



RESEARCH PAPER

Evaluating the Influence of Teacher Certification on Educational Outcomes: A Systematic Review

¹Bushra Mustafa Kamal*, ²Shahzad Afzal Kayani and ³Dr Muhammad Jamil Bajwa

1. Lecturer (Education), FSSH, Hamdard University, Islamabad Campus, Pakistan
2. Director (QEC), Hamdard University, Karachi, Pakistan
3. Professor, Department of Education, Northern University, Nowshera, Pakistan

***Corresponding Author:** bushra.mustafa@hamdard.edu.pk

ABSTRACT

This systematic literature review examined the relationship between teacher certification and educational outcomes. After conducting a thorough search of peer-reviewed literature published between 2004 and 2023, 38 relevant studies were selected. The PRISMA guidelines were used to assess the quality and relevance of these studies. The review found that teacher certification generally has a positive impact on teacher performance. Certified teachers often demonstrate higher levels of professional competence, effective classroom management, and increased motivation. However, the influence of certification can vary depending on regional context and implementation practices. Factors like leadership style, job satisfaction, and on-going professional development also play a crucial role in moderating the effects of certification. To enhance the effectiveness of teacher certification programs, it is recommended that they prioritize improving contextual factors and the quality of their implementation.

KEYWORDS Education Quality, Job Satisfaction, Professionalism, Student Achievement, Teacher Certification, Teachers' Licensing, Teacher Motivation, Teacher Performance, Teacher Retention

Introduction

The quality of education is a cornerstone of societal development, and teachers play a pivotal role in shaping student outcomes. Teacher certification, a formal process that validates an individual's qualifications to teach, has long been seen as a crucial factor in ensuring effective instruction. However, the extent to which teacher certification directly influences educational outcomes remains a subject of ongoing debate and research. This systematic review seeks to comprehensively investigate the existing literature on the connection between teacher certification and educational outcomes.

Teacher certification can be understood as a proxy for several factors, including educational attainment, pedagogical knowledge, and professional development. It may also signal a commitment to the teaching profession and a certain level of accountability. However, the effectiveness of teacher certification can vary based on specific contextual factors, the quality of the certification program, and the implementation of certification standards.

This review systematically identifies and analyses relevant studies, including randomized controlled trials, quasi-experimental studies, and observational studies. By scrutinising the methodological rigor of these studies and assessing the consistency of their findings, we can draw conclusions about the overall impact of teacher certification on educational outcomes.

Ultimately, this review aims to contribute to a more nuanced understanding of the complex relationship between teacher certification and student achievement. Based on the strengths and limitations of existing research, this review can inform educational policy decision makers and guide for future research efforts.

Literature Review

Teacher certification remains a crucial mechanism for ensuring educators are equipped to meet the demands of modern classrooms and positively impact student outcomes. As education systems worldwide strive for improvement, teacher certification has gained prominence. Formal certification processes can positively influence educators' attitudes and behaviours.

Research suggests that certified teachers are better able to address students' diverse needs, creating a more supportive learning environment. Many countries implement various certification procedures to enhance teacher quality and improve student achievement. Studies in Indonesia, the United Arab Emirates, and other regions have found that certified teachers often demonstrate higher performance, motivation, and job satisfaction.

Several studies have examined the link between teacher certification and student achievement. Research by Boyd et al. (2007) and others highlights the importance of rigorous certification procedures in producing high-quality teachers. While some studies have found evidence supporting the positive effects of certification on teaching quality and student achievement, others have questioned whether certification alone guarantees competence.

In addition to its impact on individual teachers, teacher certification can also have broader implications for educational organizations. Goldhaber and Anthony (2007) explored national certification as an indicator of effective teaching. Overall, teacher certification plays a significant role in ensuring a qualified and motivated teaching workforce, contributing to improved educational outcomes.

In brief, a variety of benefits of teacher certification have been identified by researchers. Teacher certification can enhance professional growth, enhance instructor motivation and efficiency, and contribute to overall improvements in teaching quality.

Material and Methods

This systematic review adhered to the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) guidelines (Liberati et al., 2009; Moher et al., 2015). A comprehensive search of scholarly databases, including Google Scholar, JSTOR, and PubMed, was conducted using keywords such as 'teacher certification,' 'teacher performance,' 'teacher effectiveness,' 'educational outcomes,' and 'teacher motivation.' A manual search of reference lists was also performed to identify additional relevant studies.

The initial search yielded 82 articles, which were reduced to 72 after removing duplicates. Two independent reviewers screened titles and abstracts based on predefined inclusion and exclusion criteria. After a full-text review, 34 articles were excluded, resulting in 38 studies for final analysis.

A standardized data extraction form was used to capture the following information:

- Author(s) and year of publication
- Study context (country, variables, and educational level)
- Key findings related to teacher certification and performance

Table 1

Inclusion and exclusion criteria of research articles for this literature review

Criteria	Inclusion	Exclusion
Publication Type	Research articles published in peer-reviewed publications	Articles lacking full text accessibility; books, theses, and dissertations

Focus	Empirical studies examining how teacher certification affects teaching effectiveness	Research not specifically focusing on teacher performance or certification
Methodology	Studies utilizing mixed-methods, quantitative, or qualitative data	-
Language	Written in English	Articles in languages other than English

The data extraction process was conducted independently by two reviewers to ensure accuracy and consistency. Any discrepancies were resolved through discussion and consensus.

The findings from the included research articles were synthesized to identify the following key themes:

- The influence of teacher certification on job motivation.
- The relationship between effective instruction and teacher certification.
- The impact of certification on teacher competencies and professional growth.
- Work motivation and job satisfaction.
- Teaching effectiveness and student outcomes.
- Professional competencies and development.

Discourse Analysis

Teachers' certification is widely acknowledged as a tool for improving teaching quality, its effectiveness is contested, and its impact often depends on contextual factors such as local educational policies, cultural attitudes, and the availability of professional development.

The critical perspectives on certification highlight the need for more integrated approaches that combine certification with continuous professional growth and policy reforms. The key themes, patterns, and discourses evident in these articles include multi-faceted view of teacher certification, with varying implications for teacher professionalism, motivation, performance, and student outcomes.

Certification in Different Cultural Contexts

Studies from Indonesia (Amalia & Saraswati, 2018; Limbong & Lumbantoruan, 2022) have shown that there is room for great variation under the same "formalized" certification processes, given the local educational systems, policies, and cultural values. Discourse, referring to the localized effect of certification, means that where it has an enhancing effect on motivation and performance, in others, it may not for some systemic and policy-related challenges.

Motivation and Performance

Albaar et al. (2023) and Narmaditya & Suratman (2020) discussed how certification impacts teacher motivation and, consequently, their performance. In the Indonesian context, certification often leads to higher compensation, which can drive motivation. However, there is an underlying debate about whether certification truly enhances intrinsic motivation, or if it merely incentivizes teachers through extrinsic rewards such as salary increases, as seen in Angrist & Guryan (2008).

Teacher Certification and Professionalism

Studies by Abdallah & Musah (2021) and Agung et al. (2017), examined the role of teacher certification in improving educators' professionalism. These articles often frame certification as a formal process aimed at validating teacher competence and enhancing their

professional identity. For example, Abdallah & Musah (2021) explored local perceptions in the UAE, suggesting that licensing is perceived as a tool to standardize teaching quality. Agung et al. (2017) similarly highlighted how Indonesian teachers view certification as crucial for their professional growth, though this process may also be seen as a bureaucratic hurdle in some instances.

Role of Professional Development

Agung et al. (2017); Darling-Hammond (2016); Bowling & Ball (2018), Habibi et al. (2019) argued that certification should not be seen as an endpoint but as part of a continuous process of professional development. This aligns with the arguments of Freeman et al. (2014), who emphasized the need for pre-service teacher training and ongoing professional development to sustain the benefits of certification. The integration of professional development with certification is identified as part of a larger system that includes mentoring, training, and reflective practice, rather than a standalone measure of teacher quality.

Teacher Retention and Attrition

Cowan & Goldhaber (2016) and Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond (2019) addressed the issue of teacher retention in relation to certification. The discourse in these articles touched the broader implications of certification for teacher career trajectories, suggesting that certified teachers may have lower attrition rates. However, they also highlighted the complexity of factors that contribute to teacher turnover, indicating that certification alone is not sufficient to retain high-quality teachers.

Certification as a Quality Measure

Boyd et al. (2007), Goldhaber & Anthony (2007) Setiawati (2020) and Agung et al. (2017); Kusumawardhani (2017) provided an economic perspective on teacher certification as catalyst for increasing teacher effectiveness and examined whether it raises teacher quality. The discourse in these articles focused on evidence-based research and statistical analysis, where certification is scrutinized for its actual impact on educational outcomes. These studies suggested that certification may serve as a quality signal, it does not always correlate with improved student performance.

Certification and Student Outcomes

A subset of articles, such as those by Kane, Rockoff, & Staiger (2008) and Sirait (2016), concentrated on the relationship between teacher certification and student achievement. These studies approached certification from an outcome-based perspective, assessing whether certified teachers are more effective in improving student learning. The findings are mixed, contributing to a discourse that questions whether certification alone can guarantee better educational outcomes, particularly in diverse educational environments like those of Indonesia (Kusumawardhani, 2017) and the United States (Boyd et al., 2007).

Critique of Certification Policies

Bowling & Ball (2018) and Shuls & Trivitt (2015) engaged with alternative certification models, critiquing traditional certification systems. Their discourse positions alternative certification as either a necessary solution to teacher shortages or a potential compromise in quality. Bowling & Ball (2018), for example, questioned whether alternative certification programs dilute the professionalism of teaching by bypassing rigorous training.

Policy Influence and Reform

Darling-Hammond (2016) and Lankford et al. (2014) discussed the broader policy implications of teacher certification and how research on teaching influences educational reforms. These articles contributed to a policy-oriented discourse, emphasizing the need for evidence-based reforms that consider teacher certification as part of a larger framework of educational improvement. The discourse here is forward-looking, focusing on how certification policies can be aligned with teacher preparation programs and ongoing professional development to create a more sustainable and effective teaching workforce.

Results and Discussion

Country-Wise Distribution of Research

The majority of studies (23 articles) originated from Indonesia, focusing on various aspects of teacher certification and its impact on performance and other variables, particularly motivation. Research from the USA (14 articles) frequently examines the relationship between teacher certification and quality, often within the context of student achievement and teacher retention. One study (1 article) was conducted in the UAE, exploring the effects of teacher licensing on professionalism. Four articles provided a broader perspective, discussing general trends and policies related to teacher certification without focusing on a specific country.

Table 2
Relevant articles on teacher's certification

Country	Number of Articles	Relevant Articles
Indonesia	23	Agung et al. (2017); Albaar et al. (2023); Amalia & Saraswati (2018); Efendi & Yusuf (2021); Hanim et al. (2020); Hidayat (2004); Kusumawardhani (2017); Limbong & Lumbantoruan (2022); Lie et al. (2021); Manullang & Waspodo (2023); Mislia et al. (2021); Narmaditya & Suratman, (2020); Phytanza & Burhaein (2020); Putra & Bustami (2023); Rusilowati & Wahyudi (2020); Rusman (2020); Setiawati (2020); Sulastri et al. (2023); Suratman et al. (2020); Sudja & Yuesti (2017); Taryana et al. (2023); Tambingon (2018);
UAE	1	Abdallah & Musah (2021)
USA	14	Angrist & Guryan (2008); Boyd et al. (2007); Bowling & Ball (2018); Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond (2019); Cowan & Goldhaber (2016); Darling-Hammond (2016); Freeman et al. (2014); Goldhaber & Anthony (2007); Goldhaber & Cowan (2014) Henry et al. (2014); Kane et al. (2008); Shuls & Trivitt (2015) Lankford et al. (2014); Zhang & Zeller (2016)

Indonesia has the highest number of relevant studies (23), focusing on various aspects of teacher certification and its impact on performance, motivation, and other variables. Key studies include Amalia & Saraswati (2018), Agung et al. (2017), Hanim et al. (2020), Mislia et al. (2021), Phytanza and Burhaein (2020), Putra and Bustami (2023), Tambingon (2018), Sudja and Yuesti (2017), Rusilowati & Wahyudi (2020), and Rusman (2020), which collectively provide a comprehensive understanding of the positive effects of certification on teacher performance and skill development.

Rusilowati & Wahyudi (2020) and Rusman (2020) developed a model to improve certified teacher performance in private vocational schools, focusing on strategies to enhance teaching effectiveness. The UAE has a single relevant study by Abdallah & Musah (2021), which found that teacher licensing positively affects educators' professionalism.

Fourteen relevant research papers from the USA include Angrist & Guryan (2008), Boyd et al. (2007), Goldhaber & Anthony (2007), Bowling & Ball (2018), Darling-Hammond (2016), Shuls & Trivitt (2015), Cowan & Goldhaber (2016), Freeman et al. (2014), Goldhaber & Cowan (2014), Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond (2019), Zhang & Zeller (2016), Henry et al. (2014), and Freeman et al. (2014). These studies explore various aspects of teacher certification, including its impact on teaching quality, student achievement, teacher retention, and professional development.

Common Variables and Their Frequencies

- The most frequently discussed variable is teacher certification, appearing in 31 articles.
- Work motivation is analysed in 16 articles.
- Teachers' performance is mentioned in 24 articles.
- Studies highlight the importance of continuous professional development and its interaction with teacher certification to improve teaching quality.
- Principals and leadership styles were addressed by Hanim et al. (2020) and Tambingon (2018).
- Job satisfaction, influenced by factors such as certification and work motivation, is also a key variable by Effendi and Yusuf (2021) and Taryana et al. (2023)

Table 3
Relevant articles associated with teacher certification and its influence on educational outcomes

Variable	Frequency	Relevant Articles
Teacher Certification	31	Abdallah & Musah (2021); Agung et al. (2017); Albaar et al. (2023); Amalia & Saraswati (2018); Angrist & Guryan (2008); Boyd et al. (2007); Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond (2019); Cowan & Goldhaber (2016); Darling-Hammond (2016); Efendi & Yusuf (2021); Freeman et al. (2014); Goldhaber & Anthony (2007); Goldhaber & Cowan (2014); Hanim et al. (2020); Hidayat (2004); Kusumawardhani (2017); Limbong & Lumbantoruan (2022); Lie et al. (2021); Manullang & Wasposito (2023); Mislia et al. (2021); Putra & Bustami (2023); Rusman (2020); Rusilowati & Wahyudi (2020); Suratman et al. (2020); Sulastri et al. (2023); Setiawati (2020); Shuls & Trivitt (2015); Sudja & Yuesti (2017); Tambingon (2018); Taryana et al. (2023); Zhang & Zeller (2016)
Work Motivation	15	Abdallah & Musah (2021); Amalia & Saraswati (2018); Darling-Hammond (2016); Efendi & Yusuf (2021); Hidayat (2004); Habibi et al. (2019); Manullang & Wasposito (2023); Putra & Bustami (2023); Rusman (2020); Sulastri et al. (2023); Tambingon (2018); Taryana et al. (2023); Zhang & Zeller (2016)
Teacher Performance	24	Abdallah & Musah (2021); Agung et al. (2017); Albaar et al. (2023); Amalia & Saraswati (2018); Boyd et al. (2007); Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond (2019); Cowan & Goldhaber (2016); Darling-Hammond (2016); Efendi & Yusuf (2021); Freeman et al. (2014); Goldhaber & Anthony (2007); Goldhaber & Cowan (2014); Hanim et al. (2020); Hidayat (2004); Kusumawardhani (2017); Limbong & Lumbantoruan (2022); Lie et al. (2021); Manullang & Wasposito

		(2023); Mislia et al. (2021); Putra & Bustami (2023); Rusman (2020); Rusilowati & Wahyudi (2020); Suratman et al. (2020); Sulastri et al. (2023); Setiawati (2020); Shuls & Trivitt (2015); Sudja & Yuesti (2017); Tambingon (2018); Taryana et al. (2023); Zhang & Zeller (2016)
Tenure	1	Phytanza & Burhaein (2020)
Professional Development	3	Agung et al. (2017); Darling-Hammond (2016); Bowling & Ball (2018)
Competencies	6	Rusilowati & Wahyudi (2020); Efendi & Yusuf (2021); Amalia & Saraswati (2018); Agung et al. (2017); Tambingon (2018)
Job Satisfaction	6	Efendi & Yusuf (2021); Taryana et al. (2023); Amalia & Saraswati (2018); Agung et al. (2017)
Principal Leadership Styles	2	Hanim et al. (2020); Tambingon (2018)
Teaching Quality	3	Setiawati (2020); Agung et al. (2017); Kusumawardhani (2017)
Work Environment	3	Sudja & Yuesti (2017); Agung et al. (2017)
Government Policy	2	Limbong & Lumbantoruan (2022), Darling-Hammond (2016)
Student Achievement	3	Kusumawardhani (2017); Setiawati (2020); Darling-Hammond (2016)
Teacher Retention	4	Zhang & Zeller (2016); Habibi et al. (2019); Albaar et al. (2023); Cowan & Goldhaber (2016)
Teacher Preparation Programs	5	Freeman et al. (2014); Henry et al. (2014); Goldhaber & Cowan (2014); Putra & Bustami (2023); Taryana et al. (2023)

Discussion

This literature review examined the influence of teacher certification on performance, finding consistent and varied results across different contexts globally.

Certification and Teacher Performance

Numerous studies have indicated a positive relationship between teacher certification and performance. Abdallah and Musah (2021) found improved professionalism among certified teachers in the UAE, while Hidayat (2004) observed enhanced performance among certified teachers in Indonesia. Angrist and Guryan (2008) and Boyd et al. (2007) provided empirical evidence supporting the effectiveness of certification requirements. Goldhaber and Anthony (2007) reported that board-certified teachers are more effective. Rusilowati and Wahyudi (2020) found significant improvements in teaching methods and subject knowledge among certified teachers.

Certification and Teaching Quality

Kusumawardhani (2017) and Setiawati (2020) analyzed the impact of teacher certification on the quality of learning in primary schools, finding positive effects on educational practices and student outcomes. Darling-Hammond (2016) further supports this argument, examining the broader implications of certification on policy and practice.

Certification and Work Motivation

Manullang and Waspodo (2023) and Suratman et al. (2020) found that certification and work motivation positively influence teacher performance. Suratman et al. (2020) reported increased motivation among certified teachers.

Certification and Preparation Programs

Certification alone is not a sufficient indicator of teacher effectiveness. Cowan and Goldhaber (2016) and Shuls and Trivitt (2015) argued that certification works better when combined with other factors, such as pilot programs. Shuls and Trivitt (2015) found a correlation between licensure and effectiveness, while Cowan and Goldhaber (2016) revealed a positive correlation between board certification and teacher professional effectiveness.

Zhang and Zeller (2016) noted a positive relationship between teacher preparation and retention, suggesting that well-prepared teachers are more likely to stay in the profession. Freeman et al. (2014) and Goldhaber and Cowan (2014) emphasized the importance of teacher preparation programs in improving teacher quality through accreditation policies and classroom management training. Carver-Thomas and Darling-Hammond (2019) found that alternative certification was associated with higher turnover rates.

Certification and Other Variables

Several studies have explored how certification interacts with other variables such as job satisfaction and managerial leadership. Efendi and Yusuf (2021) studied the effects of competency, compensation, and motivation on employee performance, with job satisfaction as an intervening variable.

Conclusion

It is concluded that teacher certification and licensing reveal that while certification is widely recognized as a means to enhance teacher professionalism, motivation, and performance, its effectiveness in improving student outcomes remains contested. The articles examined highlight the complexity of certification systems across various contexts, where cultural, educational, and policy factors significantly influence the impact of certification on teaching quality. There is a consensus that certification alone is insufficient as a standalone solution; it must be accompanied by continuous professional development, intrinsic motivation, and supportive policies that address both teacher and student needs. The critical examination of traditional and alternative certification models further underscores the need for a more integrated, flexible, and evidence-based approach to teacher certification. Moving forward, reforms in certification systems must take into account the diverse realities of education systems while focusing on long-term teacher development and retention. This analysis provides a foundation for future recommendations aimed at improving the efficacy of teacher certification, ensuring that it contributes to both teacher and student success.

Recommendations

Based on these findings, the following recommendations are proposed for future research.

- Policymakers should ensure that alternative pathways maintain rigorous standards for teacher preparation and effectiveness.
- Policymakers should ensure that certification systems are flexible and address the unique challenges of different regions and educational environments.
- Certification policies should include provisions for supporting teacher retention, such as career development opportunities, mentorship programs, and workload management. These measures can help certified teachers stay in the profession and reduce attrition.
- Certification should be integrated into a larger educational framework that includes pre-service training, ongoing development, and school support systems. This holistic approach will better equip teachers for the diverse demands of the classroom.

- Certification systems should be designed to foster intrinsic motivation rather than solely focusing on extrinsic rewards like salary increases. This can be achieved by providing opportunities for professional growth, peer collaboration, and recognition of teacher expertise.
- Certification should not be seen as the final step in teacher preparation but should be part of a continuous process of professional development. Governments and educational institutions should create systems that support ongoing teacher training, mentoring, and reflective practices.
- Collaboration between policymakers, educators, and researchers is essential to creating certification systems that are effective and sustainable. Regular feedback from teachers and school administrators should inform policy reforms.
- Further research should focus on the long-term impact of teacher certification on student learning outcomes, retention, and achievement. While short-term positive effects have been documented, more information is needed on the sustainability of these improvements.
- Research should compare the impact of teacher certification programs across different countries and education systems, particularly in Asian countries.
- The impact of certification may vary depending on the type of teaching or specific challenges faced by different groups of teachers. It is recommended that certification standards be reviewed and improved to ensure alignment with best practices and the needs of teachers and students.

By addressing these recommendations, future research can provide a more comprehensive understanding of the effectiveness of teacher certification programs and their broader impact on education globally.

References

- Abdallah, A. K., & Musah, M. B. (2021). Effects of teacher licensing on educators' professionalism: UAE case in local perception. *Heliyon*, 7(11), <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2021.e08348>
- Albaar, M. R., Acim, A., & Abdullah, A. (2023). Impact of Teacher Certification on Teacher Motivation and Performance in State Senior High Schools in Ternate City, Indonesia. *Journal of Educational Management and Learning*, 1(1), 16-21.
- Amalia, L., & Saraswati, T. (2018). The Impact of Competencies Toward Teacher's Performance Moderated By the Certification in Indonesia. *KnE Social Sciences*, 3(10), 86-98, <https://doi.org/10.18502/kss.v3i10.3363>
- Angrist, J. D., & Guryan, J. (2008). Does teacher testing raise teacher quality? Evidence from state certification requirements. *Economics of Education Review*, 27(5), 483-503, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.econedurev.2007.03.002>
- Agung, A. A. G., Gading, I. K., Werang, B. R., Sudiarta, I. G. P., & Marti, N. W. (2017). Investigating teachers' perception on the importance of teachers' certification and of professional development program in Indonesia: An empirical study from Bali. *International Journal of Research Studies in Management*, 6(1), 65-73, DOI: 10.5861/ijrsm.2017.1786
- Boyd, D., Goldhaber, D., Lankford, H., & Wyckoff, J. (2007). The effect of certification and preparation on teacher quality. *The Future of Children*, 45-68.
- Bowling, A. M., & Ball, A. L. (2018). Alternative certification: A solution or an alternative problem?. *Journal of Agricultural Education*, 59(2), 109-122, <https://doi.org/10.5032/jae.2018.02109>
- Carver-Thomas, D., & Darling-Hammond, L. (2019). The trouble with teacher turnover: How teacher attrition affects students and schools. *Education Policy Analysis Archives*, 27(36).
- Cowan, J., & Goldhaber, D. (2016). National board certification and teacher effectiveness: Evidence from Washington State. *Journal of Research on Educational Effectiveness*, 9(3), 233-258, <https://doi.org/10.1080/19345747.2015.1099768>
- Darling-Hammond, L. (2016). Research on teaching and teacher education and its influences on policy and practice. *Educational Researcher*, 45(2), 83-91, <https://doi.org/10.3102/0013189X16639597>
- Efendi, S., & Yusuf, A. (2021). Influence Of Competence, Compensation And Motivation On Employee Performance With Job Satisfaction As Intervening Variable In The Environment Of Indonesian Professional Certification Authority. *International Journal of Economics, Business and Accounting Research (IJEBAR)*, 5(3), 2441-2451, <https://jurnal.stie-aas.ac.id/index.php/IJEBAR>
- Freeman, J., Simonsen, B., Briere, D. E., & MacSuga-Gage, A. S. (2014). Pre-service teacher training in classroom management: A review of state accreditation policy and teacher preparation programs. *Teacher Education and Special Education*, 37(2), 106-120, <https://doi.org/10.1177/0888406413507002>
- Goldhaber, D., & Anthony, E. (2007). Can teacher quality be effectively assessed? National board certification as a signal of effective teaching. *The Review of Economics and Statistics*, 89(1), 134-150, <https://doi.org/10.1162/rest.89.1.134>

- Goldhaber, D., & Cowan, J. (2014). Excavating the teacher pipeline: Teacher preparation programs and teacher attrition. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 65(5), 449-462, <https://doi.org/10.1177/0022487114542516>
- Habibi, B., Hartinah, S., Umam, R., Syazali, M., Lestari, F., Abdurrahman, A., & Jauharyyah, D. (2019). Factor Determinants of Teacher Professionalism as Development of Student Learning Education at SMK PGRI in Tegal City, Indonesia. *Journal of Gifted Education and Creativity*, 6(2), 123-132.
- Hanim, Z., Saleh, M., Soe'oad, R., Kasuma, J., & Fhaeizdhyall, A. (2020). Interaction effect of teacher certification and principal leadership styles towards teacher performance: Empirical evidence of elementary school at Berau district of East Kalimantan province, Indonesia. *International Journal of Advanced and Applied Sciences*, 7(2), 57-62, <https://doi.org/10.21833/ijaas.2020.02.008>
- Henry, G. T., Purtell, K. M., Bastian, K. C., Fortner, C. K., Thompson, C. L., Campbell, S. L., & Patterson, K. M. (2014). The effects of teacher entry portals on student achievement. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 65(1), 7-23, <https://doi.org/10.1177/0022487113503871>
- Hidayat, S. (2004). Analysis on the difference between the teaching performance of certified teachers and non-certified teachers. *Education*, 5, <http://www.mnkjournals.com/ijlrst.htm>
- Kane, T. J., Rockoff, J. E., & Staiger, D. O. (2008). What does certification tell us about teacher effectiveness? Evidence from New York City. *Economics of Education Review*, 27(6), 615-631, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.econedurev.2007.05.005>
- Kusumawardhani, P. N. (2017). Does teacher certification program lead to better quality teachers? Evidence from Indonesia. *Education Economics*, 25(6), 590-618, <https://doi.org/10.1080/09645292.2017.1329405>
- Lankford, H., Loeb, S., McEachin, A., Miller, L. C., & Wyckoff, J. (2014). Who enters teaching? Encouraging evidence that the status of teaching is improving. *Educational Researcher*, 43(9), 444-453, <https://doi.org/10.3102/0013189X14563600>
- Liberati, A., et al. (2009). The PRISMA statement for reporting systematic reviews and meta-analyses of studies that evaluate healthcare interventions: explanation and elaboration. *PLoS Medicine*, 6(7), e1000100.
- Lie, D., Dharma, E., & Sudirman, A. (2021, June). Measurement of Teacher Performance in Pematangsiantar City Middle School Through Teacher Certification, Motivation, and Job Satisfaction. In *2nd Annual Conference on Blended Learning, Educational Technology and Innovation (ACBLETI 2020)* (pp. 396-401). Atlantis Press, <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.210615.077>
- Limbong, M., & Lumbantoruan, J. H. (2022). The Effect of Government Teacher Certification on Teaching Performance Certified vs Uncertified. *Journal of Ultimate Research and Trends in Education*, 4(3), 186-191, <https://doi.org/10.31849/utamax.v4i3.11353>
- Manullang, A. M., & Waspodo, W. (2023). The Effect of Certification and Work Motivation on Teacher's Performance. *JMKSP (Jurnal Manajemen, Kepemimpinan, dan Supervisi Pendidikan)*, 8(2), 1337-1344, <https://doi.org/10.31851/jmksp.v8i2.13195>
- Misliya, M., Alim, A., Usuf, E., Tamsah, H., & Yusriadi, Y. (2021). The Effect of Training and Education and Teacher Certification Allowances on Teachers. *Cypriot Journal of Educational Sciences*, 16(4), 1368-1383.

- Moher, D., Liberati, A., Tetzlaff, J., Altman, D. G., The PRISMA Group. (2009). Preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses: The PRISMA statement. *PLOS Medicine*, 6(7), e1000097.
- Narmaditya, B. S., & Suratman, B. (2020). Does teacher certification promote work motivation and teacher performance? A lesson from Indonesia. *International Journal of Innovation, Creativity and Change*, 11(10), 516-525.
- Phytanza, D. T. P., & Burhaein, E. (2020). The effects of tenure, teacher certification, and work motivation on special needs teacher performance. *Universal Journal of Educational Research*, 8(9), 4348-4356, DOI: 10.13189/ujer.2020.080962
- Putra, E., & Bustami, Y. (2023). Does Certification Program Affect Teacher Performance? Evidence from Sungai Penuh City, Indonesia. *Al-Aulia: Jurnal Pendidikan dan Ilmu-Ilmu Keislaman*, 9(1), 27-40, <https://doi.org/10.46963/aulia.v9i1.917>
- Rusilowati, U., & Wahyudi, W. (2020). The Significance of Educator Certification in Developing Pedagogy, Personality, *Social and Professional Competencies*. 409 (SoRes 2019), 446-451, <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.200225.095>
- Rusman, A. (2020). Model of performance improvement of certified teachers in Private Vocational Schools. *Eurasian Journal of Educational Research*, 20(86), 25-38.
- Setiawati, L. (2020, January). Impact of teacher certification toward learning quality: a case study in elementary school. In *International Conference on Business, Economic, Social Science, and Humanities-Economics, Business and Management Track (ICOBEST-EBM 2019)* (pp. 151-154). Atlantis Press, <https://doi.org/10.2991/aebmr.k.200108.036>
- Shuls, J. V., & Trivitt, J. R. (2015). Teacher effectiveness: An analysis of licensure screens. *Educational Policy*, 29(4), 645-675, <https://doi.org/10.1177/0895904813510777>
- Sirait, S. (2016). Does teacher quality affect student achievement? An empirical study in Indonesia. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 7(27).
- Sudja, I. N., & Yuesti, A. (2017). The influences of education and training, leadership, work environment, teacher certification on discipline and teacher's professionalism in high school at Bali Province. *Scientific Research Journal (SCIRJ)*, 5(9), 102-108.
- Sulastri, T., Kristiawan, M., & Wardiah, D. (2023). The Workplace and Teacher's Certification for Teacher's Performance. *Journal of Social Work and Science Education*, 4(1), 44-56.
- Suratman, B., Wulandari, S. S., Nugraha, J., & Narmaditya, B. S. (2020). Does teacher certification promote work motivation and teacher performance? A lesson from Indonesia. *International Journal of Innovation, Creativity and Change*, 11(10), 516-525.
- Tambingon, H. N. (2018). The influence of principal leadership style and teacher work motivation on the performance of certified teachers at SMA Negeri Kotamobagu, North Sulawesi, Indonesia. *Journal of Education and Learning (EduLearn)*, 12(3), 357-365, <https://doi.org/10.11591/edulearn.v12i3.8248>
- Taryana, T., Riniati, W. O., Al Haddar, G., Sembiring, D., & Mutmainnah, M. (2023). The influence of teacher certification and teaching motivation on teacher performance. *Journal on Education*, 5(3), 6726-6735, <https://doi.org/10.31004/joe.v5i3.1455>
- Zhang, G., & Zeller, N. (2016). A longitudinal investigation of the relationship between teacher preparation and teacher retention. *Teacher Education Quarterly*, 43(2), 73-92.