentality, with orientation purely embedded in the Islamic system.

References

- Al-Buraey, M. (1985). *Administrative development an Islamic perspective*. KPI ; Distributed by Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1-470.
- Armytage, R. (2015). The Social Lives of the Elite: Friendship and Power in Pakistan. *The Asia Pacific Journal of Anthropology*, 16(5), 448–463. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14442213.2015.1076887>
- Bucharest. (2020). The Civil Service System At European Level. *European Public Administration Network*. www.eupan.eu
- Burkhardt, T. (2021). *Linguistic diversity and equality within the public administration: Issues and challenges* [Working Paper], Ulster University.1-43.
- Butt, J. S. (2023). The Role of Bureaucracy in Europe for Promoting Democracy, Equality, Good Governance and Social Justice. *AUDA (Acta Universitatis Danubius Administration)*, 15(1), 7–20.
- Cardona, F. (2006). *BUILDING A CIVIL SERVICE SYSTEM*, Seminar on “Civil Service Recruitment Procedures” Vilnius, *OECD*, 1-21.
- Chandio, A. R. (2021). Administrative Accountability: With Special Reference to Islam. *International Journal of Engineering and Information Systems*, 5(7), 33–39.
- Chandio, A. R., & Chandio, M. A. (2021a). An Islamic Perspective on Public Administration and Official Ethics. 5(6).
- Chandio, A. R., & Chandio, M. A. (2021b). An Islamic Perspective on Public Administration and Official Ethics. *International Journal of Academic Multidisciplinary Research*, 5(6), 255–260.
- Chandrakar, K., & Sahu, B. K. (2021). Political Communication In The Digital Age: Challenges And Opportunities. *Ilkogretim Online - Elementary Education Online*, 20(5), 9470–9479. <https://doi.org/10.17051/ilkonline.2021.05.1032>
- Christensen, J. G. (1993). Corporatism, Administrative Regimes and the Mis-management of Public Funds. *Scandinavian Political Studies*, 16(3), 201–224.
- Dwivedi, J. (2024). Comparative Study of Bureaucratic System in Pakistan and Bangladesh. *International Research Journal of Humanities and Interdisciplinary Studies (IRJHIS)*, 5(4), 96–107. <https://doi-ds.org/doilink/04.2024-51476475/IRJHIS2404011>
- Galnoor, I., & Oser, J. (2015). Civil Service. *International Encyclopedia of the Social & Behavioral Sciences* (pp. 695–700). Elsevier. <https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-08-097086-8.75003-3>
- Haider, Z., & Khan, A. A. (2024). The Colonial Imprint on Pakistan’s Bureaucracy: A Legacy of Power and Control. *Policy Journal of Social Science Review*, 2(4), 318–340.
- Idris, D. I. (2024). *Civil Service Reform Attempts in Pakistan*. *K4DD Rapid Evidence Review*, 1-20.
- Imran, M. (2023). A Critical Analysis of Legal Framework on Accountability: A Case Study of Pakistan. *Journal of Development and Social Sciences*, 4(II), 176–188. [https://doi.org/10.47205/jdss.2023\(4-II\)17](https://doi.org/10.47205/jdss.2023(4-II)17)

- Johnston, M. (2024). Good Governance: Rule of Law, Transparency and Accountability. *UNESCO*. <https://etico.iiep.unesco.org/sites/default/files/2017-09/unpan010193.pdf>
- Kalantari, B. (1998). In search of a public administration paradigm: Is there anything to be learned from islamic public administration? *International Journal of Public Administration*, 21(12), 1821–1861. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01900699808525370>
- Kay, A. (2024). The changing traditions of Islamic public administration: Observing processes of collision, absorption and adaptation. *Asia Pacific Journal of Public Administration*, 46(1), 13–30. <https://doi.org/10.1080/23276665.2023.2275283>
- Kirsi Äijälä. (2000). Civil service ethics A study of the grounds of civil service ethics, its present state and areas of development. *Personnel Department of the Ministry of Finance*.
- Lamudi. (2023). CSS Exam in Pakistan: Learn about Eligibility Criteria, Age Limit, Process, and Fee Structure [Blog]. *Lamudi*. <https://www.lamudi.pk/blog/css-exam-in-pakistan/>
- Lapiente, V., & Van De Walle, S. (2020). The effects of new public management on the quality of public services. *Governance*, 33(3), 461–475. <https://doi.org/10.1111/gove.12502>
- Madsen, T. H. (2024). The moral roles of democratically elected politicians and civil servants. *Critical Review of International Social and Political Philosophy*, 28(7), 1–23. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13698230.2024.2380220>
- Mansoor, A., Aftab, Dr. R., & Yousufi, Dr. M. (2023). INTERNATIONAL POLITICAL ECONOMY AND IMF: EXAMINING THE EFFECTS OF EXTENDED FUND FACILITY (EFF) ON THE GOVERNANCE STRUCTURE OF PAKISTAN. *Pakistan Journal of International Affairs*, 6(2), 475–495. <https://doi.org/10.52337/pjia.v6i2.796>
- Mehmood, T. (2022). Analysis of Performance Management System in the Provincial Governments in Pakistan. *KDI School of Public Policy and Management*. [file:///C:/Users/hp/Downloads/Analysis+of+performance+management+system+in+the+provincial+governments+in+Pakistan%20\(1\).pdf](file:///C:/Users/hp/Downloads/Analysis+of+performance+management+system+in+the+provincial+governments+in+Pakistan%20(1).pdf)
- Mikkelsen, L. S., Števo, K., & Dlesková, A. (2016). REMUNERATION AND BENEFITS IN CENTRAL GOVERNMENT CIVIL SERVICE IN THE EU MEMBERS STATES AND EUROPEAN COMMISSION. European Public Administration Network.
- Mohyuddin, Z., & Ali, M. Y. (2021). The Development of Indian Civil Service in British India: An Analysis. *Journal of Historical Studies*, 7[1], 80-90. <https://www.studocu.com/in/document/bankura-university/masters-of-arts/vol-i-21-article-5-vol-7-jhs/81208255>.
- National Assembly of Pakistan. (2012, February 28). *THE CONSTITUTION OF THE ISLAMIC REPUBLIC OF PAKISTAN*. National Assembly of Pakistan. https://na.gov.pk/uploads/documents/1333523681_951.pdf
- Nizam Al-Mulk. (2006). *The Book of Government or Rules for Kings* (3rd ed.). Routledge.
- Oglesby, R. W. (2024). Eliminating Unnecessary Degree Requirements from Public Sector Careers. *American First Policy Institute*. https://americafirstpolicy.com/issues/eliminating-unnecessary-degree-requirements-from-public-sector-careers?utm_source=chatgpt.com
- O’Riordan, J. (2013). Public Service Motivation. *AN FORAS RIARACHÁIN INSTITUTE OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION*.

- https://www.ipa.ie/_fileUpload/Documents/PublicServiceMotivation.pdf
https://www.ipa.ie/_fileUpload/Documents/PublicServiceMotivation.pdf
- Özbek, C. A., & Keser, A. (2024). TRACING THE OMBUDSMAN HISTORICAL ROOTS IN THE CONTEXT OF POLICY TRANSFER. *Ombudsman Akademik*, 11(21), 131–151. <https://doi.org/10.32002/ombudsmanakademik.1489265>
- PPARC. (2013). *A MANUAL ON APPOINTMENT, PROMOTION AND TRANSFER*. PAKISTAN PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION RESEARCH CENTRE ESTABLISHMENT DIVISION CABINET SECRETARIAT ISLAMABAD. <https://establishment.gov.pk/userfiles1/file/Appoint%2013-02-2019.pdf>
- Raadschelders, J. C. N., & Sanders, H. R. P. (2024). New development: Loyalty to principle or politics—The US civil service under attack...but is it justified? *Public Money & Management*, 45(2), 144–150. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09540962.2024.2376373>
- Raico, R. (2020). The Rise, Fall, and Renaissance of Classical Liberalism. *Mises Daily*. <https://mises.org/mises-daily/rise-fall-and-renaissance-classical-liberalism>
- Rashid, D. M. (2023). Political Instability in Pakistan: Causes and Consequences. *Annals of Human and Social Sciences*, 4(3), 920–927. <https://doi.org/Annals%2520of%2520Human%2520and%2520Social%2520Sciences>
- SAARC. (2017). *Comparative Study of Public / Civil Service Commissions of SAARC Member States*. South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation. Nepal., Nepal. <https://doi.org/20.500.12592/bgs29h>.
- Schillemans, T., Overman, S., Flinders, M., Laegreid, P., Maggetti, M., Papadopoulos, Y., & Wood, M. (2024). Public sector accountability styles in Europe comparing accountability and control of agencies in the Netherlands, Norway, Switzerland and the UK. *Public Policy and Administration*, 39(1), 125–146. <https://doi.org/10.1177/09520767221098292>
- Shafqat, S. (1999). Pakistani Bureaucracy: Crisis of Governance and Prospects of Reform. *The Pakistan Development Review*, 38(4), 995–1017.
- Shakeel Ahmed Imtiaz. (2013). *A Study on the Civil Service Structure, Civil Servants Training and an Overview of National Commission of Government Reforms in Pakistan* (Vol. 1). German Federal Ministry of Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ).
- Shepherd, G. (2003). Civil Service Reform in Developing Countries: Why Is It Going Badly? *11th International Anti-Corruption Conference*, 26.
- Soomro, N. N., & Khoso, G. M. (2014). IMPACT OF COLONIAL RULE ON CIVIL SERVICES OF PAKISTAN. *British Journal of Interdisciplinary Studies*, 1(2), 1–13.
- Srivastava, M. (2009). Good Governance - Concept, Meaning and Features: A Detailed Study. *SSRN Electronic Journal*, 1–23. <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.1528449>
- Stroińska, E. (2020). New Public Management as a Tool for Changes in Public Administration. *Journal of Intercultural Management*, 12(4), 1–28. <https://doi.org/10.2478/joim-2020-0048>
- Syadiyah, K., Putri, S. A. N., & Hayat, H. (2024). The Role of Public Administration Ethics in Realizing Clean and Transparent Governance. *Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi Negara (JUAN)*, 12(1), 116–124. <https://doi.org/10.31629/juan.v12i1.7053>

- Taj, A. (2017). The Role of Civil Bureaucracy—Facilitative or Regressive? Perspectives from Pakistan. *The Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences, Peshawar*, 25(1), 55–72.
- Tanwir, M., & Fennell, S. (2022). Pakistani Bureaucracy and Political Neutrality: A Mutually Exclusive Phenomenon? *The Pakistan Development Review*, 49(3), 239–259. <https://doi.org/10.30541/v49i3pp.239-259>
- Upholding Ethical Standards in Public Service Recruitment Process*. (2024, August). [Online post]. *Drishti Publications*. <https://www.drishtias.com/ethics/engage-in-ethics/upholding-ethical-standards-in-public-service-recruitment-process>
- Van Acker, Wouter. (2019, January). *Civil Service Recruitment: Recruiting the Right Persons the Right Way*. Washington, D.C. : World Bank Group.
- Veit, S. (2020). Career Patterns in Administration. In *Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Politics*. Oxford University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1093/acrefore/9780190228637.013.1393>
- Wafaqi Mohtasib (Ombudsman)'s Secretariat. (2024). *What We Do* [Online post]. Ombudsman Secretariat, GoP.
- Wynne, M. T. (2024). *Sifarish Culture: A Form of Elite Capture*. PIDE, 1-3. <https://pide.org.pk/research/sifarish-culture-a-form-of-elite-capture/>