



RESEARCH PAPER

Exploring Transformational Leadership: Practice, Impacts and Challenges Faced by Educational Leaders in Pakistan

¹Ayesham Kanwal*, ²Qandeel Fatima and ³Tehreem Asghar

1. MPhil Scholar, Department of Applied Linguistics, Kinnaird College for Women University, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan
2. MPhil Scholar, Department of Applied Linguistics, Kinnaird College for Women University, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan
3. Lecturer, Superior Group of Colleges, Sialkot, Punjab, Pakistan

*Corresponding Author: ayeshamkanwal@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The current study aims to explore how far are the educational leaders in Pakistan engaging in the practice of transformational leadership, and to identify the impact and challenges pertaining to its implementation. Transformational leadership has a significant role in the overall effective performance of schools. Through a mixed-method approach, a structured questionnaire consisting of open-ended and close-ended questions was administered to 20 primary and secondary educational leaders of Lahore, Pakistan, via random sampling. The findings suggest that the Pakistani educational leaders are highly engaged in the practice of the transformational leadership. Job satisfaction, employee performance and collaboration were seen as highly impactful, while culture, limited professional development and sustainability were seen as major challenges. Additionally, demographic factors were seen as contributing factors as the older groups were found less engaging in the practice of transformational leadership. It is recommended that policy-makers and educational institutes should invest in leadership and professional development courses to improve leadership practice and address contextual barriers in Pakistan's education sector.

KEYWORDS Transformational Leadership, Transactional Leadership, Pakistan's Educational Leadership, Leadership Practice, Transformational Leadership Impacts, Transformational Leadership Challenges

Introduction

Leadership is a vital organ in the department of education that directs the fate of the school and its students. An educational leader with the help of his skills and practices can make the career of the school and its students or vice versa. Gamora (2014) asserts that teachers are the immediate subordinate of school administration and strong and effective leadership promotes confidence, comfortability and availing the opportunities on part of the teachers without taking the leadership as a threat. In this regard leaders must possess a clear vision and an inner drive to bring progress and prosperity to the institution.

Educational leaders follow varied leadership models following their intuitions and experience to accomplish the set goals and objectives based on the given circumstances, and their personal and institutional policies. These models include transformational, instructional, transactional, moral, managerial, participative, interpersonal, etc. The practice of these models differs in the developed and developing countries. Being a developing country, the leadership practice in Pakistan is subjected to hostile circumstances. Like many developing countries, Pakistan faces economic, social, health, and educational problems, while little attention is paid to leadership development (Bush, 2008). In the context of Pakistan's educational leadership, the practice of models depends on various factors which includes personal leadership style preferences, organizational context as well as cultural dynamics are of considerable importance.

In public sector, the practice of educational leadership is hindered due to lack of infrastructure, training, support and limited resources. Moreover, the teachers hired often lack the educational expertise required to teach a particular subject, while many become teachers just for the sake of earning or not getting the job in their desired fields. Besides these challenges, public schools also face hinderance in the practice of effective leadership due to presence of bureaucratic structures, and socio-economic disparities which make the professional progress of teachers slow and unavailability of equitable education. Afzal et al. (2018) researched upon the leadership styles and change dynamics in public schools of Pakistan and found that while the teachers in public schools understand the importance of the change dynamics and are ready to adapt if the second-order change occurs, however the system remains reluctant in the initiation of this bottom-up change. Yet there are some good public educational institutes' that strive to provide quality education and also help teachers in professional development opportunities by practicing transformational leadership, distributed leadership and transactional leadership models.

On the contrary, the condition of private schools, which dominate the public-school culture in Pakistan in practicing the educational leadership models is better as they promise quality education, increased parental satisfaction, improved student achievement, and flexibility in curriculum. These institutes mostly adopt a transformational and distributed leadership model as they recognize their importance in shared decision-making, distribution of roles to achieve goals, student achievements, career growth opportunities for teachers and skill enhancement of leaders. Moreover, they tend to focus on providing exposure to teachers as well as learners by including co-curricular and recreational activities in the curriculum, which also takes in the characteristics of instructional leadership model. The practice of these models is evident in the study of Raza et al. (2021) who found the practice of distributed leadership in one of the top private schools in Pakistan, Beaconhouse School System. Transactional leadership model is also one of the emerging practicing models by Pakistani educational leaders, followed by transformational and laissez faire model as found by Khalil et al. (2016) in their exploratory study. Private educational leaders tend to do so to attract the consumers and meet international education standards. However, the educational leaders in this sector face challenges as well which include, but are not limited to affordability of quality education for all, and sustainability in the market.

Overall, transformational leadership is seen as one of the significantly practiced models of leadership as the literature on educational leadership models also appreciate the significance of the practices of this model in the improvement of schools (Qayyum et al., 2021). Transformational leadership outstands other leadership models because of its keenness to take its followers to their highest potential through proper guidance, motivation, and inspiration. An educational leader following transformational leadership model performs the duty of both, a trainer and a mentor to help his followers reach their full potential. They also believe in a positive and inspiring working atmosphere so that their followers try their best to accomplish the goals of the organization effectively by providing a clear vision, while also providing individualized support and intellectual stimulation, encouraging creativity and innovation, developing new skills, appreciating the achievements and providing constructive feedback and guidance for improvement.

In developing countries like Pakistan, the main focus of research has been attributed to the hierarchical system i.e., to the role of government or the administrators and the policies they adopt to control the schools at regional or institutional level (Simkins et al., 2003). It has been observed that the role of leaders and their leadership practices is an under researched area. As the researcher's conceptualisation of educational leadership with reference to Pakistan's context has been established above, it is the objective of the current research to observe the dynamics in the practice of transformational leadership as an emerging model alongside others by our leaders. Another objective of the current research is to identify the impact that transformational leadership has on the overall

institution effectiveness and challenges faced by these leaders in its implementation which remain unexplored, making the current study significant for better performance of Pakistan's education system.

Literature Review

In 1978, the term transformational leadership was given by James MacGregor Burns in his book, *Leadership*. Transformational leadership helps the leaders in transforming the attitudes, beliefs, and behaviours of people working under them, inspires and motivates them to improve their performance to meet organizational expectations, and boosts self-esteem and trusts through charisma. Leithwood (2000) in his leadership model gives the revolutionary research on transformational leadership styles in educational settings. Leithwood suggests that it is the transformational leadership style that can be exercised and introduced as elements of principal training programs. He described transformational leadership along six elements: structuring school vision and goals; offering intellectual stimulation; contributing individualized support; representing professional practices; indicating high performance potentials; and evolving structures to foster contribution in school decisions. It has been proven that transformational leaders are capable to inspire their followers by creating the meaning and the importance of work through words and actions in educational institutes.

Transformational leadership is proved to have a positive impact on teachers' motivation which ensures students' academic progress. Kouni et al., (2018) suggest that transformational leadership has always been strongly correlated with positive work attitude and satisfied employees. In the context of educational institutes, the survey results revealed that the performance of teachers is significantly improved when they work under transformational leaders.

Transformational leaders have the ability to influence employees to improve their mindfulness regarding the importance of work and to prioritize their interest and emphasise on employees' attainment of a better life. Transformational leaders inspire followers to have a bright and optimistic future, using an approach to guide employees to work towards specific directions to achieve the desirable objectives (González-Cruz et al., 2019). There are four dimensions of transformational leadership: idealized influence, inspiration, intellectual stimulation, and individualized consideration (Rafferty & Griffin, 2004). These elements boost followers' awareness and dedication and provide support and inspiration. From this perspective, transformational leadership style has the power to shift supporters' beliefs and improve their emotional wellbeing by giving importance to the subordinates, which benefits the leaders to develop emotional attachment to their workplace. These attributes are not present in all other leadership styles and it makes transformational leadership style most appropriate for the present study. Compared to other leadership styles, transformational leadership is people-oriented and makes sure that organizational success is achieved by employees through honest commitment and dedication; and those employees are the product to transform organizations.

Research data show that transformational leadership positively impact schools' progress, teachers' behaviours and emotional well-being, their motivation and job satisfaction, and also students' performance, hence it suggests that transformational leadership is effectively applied in educational set up (Leithwood & Jantzi, 2000; Lin Tengi et al., 2017). Leithwood and Jantzi (2000) propose that transformational leadership style guarantees to improve school leadership's competence to make the essential renovations in educational organizations that assist in meeting stakeholders' accountability and in fulfilling the requirement of improved performance. Therefore, Leithwood suggests that transformational leadership approaches should be exercised by school leaders and be incorporated in principals training programs.

The most important responsibility of a leader is to make an organization work efficiently by ensuring high employee performance. Employee performance is important in all organizations, but its importance increases specifically in educational organizations because the crucial role played by teachers in creating and nurturing future generations can promote the country and the society. Thus, teachers' performance is vital as it contributes to the schools and increases the efficiency of education sector. In educational organizations, teachers look at principals with transformational leadership style as role models and appreciate principals for inspiring teachers by showing trust in them (Balyer et al., 2017). Transformational leadership traits displayed by principals plays a vital role in the improvement of schools where principals focus is to build a culture of a shared vision. According to Balyer et al. (2017) transformational leadership brings positive changes in organizations as it allows teachers to use their expertise to do their tasks and to feel more assured by demonstrating higher performance. Studies show that following transformational leadership improves the performance and provides job commitment.

Although not much literature is available on the challenges faced in the implementation of transformational leadership model, Miller (2018) identifies culture and context as the defining parameters of practicing any educational leadership. According to Miller, a shift of perspectives occurs continuously across organizations and hence to enhance strategic leadership, contextually-bound solutions are required. Context is important for the policy-makers and the school leaders in order to assure quality in the school development. Hence, culture and context becomes a challenge in the application of transformational leadership model as well as the educational system varies from country to country. Brauckmann et al. (2020) also stress on considering culture and context in leadership practice. Morrison (2013) mentions structural challenges a hinderance to the implementation of educational leadership and a negative relation between change and leadership in the praxis. Bush (2018) also mentions limited budget and low priority given to leadership preparation as a challenge to the practice of leadership. Other challenges also include the sustainable actions and a proper action plan during times of uncertainties like the Covid-19. Considering limited research on educational leadership and challenges in Pakistan's context, the current study tends to look at the practices and challenges pertaining to transformational leadership in Pakistan's education system.

Material and Methods

The current study adopts a mixed-method approach, i.e., it is both quantitative and qualitative in nature, allowing the researchers to thoroughly comprehend contextual insights and gain measurable quantitative insights. The target population for the current study consisted of educational leaders, practicing educational leadership in primary and secondary educational institutes of Lahore, Pakistan. A total of 20 educational leaders participated in the study through random sampling technique. A questionnaire was prepared consisting of both close-ended and open-ended questions as primary data collection instrument. The questionnaire was divided into five sections as it suited the requirement to get key insights on all the areas of concern. Section 1 included the general demographic information and whether the respondents have taken any educational leadership course or not for a better understanding of the transformational leadership practice by the respondents. Section 2, 3 and 4 consisted of close-ended questions based on 5-point Likert scale to observe the level of frequent occurrence and agreement for practice of transformational leadership by educational leaders in Pakistan, impact of transformational leadership and challenges in the implementation of the selected model. Lastly, section 5 consisted of four open-ended questions to get in-depth analysis of the benefits and impacts, challenges and facilitation of these challenges, and the personal leadership model preferences of these educational leaders.

The quantitative data was then tabulated and frequency distribution of each item was measured individually on 5-point Likert scale. A thematic analysis was employed to

examine the responses from the open-ended questions data and its frequencies were also generated in order to identify trends within the questions answered by educational leaders. Before administering the questionnaire to research participants, a pilot study was conducted with a small group of educational leaders to test the clarity, coherence and relevance of the questionnaire with the research questions. The feedback led to minor modifications ensuring better alignment and validity of the instrument, after which the questionnaire was administered to the main research participants via Google Forms. Lastly, ethical considerations were strictly followed throughout the research process. The participants were informed about the purpose of the study and assured their anonymity. Additionally, the confidentiality of the responses was maintained while using the data collected for academic purpose only.

Results and Discussion

The responses were obtained from 20 respondents and the data was analyzed keeping in view the research questions. The number of respondents were tabulated according to their age range and frequency distribution of the respondents or educational leaders who undertook leadership courses in each age range was also calculated using the percentage formula as shown in Table 1.

Table 1
Percentage of Leaders Who Undertook Leadership Courses in each Age Range

Age Range	No of Respondents	No. of Leaders Who Took Leadership Courses	Leadership Courses Undertaken (%/100)
31-40	6	4	66.67% (out of 100%)
41-50	8	4	50% (out of 100%)
51-60	6	1	16% (out of 100%)

Quantitative Data Analysis

Section 2 of the questionnaire focused on the behaviour and practice of the transformational leadership model by the educational leaders in Pakistan. The respondents were required to mark on the scale of 1-5 their level of engagement in the practice of 12 transformational leadership behaviours and practices to gain insight into the common practices among these educational leaders. The frequency distribution of these responses based on Likert scale has been presented in Table 2 below. The data shows a high engagement of these leaders in transformational leadership practice as most of the respondents marked either level 4 or 5 as their level of engagement, i.e., 'often' or 'always' engaging in these practices. It can be seen from the data that a maximum number of respondents reported on 'always' engaging in open and effective communication, followed by fostering a sense of responsibility, establishing challenging goals, providing constructive feedback, and motivating staff. This was followed by a maximum number of educational leaders 'often' engaging in the practice of articulating vision and mission, promoting inclusive and positive culture, acting as a role model, providing individualized support and professional growth opportunities, and building positive relations with the staff members.

While the respondents were often or always found to be engaging in the transformational leadership practices, 40% leaders involved the stakeholders in decision-making 'sometimes', which shows that a considerable number of leaders preferred taking important decisions mostly themselves, however, the combined number of respondents often or always engaging the staff members in the decisions outnumbers the former group. On average, 12.1% responses were reported on engaging 'sometimes' with the key practices of transformational leadership while being an educational leader. The low inclination towards 'rarely' and 'never' responses was seen by looking at the demographics to look at the pattern where the change occurs. It was observed that the educational leaders who were between the age range 50-60 marked with these responses while the younger educational leaders were found to be engaged highly in the practice of

transformational leadership. This suggests that older leaders were somewhat reluctant in building relationships and supporting creative and innovative ideas, i.e., they were resistant to adapt to the changing dynamics and stick to their conventional methods, which can further be linked to a less percentage of the older age group leaders who took leadership courses, i.e., only 16% leaders in the age group 50-60 under took a leadership course as seen in Table 1. Leadership courses and professional development programs can help the leaders to update their knowledge and improve their performance for organizational effectiveness as asserted by Senol (2019) and the responses align with this claim as young age group leaders who undertook courses were seen to engage more in the practices. Overall, a high inclination towards the practice of the selected transformational leadership practices was obtained as 43.3% and 43% responses for always and often were met for engaging in these behaviours and practices.

Table 2
Frequency Distribution of Transformational Leadership Behaviours and Practice

Q No	Percentage (%)				
	1 Never	2 Rarely	3 Sometimes	4 Often	5 Always
1. Articulating vision and mission	0	0	0	55	45
2. Motivating staff and supporting creativity and innovation	0	5	15	40	40
3. Inclusive and positive school culture for collaboration and supportive work environment	0	10	10	45	35
4. Open and effective communication	0	0	5	25	70
5. Establishing challenging goals and expectations	5	0	10	35	50
6. Fostering a sense of responsibility and ownership	0	5	0	35	60
7. Acting as a role model	0	0	20	45	35
8. Providing individualized support, mentoring and professional development opportunities	0	0	10	60	30
9. Building positive relationships	0	5	10	40	45
10. Involving in decision-making processes	0	0	40	35	35
11. Recognizing and rewarding the achievements and contributions of teachers and staff members	0	0	15	60	25
12. Providing constructive feedback and assistance to teachers	0	0	10	40	50
Average	0.4	2.1	12.1	43	43.3

In section 3, the impact of the transformational leadership to see whether or not the model is effective for the overall effectiveness of the educational institute was observed through pre-defined close-ended questions based on Likert scale. The data tabulated in Table 3 shows that overall, the educational leaders recognized the transformational leadership model as being impactful with 45% respondents strongly agreeing to the impactful items, followed by 42% agreeing. Improving the educator morale, employee performance and job satisfaction was seen as highly impactful characteristics of the model as 70% respondents marked on the 'strongly agree' scale, followed by 30% marking 'agree'. Collaboration and inclusive organizational culture were

seen as the second most impactful trait of transformational leadership model as 55% leaders 'strongly agreed' to the question. The tendency towards 'agree' and 'strongly agree' options of the respondents suggest consistency in the results with the assertions of Kouni et al. (2018), Leithwood & Jantzi (2000), Lin Tengji et al. (2017), and Balyer et al. (2017); who stress upon the impacts of transformational leadership in enhancing teacher effectiveness, improvement in teacher's performance, job satisfaction, and inclusive organizational culture as mentioned in the literature review.

To look at the patterns more deeply, the age variable was again looked for individual responses and it was observed that like the trends in the practice of transformational leadership, the older educational leaders' group between the age of 50-60 here too marked more on neutral and disagree option than their younger counterparts. According to this trend then, the older leaders did not see the leadership model under observation as impactful in the overall performance of educational institutes, enhancing teacher effectiveness and student outcomes, and fostering creativity. This can be linked to the fact analysed above that the older group was resistant to change and prefer decision-making on their own.

Table 3
Frequency Distribution of Impact of Transformational Leadership on Institute's Effectiveness

Q No	Percentage (%)				
	1 Strongly Disagree	2 Disagree	3 Neutral	4 Agree	5 Strongly Agree
1. Positive impact on the overall performance of educational institutions	0	5	15	50	30
2. Useful in enhancing teacher effectiveness and student outcomes	0	0	25	35	40
3. Fosters a collaborative and inclusive organizational culture	0	0	5	40	55
4. Improves educator morale, employee performance and job satisfaction	0	0	0	30	70
5. Fosters creativity, innovation and better student experiences	0	0	15	55	30
Average	0	1	12	42	45

Section 4 looked at the frequencies of some of the challenges that are faced by the educational leaders in implementing the transformational leadership model, the data of which has been presented in Table 4. The data shows that cultural and contextual factors as the leading challenge in the implementation of the model by educational leaders in Pakistan. This finding is consistent with the findings of Miller (2018) who asserts that national culture and context are important in defining the behaviours of school leaders in the practice of leadership Braukmann et al. (2019) also give importance to taking into consideration school-context for the practice of any educational leadership. This school-context involves and is not limited to the setting, the infrastructure and economic resources. Pakistan is a developing country with a dichotomy among public and private schools, each with its own benefits and challenges.

Limited training and professional development opportunities followed by lack of resources were seen as other considerable challenges by a maximum number of the respondents. Interestingly, respondents reported a neutral response on the limited understanding of the educational leadership as a hindrance in the implementation of the transformational leadership model. This indicates that generally the educational leaders are aware of the emerging models and the importance associated with the practice of at

least any one model. Respondents also marked 'agree' and 'strongly agree' for resistance from teachers and stakeholders as a challenge in the implementation of the model, while a negligible number of respondents chose other options. This is also consistent with the findings of Afzal et al. (2018), where the stakeholders and higher focal persons are resistant to implement changes. The age wise analysis of this data previewed an equal ratio of the viewpoints of all the age groups in all items.

Table 4
Frequency Distribution of Challenges in Practicing Transformational Leadership

Q No	Percentage (%)				
	1 Strongly Disagree	2 Disagree	3 Neutral	4 Agree	5 Strongly Agree
1. Lack of time, support and resources	0	0	15	35	50
2. Resistance from teachers, staff and stakeholders	5	10	15	45	25
3. Limited training and professional development opportunities	0	5	0	50	45
4. Limited understanding and awareness of educational leadership models	0	10	50	30	10
5. Cultural and contextual factors	0	0	5	45	50
Average	1	5	17	41	36

Qualitative Data Analysis

Four open-ended questions were asked from the educational leaders to dig deeper in the practice of the transformational leadership by these leaders including the challenges they face and their personal preferences on the practice of leadership models other than the transformational. A thematic analysis of these questions has been presented as below:

Benefits and Impact

Based on the responses of the educational leaders on the benefits and impact of transformational leadership, five themes were identified which have been presented in Table 5 along with their frequencies. Collaboration was seen as highly impactful as 80% educational leaders mentioned it as the benefit of transformational leadership, followed by employee empowerment and job satisfaction. According to an educational leader, "transformational leadership fosters collaboration, job-satisfaction, and creative and innovative teaching and learning strategies."

Table 5
Frequency of Themes on Benefits and Impact

Themes	Frequency
Collaboration	80%
Employee empowerment and job satisfaction	75%
Professional growth and development	60%
Creativity and innovation	60%
Organizational culture	33.3%

Challenges

The respondents were asked about their perception of the challenges that the educational leaders face and four common themes were identified from their responses as presented in Table 6 along with their frequencies. Lack of resources and budget allocation was seen as the most frequently mentioned challenge with 85% frequency distribution,

which remains consistent with the claims of Bush (2018). Interestingly, sustainability and lack of evaluation methods were also frequently cited by the participants as major hindrances in the implementation of the leadership model. According to one of the participants, "lack of a proper plan for sustenance of a pipeline of future educational leaders and maintaining educational and work environment standards are key challenges." Another mentioned, "lack of evaluation is the major point. If there is no evaluation, there is no improvement, and leaders generally tend to do so through managerial model."

Table 6
Frequency of Challenges

Themes	Frequency
Lack of resources	75%
Sustainability	35%
Lack of evaluation	35%
Lack of professional development	23.5%

Facilitation of Challenges

According to the participants opinions on the facilitation of challenges, five themes were identified. Allocation of resources, followed by providing professional development opportunities, leadership courses, sustainable action plan, and communicating a clear vision were seen as common suggestions to tackle the implementation challenges. Surely, by providing professional development and leadership courses, the leaders and staff members can learn new skills and enhance their knowledge on multiple areas where the leaders have to act. Furthermore, they can then influence their teachers and staff members when they themselves are confident, as has also been reported by one of the respondents, "by providing resources, and professional development through leadership courses, many challenges can be tackled like time management and efficient working of the teachers."

Table 7
Frequency of Facilitation of Challenges

Themes	Frequency
Allocation of resources	78%
Providing professional development	35%
Leadership courses	35%
Sustainable action plan	20%
Articulating a clear vision	10%

Other Leadership Models Efficiency Over Transformational Leadership

To dig deeper in the practice of transformational leadership, the participants were questioned on the efficiency of other models in the overall effectiveness of schools over transformational model. Respondents generally agreed to the efficiency of the transformational model in itself despite challenges in its implementation.

Interestingly, 70% of the respondents preferred practicing transactional leadership besides transformational to keep a balance through evaluation, ensure accountability and equal distribution of responsibilities. This is consistent with the findings of Khalil et al. (2016), who found transactional leadership model, followed by transformational model as the model practiced leadership models in Pakistan. According to one of the participants, "transformational leadership model encompasses in it all the tenets required to run an effective educational institute in my perspective. However, sometimes transactional leadership becomes necessary to keep a check on the staff and ensuring accountability through evaluation."

Others also suggested instructional and distributed leadership as significant over the transformational leadership as seen in Table 8. Overall, a preference for eclectic approach was observed as the responses indicated using other models in addition to transformational leadership.

Table 8
Frequency of Efficiency of Other Models Over Transformational Leadership

Themes	Frequency
Transactional leadership	70%
Instructional Leadership	40%
Transformational Model Alone	40%
Distributed Leadership	35%

Conclusion

From the responses of 20 educational leaders working at different primary and secondary educational institutes, the current research found that Pakistani educational leaders engage in the practice of transformational leadership features to a great extent with 43.3% and 43% responses on “always” and “often” options. Furthermore, the model was also seen as highly impactful for improving teacher’s morale and job satisfaction due to its inclusive nature. Moreover, cultural, context and lack in professional development opportunities were seen as highly hindering the implementation process. All these three dimensions were also examined on the bases of age range to depict the practice of the model among different age groups which indicated that older age group, i.e., 50-60 was more sceptical towards the practice of transformational leadership and might prefer other conventional models. Moreover, this age group also had least percentage of leaders who undertook any leadership course, which can also attribute to their conventional ways of leadership. The thematic analysis of the qualitative data strengthened some of the impacts of practicing transformational leadership like collaboration, job satisfaction, and professional growth as cited by earlier researchers including Leithwood & Jantzi (2000) and Lin Teng et al. (2017). Inclusivity and supportive work culture further become key factors for job satisfaction among the educational leaders, all of which are tenets of transformational leadership as claimed by Kouni et al. (2018). In addition, some of the challenges in the context of Pakistan were observed as the participants mentioned lack of resources, sustainability and professional development opportunities. In order to cater these challenges, the opinions of the respondents suggested allocation of resources and sustainable action plan among few of the ways through which the challenges can be facilitated by the national and local governments and private bodies. Overall, the findings of the study indicate that the educational leaders in Pakistan practiced many of the features of transformational leadership. The findings also suggest that age and leadership courses also play a role in the patterns of practice of educational models among the educational leaders.

Recommendations

In light of the findings above, it is recommended that policy-makers, government officials, NGOs and educational leaders involved in the education sector should look at the trends in Pakistan in the educational leadership and plan courses according to the contextual situation in order to combat the challenges and improve leadership practice for overall school effectiveness in Pakistan. Additionally, it is suggested that the educational leaders create professional development opportunities, encourage leadership courses and devise sustainable plans in order to deal with unforeseen circumstances. Lastly, future research should explore larger and diverse samples to strengthen generalizability of the findings and gain deeper insights into educational leadership trends in Pakistan’s educational landscape.

References

- Afzal, M., Nadeem, M., & Munawer, S. (2018). Leadership Styles and Change Dynamics in Public Schools of Pakistan. *UMT Education Review*, 1(1), 37-50. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.32350/uer/11/03>
- Arokiasamy, A. R. A., Abdullah, A. G. K., Shaari, M. Z. A., & Ismail, A. (2016). Transformational Leadership of School Principals and Organizational Health of Primary School Teachers in Malaysia. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 229, 151-157. DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2016.07.124>
- Balyer, A., Özcan, K., & Yildiz, A. (2017). Teacher Empowerment: School Administrators Roles. *Eurasian Journal of Educational Research*, 70, 1-18. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.14689/ejer.2017.70.1>
- Brauckmann, S., Pashiardis, P., & Arlestig, H. (2020). Bringing context and educational leadership together: fostering the professional development of school principals. *Professional Development in Education*, 49(1), 4-15. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1080/19415257.2020.1747105>
- Bush, T. (2008). *Leadership and Management Development in Education*. SAGE Publications Ltd. <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781446213605>
- Gamora, R. A. (2014). Influence of Interpersonal relationship on the Administrative and Teaching Performance Among Faculty Administrators. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education Arts, and Sciences*, 1(3), 35-39.
- González-Cruz, T. F., Botella-Carrubi, D., & Martínez-Fuentes, C. (2019). Supervisor leadership style, employee regulatory focus, and leadership performance: A perspectivism approach. *Journal of Business Research*, 101, 660-667. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2019.01.065>
- Jaffe, B. (2012). *Piezoelectric Ceramics*. Elsevier.
- Khalil, U., Iqbal, J., & Khan, A. (2016). Exploring Leadership Styles of School Administrators in Pakistan. *FWU Journal of Social Sciences*, 10(1), 39-47.
- Kouni, Z., Koutsoukos, M., & Panta, D. (2018). Transformational Leadership and Job Satisfaction: The Case of Secondary Education Teachers in Greece. *Journal of Education and Training Studies*, 6(10), 158. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.11114/jets.v6i10.3451>
- Labrague, L. J., Nwafor, C.E., & Tsaras, K. (2020). Influence of toxic and transformational leadership practices on nurses' job satisfaction, job stress, absenteeism and turnover intention: A cross-sectional study. *Journal of Nursing Management*, 28(5), 1104-1113. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1111/jonm.13053>
- Leithwood, K., & Jantzi, D. (2000). The effects of transformational leadership on organizational conditions and student engagement with school. *Journal of Educational Administration*, 38(2), 112-129. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1108/09578230010320064>
- Maamari, B. E., & Saheb, A. (2018). How organizational culture and leadership style affect employees' performance of genders. *The International Journal of Organizational Analysis*, 26(4), 630-651. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1108/ijoa-04-2017-1151>

- Miller, P. (2018). Culture', 'Context', School Leadership and Entrepreneurialism: Evidence from Sixteen Countries. *Education Sciences*, 8(2), 76. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.3390/educsci8020076>
- Morrison, A. R. (2013). Educational leadership and change: Structural challenges in the implementation of a shifting paradigm. *School Leadership & Management*, 33(4), 412-424. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1080/13632434.2013.813462>
- Qayyum, H., Hanif, M. Z., Usman, A., & Hanif, A. (2021). The Impact of Transformational Leadership Style Perceptions on Innovative Work Behavior of Private School Teachers: The Mediating Role of Organizational Culture Perceptions. *Pakistan Journal of Multidisciplinary Research*, 2(2), 182-206.
- Raza, M., Gilani, N., & Waheed S. A. (2021). School Leaders' Perspectives on Successful Leadership: A Mixed Methods Case Study of a Private School Network in Pakistan. *Frontiers in Education* 6. DOI: [10.3389/educ.2021.656491](https://doi.org/10.3389/educ.2021.656491)
- Rafferty, A. E., & Griffin, M. A. (2004). Dimensions of transformational leadership: Conceptual and empirical extensions. *Leadership Quarterly*, 15(3), 329-354. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.leaqua.2004.02.009>
- Senol, H. (2019). Professional Development of Educational Leaders. In, H. Senol (Ed.), *Educational Leadership*. Intech Open. DOI: [10.5772/intechopen.78871](https://doi.org/10.5772/intechopen.78871)
- Simkins, T., Sisum, C., & Memon, M. (2003). School leadership in Pakistan: Exploring the headteacher's role. *School Effectiveness and School Improvement: An International Journal of Research, Policy and Practice*, 14(3), 275-291. Teng, M.L., Mansor, M., & Hashim, Z. (2017). A Review Theory of Transformational Leadership for School. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 7(3), 792-799. DOI: [10.6007/IJARBS/v7-i3/2847](https://doi.org/10.6007/IJARBS/v7-i3/2847)
- Vosloban, R. I. (2012). The Influence of the Employee's Performance on the Company's Growth - A Managerial Perspective. *Procedia. Economics and Finance*, 3, 660-665. DOI: [https://doi.org/10.1016/s2212-5671\(12\)00211-0](https://doi.org/10.1016/s2212-5671(12)00211-0)