



RESEARCH PAPER

The Punjab and Global Governance: Lessons from the Advanced Models of Alberta, Zurich, and Massachusetts

¹Osama Sharoon,* ²Dr. Ghulam Mustafa and ³Sami Ullah Farooq

1. PhD Scholar, Department of Political Science, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan
2. Associate Professor, Department of International Relations, Government College University Faisalabad, Punjab, Pakistan
3. Scholar of Development Administration from Civil Service of Pakistan

***Corresponding Author:** ghulammustafa@gcuf.edu.pk

ABSTRACT

The research seeks to discover the reasons behind the success of the advanced governance models of Alberta, Zurich, and Massachusetts with the vision to provide lessons and strategies for the transformation of the Punjab Governance. Since the inception of Pakistan, the Punjab has struggled to achieve effective governance, with no solution proving to be a panacea for its persistent inefficiencies. By employing Ostrom's Institutional Analysis and Development (IAD) framework, this study adopts a mixed methodological approach to collect and analyze the data, discovering transcendental strategies and golden principles of the global models. The results ascribe the factors of open-system approach, ICT and data Governance, specialised human resources, and policy alignment as the chief reasons for the robustness of modernised models of Alberta, Zurich, and Massachusetts. Consequently, the study offers policy recommendations for the Punjab Governance model to undergo reformation by application of the open-system model aimed at enhancing efficiency in line with global standards.

KEYWORDS Alberta Model, Massachusetts Model, Punjab Governance, Zurich Model

Introduction

In the world of globalization, there is no room for a closed-system approach in the field of governance. Modern governance, evolving and developing unprecedentedly in a rapid way, requires continuous reengineering of the existing processes, systems, and structures. The Governance Model of the Punjab, caught up in the labyrinth of manifold challenges is strangled in the web of predicament due to multi-faceted factors (Kanie et al., 2019). This model of the Punjab provides a perfect abode for a closed-system approach, unable to meet global standards. It is confronting the bale of the traditional approach, with the human resource not trained to meet the modern trends of governance. Hampered promotion structures, demotivation due to many factors, absence of performance audits, parochial KPIs, lack of reward system, and faulty accountability mechanism have dragged the cart of governance of Punjab into the mud of stagnancy. A very serious effort is required for its transformation with a view to meeting the international trends and benchmarks related to the targets of governance. Thus, with a keen study and analysis of the key areas of strengths of advanced models of Alberta, Zurich, and Massachusetts, Punjab can learn strategies to ensure good governance in its jurisdiction. This transformational strategy of comparative study will allow the incorporation of golden principles, systems, and approaches of these transcendental models into the Punjab Governance, thus allowing the attainment of international goals of development.

Literature Review

This research investigates the global governance models of Alberta, Zurich, and Massachusetts with a focus on finding the lessons for Punjab Governance, Pakistan. For this purpose, various secondary sources were consulted. Scholars like Rosenau (2012), Scholte (2004), and Barnett & Paterson (2014) highlight subnational roles in addressing global

challenges like climate change and sustainable development. Levi-Faur & Vogel (2013) and Sassen (2005) further explore subnational governance's contribution to global governance outcomes. By analyzing Alberta, Zurich, and Massachusetts, this study identifies transferable governance strategies for Punjab. Hughes & Falkner (2018) examine Alberta's energy innovations aligned with SDGs. Owusu-Acheampong & Smith (2020) highlight the political hurdles of carbon pricing, while Powell & Parlee (2022) focus on Indigenous participation in resource development. Hajdu & Meyer (2023) emphasize decentralization and multi-level governance in Zurich, aligning with Kanie et al. (2019) on "rules to goals" strategies for sustainability. Light (2004) and Bryson et al. (2018) explore the Massachusetts model of New Public Management, offering insights into Punjab's public administration reforms. Shahrukh et al. (2023) provide a comprehensive analysis of the predicaments of the Punjab administration, while Mujtaba (2023) highlights the challenges posed by Punjab's current political climate. Further research is needed to adapt global governance best practices for Punjab, assess Punjab's institutional capacity for implementing these practices, and explore the role of various actors in supporting governance reforms. This study aims to bridge these gaps and foster an inclusive approach to global governance in Punjab.

Material and Methods

The study applies Ostrom's IAD framework, using a mixed-methods approach to gather and analyze data. A review of institutional frameworks, policies, and governance rules & laws, official correspondences in Punjab, Alberta, Zurich, and Massachusetts is the key source for data collection. Special focus has been placed on the "rules-in-use," decision-making processes, and resource allocations as defined within the IAD framework. Interviews with government officials, policymakers, and experts were used to gather insights into the "action situations" and how actors operate within institutional constraints. The interviews explored the actors' roles, governance challenges, and resource management in the context of global governance. Successful practices and the interplay of institutional arrangements, actor strategies, and governance outcomes were analyzed within the IAD framework. Data was analyzed through the lens of the IAD framework, identifying the core components such as action arenas, institutional rules, and actor strategies. Comparative case study methods were also used to highlight how institutional configurations in each region affect global governance outcomes and provide insights into Punjab's governance model.

Alberta State Model, Canada

The governance structure and system of Alberta Province in Canada are specially designed for the achievement of public service delivery, implementation of policies of the state and support of the missions of the provincial government. Alberta's Governance structures and systems work in the following setup:

Alberta's Premier Office

In Alberta, the administrative head of the province is the Premier, primarily responsible for heading the provincial governance. He is the fountain of top-level planning, organizing, human resources management, and financial management of the province. The Premier's Office is the central administrative unit of the provincial government of Alberta. This office supports the Premier in decision-making, coordinating with all government activities, and setting the policy agenda for the province.

Alberta's Departments

The Alberta Provincial Government is systematically divided into multiple specialized Departments, each responsible for specific public policy areas and public service

delivery. These departments are primarily headed by Ministers and Civil servants (Owusu-Acheampong & Smith, 2020). Departments of specialized nature like Education, Energy, Health Services, Infrastructure, and Environment & Parks Department and, Treasury Board & Finance are marked with a high level of efficiency.

Alberta's Civil Service

The provincial civil service of Alberta consists of career professional civil servants who steer the working of various provincial government departments and agencies. There is no concept of promotion in the Alberta Provincial Government. The induction of Civil servants is based on pure merit and professional expertise, thus playing an essential role in implementing public policies, in quality providing public services, and in ensuring good governance.

Independent Commissions and Authorities

The Alberta Provincial Government has multiple independent and specialized Commissions and Authorities, each responsible for its specific functions. Famous Commissions of Alberta Province are the Alberta Utilities Commission, the Human Rights Commission, and the Alberta Energy Regulator (Owusu-Acheampong & Smith, 2020).

Local Governance

Alberta Governance is further divided into municipalities, each with its local government system. These Local governments in municipalities are responsible for providing service delivery at the community level. This shows the delegation of authority to the bottom level of governance.

Public Agencies and Crown Corporations

Alberta Province has multiple Public Agencies and Crown Corporations, each responsible for specialized public service delivery. Examples of these are Alberta Innovates, Alberta Gaming, Liquor, and Cannabis Commissions. The governance structure of Alberta operates under the matrix of the province's constitution and laws, with a keen focus on efficient public service delivery, economic growth, and addressing the needs of the general populace.

Tracing the roots of the success of Alberta's Governance:

Following are the areas of strength of Alberta Governance for the attainment of efficiency in good governance and development:

- **Excellent Human Resource Management:** Government Officers are highly paid. Executive Manager II, I and Senior Manager get a minimum salary of \$6,216.88, \$ 5, 08.46, and \$3,548.95 respectively every fortnight. The HR of Alberta is highly advanced enough to transform the development sector of the state.
- **Motivation of the staff:** Alberta's Public Service not only provides an extremely motivational working environment to the staff, but also it ensures the mental and psychological well-being of the employees and their family members including dependents, spouses and partners. Every type of employee-permanent, contractual or waged- is entitled to such utility. Under 'The Employee and Family Assistance Program', Alberta Governance makes sure to support its staff and families against mental issues like drug addiction, depression and anxiety. The employees and their families have great access to medical professionals i.e. Nurses, dieticians, and doctors. These health services are in addition to the salary package.

- **Welfare of the employees:** Albertan employees get benefits beyond the Provincial health care. They get disability allowance, group life insurance, medicines, and dental facilities.
- **Public Policy Alignment:** The public policy in Alberta Province has been fully aligned from the top to bottom level governance for the achievement of Sustainable Development Goals, enabling every provincial government policy and initiative to ensure sustainability in decision-making processes (Powell & Parlee, 2022).
- **Private-Public Collaboration and Partnerships:** The governance of Alberta is marked with great engagement between the civil society to foster collaboration and partnership for the implementation of Sustainable Development Goals.
- **Data Governance and Monitoring:** Alberta Governance, utilizing a comprehensive data collection mechanism for the mission of monitoring systems, adheres to data-based decision-making and tracks the progression towards the achievement of SDGs. It also successfully identifies key areas for improvement in the implementation of the SDGs in the Province.
- **Sustainable Economic Growth:** The governance of Alberta is marked with a very keen focus on sustainable economic growth, to achieve Sustainable Development Goals of responsible consumption, decent work, and economic development.
- **Renewable Energy Transition:** Alberta's model has a very deep focus on energy generation from renewable energy and the reduction of greenhouse gas emissions. In this way, it has greatly contributed to the Sustainable Development Goals of Affordable and Clean Energy (Goal 7) and Climate Action (Goal 13).
- **Climate Governance:** Alberta's governance has ensured efficient management of natural resources for the mission of biodiversity conservation, to achieve SDGs of responsible consumption, and climate action. It is marked with very effective and intelligent sustainable land use practices that support Sustainable Development Goals in Alberta related to responsible consumption and production and life on land. Adhering to green innovation and adopting sustainable technologies have driven progress in Alberta toward environmental safety (Hughes & Falkner, 2018).
- **Equity in Governance:** The Governance of Alberta has contributed to the promotion of social inclusion, protection of the rights of the people, and reduction of disparities among the people, thus playing a very effective role in achieving the SDGs of reducing inequalities and leaving no one behind.
- **Education and Innovation:** Due to quality education and innovation, Alberta governance has fostered an excellent skilled workforce, enhanced the culture of research and development, and supported the Sustainable Development Goals related to quality education and innovation.
- **Sustainable Infrastructure and Urban Management:** With a quality focus on development administration, Alberta governance has ensured sustainable infrastructural development, feasible transportation, and advanced urban planning, ensuring implementation of the Sustainable Development Goal of sustainable cities and communities.
- **Health and Well-being:** Alberta has meticulously focused on an advanced healthcare system. This is key to human development in the province.
- **Gender Equality:** In Alberta, there is no concept of gender discrimination and bias. Both women and men have contributed equally to the well-being of the people in the province in the public sector.
- **Inclusive system and community engagement:** By quality political socialization, Alberta's Governance has raised public awareness about the implementation of the SDGs. It has hitherto promoted sustainable behaviours and encourages individual roles from society for the achievement of global goals of Sustainable Development.

- **Circular Economy Initiatives:** Embraced with a circular economy approach, Alberta has meticulously supported the Sustainable Development Goal of Responsible Consumption and Production
- **Values of Transparency and Accountability:** Alberta governance is the paragon of transparency and accountability. This has connected it with the public, enhancing public-private partnerships for manifold initiatives for SDG (Powell & Parlee, 2022).
- **Alignment with Global Governance Paradigm:** Alberta Governance principles objectives and mechanisms have sprung out of the agenda to move in consonance with the global objectives and trends of Governance, based on modern practices.
- **Long-Term Vision:** Alberta has a very long-term vision for development. For this purpose, it has separated political and judicial pillars from Administration. In organizing, HRM, planning, budgeting, staffing, development policy, resource mobilization, audit, taxation, and KPIs the Alberta Model is highly advanced, based on the progressive open-system model.

Zurich Canton Model, Switzerland

Switzerland is divided into Twenty-Six cantons, each having a different and adaptive model of governance. Zurich, a Canton of Switzerland, enjoys the repute of a very strong governance model for the successful implementation of Sustainable Development Goals (Hajdu & Meyer, 2023). The following are the salient features of Zurich's model:

Cantonal Government of Zurich

Like other Cantons of Switzerland, Zurich has a Cantonal Government, the apex administrative body, responsible for the execution of the public policy within the canton.

Cantonal Departments

Under the Cantonal Government, there are various specialized Departments, each responsible for different and specialized policy areas or goals. Called as *Regierungsräte* (Government *Councillors* in English), these heads of Departments are the members of the Cantonal Government.

Districts

The Canton of Zurich is divided into various districts. Each district has its administrative machinery, responsible for the implementation of public policy in the areas of local affairs and public services.

Civil Service

Zurich's civil service model comprises career civil servants who work day in and day out in various cantonal departments and agencies for the effective implementation of public policy. Their induction is based on merit, competence, and specialization, playing an essential role in the implementation of public policies and providing the best public services.

Local Governance

Zurich Canton has multiple municipalities inside its domain, responsible for the effective administration of local governance. These local governance bodies provide the best municipal utility to the people.

Cantonal Authorities and Commissions

Zurich Canton comprises multiple Authorities and Commissions, each responsible for specialized functions of healthcare, environmental protection, education, transportation, etc. Zurich Canton has made great strides in the progression of Sustainable Development Goals and Urban Development.

Factors behind the success of Zurich's Governance

The success of Zurich Canton's Governance Model is ascribable to the following factors:

- Very strong political support system: Zurich's governance model has shown a very strong commitment to implementing the Sustainable Development Goals. What's more encouraging, the governance model of Zurich has the full support of political leaders, making great efforts and showing great will for sound implementation of SDGs.
- Open System Model: The Public Policy in the governance set-up of Zurich is fully aligned at all the levels for the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals of the UN, ensuring coherence and consistency in planning and development efforts. Zurich governance is very actively engaged in global cooperation and adhering to the principle of global governance. It is making great strides towards synchronization of international efforts with that of Canton for the implementation of Sustainable Development Goals.
- Civil Society's support to the Government: Zurich governance is very actively engaged with civil society associations, the business community, the intellectual class, and citizens, encouraging partnership and collaboration towards the attainment of Sustainable Development Goals.
- Integration of ICT with Governance: Decision-making for Governance in Zurich springs out of meticulous ICT-based data collection and sound analysis, ensuring the correct trajectory of the implementation of development initiatives. Being embraced with ICT and innovation, the governance model of Zurich provides efficient and effective strategies for sustainable development
- Sustainable Financial Management: Zurich promotes sustainable finance initiatives, attracting investments for SDG-related projects and businesses.
- Alignment against NTS of Environmental hazards: The Zurich administration has a great focus on environmental sustainability and protection, contributing generously to Sustainable Development Goals related to climate governance like controlling air and water populations, ensuring clean energy production, and saving lives on land and below water. Zurich governance has very well educated and socialized the public to ensure climate adaptation, to prepare for and to respond to the dreaded impact of the non-traditional security threat of climate change, thus contributing to Sustainable Development Goal 13 of Climate Action. Zurich Canton's efforts to preserve biodiversity and natural habitats have contributed to the application of Sustainable Development Goal 15 of Life on Land.
- Social Welfare Governance Approach: Multiple Social welfare initiatives, to support vulnerable populations of Zurich, have contributed to Sustainable Development Goals of quality education, good health and wealth, no poverty, and reduced inequalities.
- Inclusiveness and diversity: There is no prevalence of gender bias in Zurich governance. That is why it has promoted gender equality and inclusivity, thus allowing the success of Sustainable Development Goals of Gender Equality to reduce Inequalities.
- Human Development and Governance: Zurich is home to great educational institutions. Its educational institutions have fostered a culture of mammoth intellectual learning for the populace. In this way, this educational system is promoting the quality

implementation of sustainable development. Very focused and diligent efforts to enhance and improve the healthcare system in Zurich Canton have contributed to the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goal of Good Health and Well-Being.

- **Quality Urban Planning and Sustainable Cities:** Zurich's policies and focus on sustainable urban and spatial planning and infrastructural development have contributed to the implementation of Sustainable Development Goal 11 of Sustainable Cities and Communities in Canton.
- **Political Socialization:** Due to the mechanism of strategic communication campaigns, Zurich's governance has raised public awareness towards the implementation of the SDGs, thus fostering cultural change in Canton towards more sustainable practices.
- **Transparency and Accountability:** Zurich's governance enjoys a very strong mechanism of transparency and accountability in the public sector, enabling public trust in SDG efforts by the government.
- **Inclusive Economic Growth:** The Zurich administration has promoted inclusive economic growth and innovation, thereby supporting Sustainable Development Goal 8 of Decent Work and Economic Growth.

Massachusetts State Model, the US

The governance structure of the Massachusetts State of the United States is marked with extreme efficiency, based on highly advanced principles of New Public Management (Light, 2004). It characterizes efficient implementation of public policy and responsive public service delivery, thus allowing very effective implementation of Sustainable Development Goals. Now the researchers will shed light on salient features of the governance model of Massachusetts:

Governor's Office

On the top of the administrative hierarchy, the office of the Governor is on the status of the top level. The Governor, in the state governance of Massachusetts, is the Chief Executive of the State, primarily responsible for the implementation of public policy, overseeing the progress of the State Agencies, and playing the leadership role in policy guidelines. This office plays a pivotal role in coordinating government activities, planning, organizing, and directing administrative formation.

State Agencies

The governance of Massachusetts State is steered by multiple state agencies, specialized in nature and functions. These agencies are akin to government departments of the Punjab in nature and types. The following are the important state agencies in Massachusetts:

- **Department of Public Health:** It is responsible for the implementation of public policy in the areas of infrastructural development, and safety measures to ensure sustainability for the urban populace.
- **Department of Labor and Workforce Development:** Envisions protection of the labour class in industries and other sectors of the workplace. This State Agency of Massachusetts ensures the development of human resources for welfare and skill building.
- **Department of Education:** Enables the quality level of education from the school level to research-based higher education. This State Agency is responsible for infrastructural development in the schools, colleges, and universities for the provision of quality education to the populace. It also provides quality research platforms and innovative

education to the students. That is why this state is home to the best University in the World i.e. University of Massachusetts.

- Department of Environmental Protection: To protect the lives of the people, this state agency fulfils the purpose of environmental pollution. It is responsible for protecting the air, water, and soil from hazardous pollutants of industrial and other wastes.
- Department of Transportation: The US State of Massachusetts has an advanced transportation infrastructure. It has an excellent mechanism for facilitating the commuters, facilitating their safe personal and professional journeys, thanks to perfect spatial planning by this state agency.
- Department of Housing and Community Development: Property rights are among the three most important human rights in the US and the world. For this errand, the US state of Massachusetts has the Housing and Community Development Department, responsible for highly advanced and disciplined models of layout plans for the housing zones, parking spaces, commercial hubs, amusement or recreational zones, and study or library zones to ensure the best standards of life.

Executive Offices

In Massachusetts, the Executive Offices play a very significant role in the implementation of public policy. The Executive Office for Administration and Finance is responsible for ensuring transparency as it oversees the state's budget, screens financial management, and monitors the role of human resources functions for efficient use of resources and for fixing fiscal responsibility. Similarly, the Executive Office for Housing and Economic Development is the propellant factor for the promotion of economic development, support of business activity, and providing solutions to housing needs in the state.

Local Governance Mechanism

The state of Massachusetts is segregated into municipalities, each of them having its own local government. These systems of local governments in each municipality perform the functions of municipal-level services in various sectors of development, cleanliness, market regulation, parking places, commercialization of maps, community development residential layouts, etc.

Civil Service System

The Civil Service System of Massachusetts, steered by professional civil servants, is responsible for the execution of state public policies by state agencies and departments. Whereas the induction of these Civil servants in Massachusetts is based on the principles of merit and expertise, specialization and professionalism, thus allowing quality implementation of public policy and service delivery for the general populace.

Formation of Commissions and Authorities

In addition to state agencies, the governance of Massachusetts comprises multiple specialized commissions and authorities, performing multiple specialized functions. The Massachusetts Bay Transportation Authority and the Massachusetts Gaming Commission are examples of these administrative units.

The Values of Oversight and Accountability

The governance of Massachusetts has various oversight bodies to ensure the prevalence of accountability, transparency, and rule of law in the state. This included the Office of the Inspector General, which is responsible for the assurance of these tasks.

Causes of the Success of the Governance Model of Massachusetts

The governance structure of Massachusetts, operating in consonance with the state's constitution and laws, is a highly people-centric, public service-oriented, and responsive model (Light, 2004). It is characterized by very innovative administrative practices of New Public Management. The success of the governance model of Massachusetts State in the US in the implementation of Sustainable Development Goals is primarily due to the following factors:

- **Global-local policy integration:** The governance model of Massachusetts aligns state policies and initiatives, in total consonance with the SDGs and other global initiatives or goals, therefore incorporating the global development goals into its local decision-making processes and systems.
- **Excellent Administrative Coordination:** In Massachusetts, the state agencies very actively collaborate with other government departments and authorities for the implementation of SDG-related projects, causing very effective resource management and ensuring concerted efforts for the achievement of the state's goals.
- **Data Policy Management:** The governance of Massachusetts, believing in a very smart mechanism of comprehensive data analysis to steer the progression of the state towards the Sustainable Development Goals, keeps guiding the policymakers on the recent trends and future challenges. This data-oriented civil service mechanism has given impetus to quality and predictive planning for an effective governance model for the state.
- **Public-Private Partnership:** Public-private partnership, based on the government's sound coordination with the private sector and civil society, in essence, has led to the effective implementation of Sustainable Development Goals in Massachusetts. The governance of Massachusetts envisions the implementation of Sustainable Development Goals, by the strategy of input from diverse stakeholders, fostering inclusiveness and equity.
- **State-Local Government Coordination:** Excellent coordination or collaboration of State Government with municipalities and local governments has synchronized its efforts and visions with the latter for the implementation of Sustainable Development Goals
- **Governance, Innovation and Technology:** The governance model of Massachusetts, due to the prevalence of innovation and technology, has seen the dawn of perfect implementation and continuous monitoring of SDG-related programs and projects.
- **Sustainable Financial Management:** Massachusetts governance has very sound and sustainable financial mechanisms to continuously fund SDG projects and initiatives in the state.
- **Public-Socialization on SDGs:** The Massachusetts administrative model has educated and socialized the public on the targets of SDGs, fostering a culture of popular engagement and individual efforts toward the achievement of these goals.
- **Climate Action Policy:** Environmental challenges, the most dangerous and unprecedented perils to the world, are among the chief concerns for the administration of Massachusetts, focusing mainly on climate action and contributing to SDG 13.
- **Healthcare Access and Quality:** The healthcare system of Massachusetts is one of the best systems in the world, enhancing healthcare access and improving healthcare in the state (Bryson et al, 2018)
- **Quality Education:** Massachusetts is home to the best University in the world, due to highly advanced educational infrastructure and spending on this sector. Quality education in the state has resulted in the achievement of SDGs.

- **Inclusive Economic Growth:** Policies promoting inclusive economic growth and reducing inequalities contribute to SDG 1 (No Poverty) and SDG 8 (Decent Work and Economic Growth).
- **Environmental Safety:** Massachusetts focuses on the conservation and preservation of natural resources and ecosystems in the state, thus aligning with SDG 15 of life on land.
- **Social Welfare:** In Massachusetts, various social welfare programs add to support the vulnerable segments to ensure reduced inequality in the state, contributing to Sustainable Development Goals 1 and 10.
- **Sustainable Urban Development:** With quality and rational public policy-making for the support of sustainable urban development and infrastructural development, Massachusetts governance has efficiently achieved the SDG 11 of Sustainable Cities and Communities (Bryson et al, 2018)
- **Gender Equality in the Governance Sector:** The governance model of this state is marked with the promotion of gender equality and women's empowerment, thus aligning with SDG 5 Gender Equality. There is no concept of gender bias in the governance, society, and culture of the state.
- **Adaptive Governance:** The administrative model of Massachusetts ensures adaptive governance, adopting the best and most innovative strategies to address unprecedented challenges and to make the best use of opportunities for quality implementation of SDG in the state

Extremely advanced Financial Systems, quality Urban Planning & Design, outstanding Municipal Services, E-Governance, excellent service delivery, sky-touched development administration, policy alignment with SDGs, continuous administrative development, sustainability, efficiency, modern city planning, responsive spatial planning, welfare orientation, relevant KPIs, transparency, and accountability are the chief factors for the success of the transcendental open system models of Alberta, Zurich, and Massachusetts. These golden principles of governance have great implications for the transformation of the Punjab Governance.

Conclusion

The inefficiency of the Punjab Governance Model is a product of its reliance on a closed-system approach, which has not only barricaded innovation and responsiveness but also brought heterogeneous anathemas of a systematic, procedural, and structural nature. Despite decades of yearning, Pakistan has struggled to achieve good governance, largely due to the absence of a dynamic, adaptive framework. Ostrom's Institutional Analysis and Development (IAD) framework reveals that Punjab's governance suffers from rigid institutional structures, lack of stakeholder engagement, and poor adaptability to changing socio-political contexts. The comparative analysis with Alberta, Zurich, and Massachusetts highlights stark contrasts in governance practices, particularly in areas of public participation, transparency, development policy, planning, organizing, Human Resource Management, responsiveness and accountability. Punjab's model appears outdated and insular, failing to integrate best practices from more advanced governance systems. This research critically argues that without embracing an open-system approach and incorporating lessons from global governance models like that of Alberta, Zurich, and Massachusetts, Punjab's governance framework will continue to lag, undermining public service delivery, and overall development in the region.

The Punjab Governance has been strangled in the abyss of manifold challenges (Sharoon, 2024). Its laws, primarily drafted in the days of the Colonial Era, are outdated and antiquated, in dissonance with the objectives and trends of modern governance (Shahrukh et al, 2022). The rule-oriented outlook has lost popular confidence in the sector of Governance of the Punjab (Sharoon & Mustafa, 2024). Over-dependence on the lower staff

has made the officers dependent on the officials, thereby giving impetus to corruption. At the Divisional, District and *Tehsil* levels of Administration, the Commissioner, the Deputy Commissioner, and the Assistant Commissioner respectively do not have the proper power (they only have supervisory powers) to control the field officers as these officers are more inclined to comply with the priorities of provincial departments. The outstanding performers get demotivated from the system due to a lack of reward and acknowledgement from the state. Frequently interventions and faulty accountability mechanisms have further clouded the spring of development administration. Antiquated modes of communication (Government of Pakistan, 2024), traditional administrative culture dysfunctional model of hierarchy, and lack of specialized orientation (Mujtaba, 2023) have brought the Governance of the Province to a standstill. The absence of data governance (Shahrukh et al, 2023) in order to determine the parameters for transfers, postings, day-to-day tasks, planning, organizing, and development policy has cut a swathe through the Governance paradigm of the Province (Kellerman, 1973). Rampant corruption, absence of strict internal accountability, odious role of mafias (Muzaffar, et. al., 2024; Tanoli, 2017) and tehsil-level pressure groups have put the spanner in the wheel of the progress of the Governance of Punjab. What's more, the absence of performance audits in promotions is another discouraging aspect for outstanding officers. With the current Governance Framework of the Punjab, the general populace of the province will struggle to see the dawn of development and progression. Therefore, the facts gleaned from the study of these three advanced governance models suggest many lessons and recommendations for the Punjab Governance Paradigm. Liberation of the Executive pillar from politicization particularly in the fields of development policy, KPIs, and human resource management is a dire need of time for the Punjab. ICT-based Data- Governance, introduction to new development-driven KPIs, governance-friendly laws and an open system approach are the most urgent changes required for revamping Punjab's governance (Robbins & Judge, 2019). The Punjab Governance requires Business Process Engineering in its systems, procedures, and structures to meet international goals and global standards. In addition, instilling motivation among the Civil Servants is urgently required. For its true transformation, the Punjab Governance has to develop an advanced Financial System, ensure quality Urban Planning & Design, accelerate transcendental Municipal administration, introduce E-Governance service delivery, monitor administrative development, steer development administration, conjure up sustainability, implement city planning, add to responsiveness, transparency, and accountability.

References

- Bryson, J. M., Holzer, M., & Crosby, B. C. (2018). The transformation of public governance in Massachusetts: Assessing the legacy of new public management. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 28(4), 783-798.
- Hajdu, M., & Meyer, M. (2023). Decentralization and multi-level governance for sustainable development: Insights from the Zurich region, Switzerland. *Sustainability in Science, Engineering, and Technology*, 3(1), 1-10.
- Hughes, D., & Falkner, R. (2018). Alberta's energy innovation system: Aligning with the sustainable development goals. *Energy Research & Social Science*, 40, 84-92
- Kanie, N., Griggs, D., Young, O., Waddell, S., Shrivastava, P., Haas, P. M., & Kőrösi, C. (2019). Rules to goals: Emergence of new governance strategies for sustainable development. *Sustainability Science*, 14, 1745-1749
- Kellerman, B. (1973). The Wilsonian dichotomy: Merit and politics in American public administration. *Public Administration Review*, 33(5), 495-505.
- Light, P. C. (2004). New public management in the American states: Assessing the Massachusetts model. *Governance: An International Journal of Policy and Administration*, 17(3), 423-452.
- Mujtaba, S.B. (2023, August 28). Rift between PAS, and PMS Officers surfaces again. *The Nation*.
- Muzaffar, M., Fern, Y. S., & Yaseen, Z (2024). Good Governance and Citizen's Trust in Pakistan: A Moderation Effect of Unethical Behavior, *Asian Journal of Human Services*, 26, 91-108
- Owusu-Acheampong, J., & Smith, K. (2020). Governing for climate change: Alberta's carbon pricing policy and the politics of transition. *Journal of Environmental Policy & Governance*, 30(4), 379-402.
- Pakistan, G., O. (2024). *Letter No F. No. 12(13)/92-E-S (Police) dated 26.1.2024*. Cabinet Secretariat, Establishment Division, Federal Government of Pakistan.

- Powell, R., & Parlee, B. (2022). Indigenous participation in resource development in Alberta: Challenges and opportunities for reconciliation. *Canadian Public Policy/Analyse de politique canadienne*, 48(3), 383-402.
- Robbins, S. P., & Judge, T. A. (2019). *Organizational behavior (18th Ed.)*. Pearson.
- Shahrukh, M., Mustafa, G., & Sharoon, O. (2022). Governance and Security: Codification and Utility of Security Camping Grounds during the British Empire in Undivided Subcontinent. *Journal of Development and Social Sciences*, 3(4), 619-630.
- Shahrukh, M., Mustafa, G., & Sharoon, O. (2023). Governance and Development: A Comparative Analysis of Administrative Models of Germany's Hamburg State and Pakistan's Punjab Province. *Journal of Development and Social Sciences*, 4(1), 377-394.
- Sharoon, O. (2024). *Sustainable Development Goals: A Case Study of Pakistan's Province (Punjab) in transforming governance for localisation of U.N.O's agenda 2030*. Dissertation, Master of Philosophy, International Relations Department. Government. College University Faisalabad.
- Sharoon, O., Mustafa, G., & Shahrukh, M. (2024). Modernizing the Governance Model of Pakistan for Development and Innovation: Overcoming the Existing Antiquated and Complex Legal Framework. *Journal of Politics and International Studies*. Vol. 10, No. 1, January-June 2024, pp.31-46
- Tanoli, I. (2017, March 8). Lawyers beat up SHO in brawl at City Courts. *The Dawn*. On <https://www.dawn.com/news>.